T.R.
YILDIZ TECHNICAL UNIVERSITY
GRADUATE SCHOOL OF SOCIAL SCIENCES
DEPARTMENT OF HUMANITIES AND SOCIAL SCIENCES
HUMANITIES AND SOCIAL SCIENCES M.A. PROGRAMME

M.A. THESIS

CONSUMING COFFEE: AN INVESTIGATION ON THE CONSERVATIVE MIDDLE CLASS CAFES IN İSTANBUL

ŞULE ÇANAK
15735006

THESIS ADVISOR
Assoc. Prof. Dr. SETENAY NİL DOĞAN

İSTANBUL
2019

T.R.
YILDIZ TECHNICAL UNIVERSITY
GRADUATE SCHOOL OF SOCIAL SCIENCES
DEPARTMENT OF HUMANITIES AND SOCIAL SCIENCES
HUMANITIES AND SOCIAL SCIENCES M.A. PROGRAMME

M.A. THESIS

CONSUMING COFFEE: AN INVESTIGATION ON THE CONSERVATIVE MIDDLE CLASS CAFES IN İSTANBUL

ŞULE ÇANAK
15735006

THESIS ADVISOR
Assoc. Prof. Dr. SETENAY NİL DOĞAN

İSTANBUL
2019

T.C.
YILDIZ TECHNICAL UNIVERSITY
GRADUATE SCHOOL OF SOCIAL SCIENCES
DEPARTMENT OF HUMANITIES AND SOCIAL SCIENCES
HUMANITIES AND SOCIAL SCIENCES M.A. PROGRAMME

M.A. THESIS

CONSUMING COFFEE: AN INVESTIGATION ON THE CONSERVATIVE MIDDLE CLASS CAFES IN İSTANBUL

ŞULE ÇANAK
15735006

Date of Submission: 30.07.2019
Date of Oral Examination: 03.07.2019
Thesis is approved unanimously

	Title Name Surname	Signature
Thesis Advisor	: Assoc. Prof. Dr. Setenay Nil DOĞAN	
List of Referees	: Prof. Dr. Ayşegül BAYKAN	
	Assoc. Prof. Dr. Defne KARAOSMANOĞLU	

İSTANBUL
2019

ABSTRACT

CONSUMING COFFEE: AN INVESTIGATION ON THE CONSERVATIVE MIDDLE CLASS CAFES IN İSTANBUL
Şule Çanak
2019

Turkey underwent profound changes in the economic, political and social spheres after the 1980s. The adoption of the neo-liberal political and economic policies facilitated Turkey's integration into the global consumer culture and transformed social life in various ways. Economic liberalization and the subsequent developments have led to the spread of consumer culture among individuals in Turkey and enabled them gradually to become a part of the global consumer culture. Along with these developments, Islamism in Turkey also underwent transformations in the post-1980s. Radical Islam started to lose its influence and especially after the 1990s, Islamic groups started to individualize and become a part of the consumer market in Turkey. Accordingly, they started to build their own lifestyles in various aspects from clothing to eating habits, from vacation to residence preferences. As a result, they became more visible in the public arena and began to express themselves in line with their worldview and lifestyle. As part of the capitalist system, both as producers and as consumers, the members of this rising new middle class have adapted and transformed existing spaces while creating new living spaces for themselves. In this regard, cafes have become one of the places where the new conservative middle class has gained visibility in the urban centers especially after the 2000s. The present thesis explored four cafes –Çikolata & Kahve, Nevmekân, Mihrimah Kahve and Huqqa-located in İstanbul in terms of conservative consumption. Based on the participatory observation technique and semi-structured interviews with the cafe owners/managers, this thesis tried to find out the prominent features of the cafes that have a conservative concept as well as explore the ways in which the conservative middle class consumes the space in İstanbul and where this type of consumption stands in the global economy of taste.

Key Words: consumption, cafe, conservatism, conservative middle class

ÖZ

İSTANBUL'DAKİ MUHAFAZAKÂR ORTA SINIF KAFELER ÜZERİNE BİR ARAŞTIRMA

Şule Çanak

2019

Türkiye 1980'lerden sonra ekonomik, politik ve sosyal alanlarda köklü değişiklikler geçirmiştir. Neo-liberal siyasi ve ekonomik politikaların benimsenmesi Türkiye'nin küresel tüketim kültürüne entegrasyonunu kolaylaştırmış ve sosyal yaşamı çeşitli şekillerde dönüştürmüştür. Ekonomik liberalleşme ve sonrasında yaşanan gelişmeler, tüketim kültürünün Türkiye'deki bireyler arasında yayılmasına yol açmış ve onların giderek küresel tüketim kültürünün bir parçası olmalarını sağlamıştır. Bu gelişmelerle birlikte, Türkiye'de İslamcılık da 1980 sonrasında dönüşümler geçirmiştir. Bu tarihten itibaren radikal İslam etkisini kaybetmeye başlamıştır, özellikle 1990'lardan sonra Türkiye'de İslami gruplar bireyselleşmeye başlamış ve tüketim kültürünün bir parçası haline gelmişlerdir. Bu doğrultuda, İslami çevreler kıyafetten yeme içmeye, tatilden yaşam alanına varan tercihlerinde kendi yaşam tarzlarını inşa etmeye başlamışlardır. Bunun sonucu olarak da, kamusal alanda daha çok görünmeye ve kendilerini hayat tarzları ve dünya görüşleriyle uyumlu bir şekilde ifade etmeye başlamışlardır. Kapitalist sistemin hem üreticisi hem de tüketicisi olarak yükselen bu yeni orta sınıf, var olan kamusal alanlara adapte olmuş ve onları dönüştürmüş, bir yandan da kendileri için yeni alanlar yaratmışlardır. Bu bağlamda kafeler, yeni muhafazakâr orta sınıfın özellikle 2000'lerden sonra kentsel alanlarda görünürlük kazandığı yerlerden biri olmuştur. Bu tez İstanbul'da yer alan dört kafeyi - Çikolata & Kahve, Nevmekân, Mihrimah Kahve ve Huqqa- muhafazakâr tüketim açısından incelemiştir. Araştırma yöntemi olarak nitel araştırma yöntemi kullanılmış, katılımcı gözlem tekniğinden faydalanılarak kafelerde gözlemler yapılmış, yarı yapılandırılmış mülakat tekniğiyle kafe sahipleri ve işletme müdürleriyle görüşmeler yapılmıştır. Elde edilen dataya göre, muhafazakâr konseptli kafelerin öne çıkan özellikleri, muhafazakâr orta sınıfın kafelerde tüketime ne şekilde dahil oldukları ve bu şekilde bir tüketimin küresel ekonomide nerede yer aldığını tartışmak amaçlanmıştır.

Anahtar Kelimeler: tüketim, kafe, muhafazakârlık, muhafazakâr orta sınıf.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my sincere gratitude to my advisor Assoc. Prof. Dr. Setenay Nil Doğan for encouraging and supporting me through the whole process of this thesis. She helped me decide on my thesis topic and motivated me whenever I felt discouraged. The completion of my dissertation would not have been possible without her valuable comments and suggestions.

Besides my advisor, I wish to thank my thesis committee, Prof. Dr. Ayşegül Baykan and Assoc. Prof. Dr. Defne Karaosmanoğlu, for their encouragement and insightful comments.

I am grateful to all the interviewees who genuinely answered my questions and made the interview process enjoyable and much easier with their positive attitudes. I was able to build this thesis with their valuable contribution.

I would like to thank Asiye, who shared all my troubles and good times during my academic journey at Yıldız Technical University in the whole process from the application up until the graduation. I also would like to thank Öznur for her friendship and continued assistance in the entire process, to Gülüzar and Hanife for their valuable comments on my drafts and for the moral support they gave me.

Last but not least, my deepest thanks go to my family who supported me throughout my life. I owe special thanks to my sister Sibel, who always stood by me and encouraged me in my hard times; I am indebted to her for her constant support.

İstanbul; July, 2019 Şule ÇANAK

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT iii
ÖZ iv
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS v
TABLE OF CONTENTS vi
ABBREVIATIONS viii
1. INTRODUCTION 1
1.1. The Present Study 4
1.2. Theoretical Framework 5
1.3. Methodological Framework 7
1.4. Limitations of the Study 8
1.5. Significance of the Thesis 9
1.6. Organization of the Thesis 9
2. CONSUMING COFFEE 11
2.1. Coffee 11
2.1.1. Brief History of Coffee in the East 11
2.1.2. Oppositions to Coffee And Coffeehouses 14
2.2. Ottoman Coffeehouses 18
2.2.1. Sociability in Ottoman Coffeehouses 25
2.2.2. Ottoman Coffeehouses as Heterotopias 27
2.3. Coffee and Coffee Shops in the Contemporary Times 29
2.3.1. Waves of Coffee 29
2.3.2. A Glance at Global Coffee Chains 31
3. CONSERVATISM AND CONSUMPTION 35
3.1. History of Conservatism 36
3.1.1. Neo-conservatism 38
3.1.2. Conservatism in Turkey 39
3.2. Islamic Movements in Turkey after the 1980s 44
3.2.1. Islamism versus Islamic Movements 44
3.2.2. The Rise of Political Islam and Islamic Capital 45
3.2.3. Public Visibility of Islamic Subjects 48

3.2.4. Islamist Intellectuals and Debates over Conservative Consumption 51
3.2.5. Consumption and Identity Formation 52
3.3. New Islamic Bourgeoisie of the 2000s 53
4. INVESTIGATION OF FOUR CAFES IN İSTANBUL IN TERMS OF CONSERVATIVE CONSUMPTION 56
4.1. Research Design 56
4.2. Çikolata & Kahve: "a Little Old-fashioned" 59
4.2.1. Physical Properties and Atmosphere of Çikolata & Kahve 59
4.2.2. Customer Profile 61
4.2.3. Distinct Features of Çikolata & Kahve 62
4.2.4. Social Media Use and the Recognition of Çikolata & Kahve 66
4.3. Nevmekân: "a Wisdom Project" 67
4.3.1. Physical Properties and Atmosphere of Nevmekân 67
4.3.2. Customer Profile 68
4.3.3. Distinct Features of Nevmekân 69
4.3.4. Social Media Use and the Recognition of Nevmekân 70
4.4. Mihrimah Kahve: "Our Values" 71
4.4.1. Physical Properties and Atmosphere of Mihrimah Kahve 71
4.4.2. Customer Profile 73
4.4.3. Distinct Features of Mihrimah Kahve 73
4.4.4. Social Media Use and the Recognition of Mihrimah Kahve 75
4.5. Huqqa: "the Reina of the Conservatives" 76
4.5.1. Physical Properties and Atmosphere of Huqqa 76
4.5.2. Customer Profile 77
4.5.3. Distinct Features of Huqqa 77
4.5.4. Social Media Use and the Recognition of Huqqa 78
4.6. Conservative Cafes in Quest for Authenticity 80
4.7. Values versus Financial Concerns 82
4.8. Conservative Cafes as a Means of Claiming Space in Modern Public Life 83
4.9. Conservative Cafes in comparison to Ottoman Coffeehouses 85
5. CONCLUSION 87
BIBLIOGRAPHY 90
APPENDIX 101
CURRICULUM VITAE 105

ABBREVIATIONS

ASKON : Association of Anatolian Businessmen

JDP : Justice and Development Party

MUSIAD : Independent Industrialists and Businessmen Association

1. INTRODUCTION

Turkey has experienced transformations in the economic, political, social and cultural spheres after the 1980s. The neo-liberal political and economic policies in Turkey after this date have incited its participation into the global market economy. The Motherland Party, coming to power in 1983, after the military coup d'état of 1980, adopted neo-liberal economy policies. The promotion of economic liberalization and private enterprise has unavoidably changed the dynamics of Turkish society. Economic developments have led to the spread of consumer culture among individuals in Turkey and enabled them gradually to become a part of the global culture.

As a result of the neo-liberal economy policies and the promotion of private enterprise, different segments of the society began to get involved in free market economy. Islamic circles along with seculars began to take place in the market economy and integrate into the consumer society day by day. As a result of the growth of Islamic capital, a new urban way of living for the conservative bourgeoisie evolved in Turkey following the years after 1980.[1] The rise of Islamic conservative parties such as the Motherland Party (1983), the Welfare Party (1996), the Justice and Development Party (henceforth JDP) (2003) to power has significant effect on this. The growth of Islamic businesses created an alternative market for religious people. The accumulation of wealth among certain religious groups created a new Islamic bourgeoisie who have conservative values but avant-garde consumption tastes.[2] The establishment of Islamic media organizations, Islamic non-governmental organizations, Islamic women's platforms, Islamic hotels that offer non-alcoholic beverages and separate beach facilities for men and women and Islamic fashion shows have shaped the new Islamic middle class.[3] They started to build their own lifestyles in various aspects from clothing to eating habits, from vacation to residence

[1] Sema Genel, Kerem Karaosmanoğlu, "A New Islamic Individualism in Turkey: Headscarved Women in the City", **Turkish Studies**, vol. 7, no. 3 (September 2006): 476.
[2] Özlem Sandıkçı, Güliz Ger, "In-Between Modernities and Postmodernities: Investigating Turkish Consumptionscape", **Advances in Consumer Research**, vol. 29 (2002): 467.
[3] Nilüfer Göle, **Melez Desenler: İslam ve Modernlik Üzerine**, 5th ed. (İstanbul: Metis Yayınları: 2017), 153.

preferences. As a result, they became more visible in the public arena and began to express themselves in line with their worldviews. So, Islamic subjects, as part of the capitalist system both as producers and as consumers have adapted and transformed existing spaces while creating new living spaces for themselves especially after the 1990s.

The desire to create alternative forms of leisure brought about the emergence of new public places that comply with the requirements of Islam. Caprice Hotel, which opened in 1996 in the Aegean coast of Turkey, is one of the first examples of alternative leisure provided to those who have religious sensitivities. This hotel, with its separate beaches and swimming pools for men and women and its religious facilities, provided religiously sensitive people an opportunity to have holiday that is in line with Islamic rules. As stated by Kılıçbay and Binark, "leisure is islamicized" by conforming to the market system, which transforms the Muslim way of living.[4] From a broader perspective, having a holiday at Caprice Hotel points out that Islamic identity and modern lifestyle can comply with each other.[5]

Consumption practices of Islamic subjects are manifested in various domains other than vacation. The growth in veiling industry particularly after the 1990s has changed the consumption practices of Islamic women moving away from a single type of veiling to more heterogeneous and modern styles. Islamic women started to adopt new styles and get more involved in the consumption practices through clothing as expressed by Sandıkçı and Ger:

> "As the market for *tesettür* clothes expanded, the industry developed from small ateliers to national and international companies offering outfits and headscarves made out of a range of fabrics, in a variety of cuts, shapes, and colors, and sold at a spectrum of prices. The initial uniformity of the dressing style gradually gave way to more heterogeneous styles, signaling a rising fashion consciousness especially among the middle/upper-class, urban, well-educated, younger religious women."[6]

The juxtaposition of veiling and fashion can be dated to 1992, when for the first time a veiling fashion show was realized by a well-known veiling dress firm, *Tekbir*. This paved the way for the entrance of veiling into the fashion world. The

---

[4] Barış Kılıçbay, Mutlu Binark, "Consumer Culture, Islam and the Politics of Lifestyle: Fashion for Veiling in Contemporary Turkey", **European Journal of Communication,** vol. 17, no. 4 (December 2002): 499.

[5] Mücahit Bilici, "İslam'ın Bronzlaşan Yüzü: Caprice Hotel Örnek Olayı", **İslamın Yeni Kamusal Yüzleri**, ed. Nilüfer Göle (İstanbul: Metis Yayınları, 2013): 227.

[6] Özlem Sandıkçı, Güliz Ger, "Constructing and Representing the Islamic Consumer in Turkey", **Fashion Theory The Journal of Dress Body & Culture**, vol. 11, no. 2-3 (June 2007): 195.

expansion of veiling-producing firms and the rise of conservative political parties led to the expansion of the market appealing to the needs of conservative women.

Caprice hotel and *Tekbir* fashion show examples are the most evident indicators of Islam becoming visible in the public sphere in the 1990s. Göle states that the visibility of Islam in the public realm necessitated the quest for legitimacy and also pushed the boundaries of existing institutions and rules. Islamic subjects became visible in urban spaces such as concert halls, cultural centers and holiday centers as well as the parliament, universities and the media.[7] The existence of Islamic subjects in these areas necessitated reconciliation with modernity to some extent. As Kömeçoğlu points out, "new forms of expression emerge between modernity and tradition, which generates complex motifs"[8] among Islamic actors.

Kömeçoğlu labels Islamic-style venues such as Islamic holiday resorts, restaurants, beauty centers, wedding saloons and cafes as "counter-spaces" that emphasize the protection of religious morality and act with this concern.[9] In this regard, coffee shops have become places where Islamic actors come in view among other urban spaces especially after the 2000s.

As part of the leisure culture, cafes hold an irreplaceable position in daily life practices of modern individuals around the world. They have become places where people spend time, have fun, eat, drink, and perform various social and cultural activities in modern times. Cafes that can be seen as indispensable places to socialize for the individuals, who are integrated into the consumer culture, have become public arenas for people from different social classes to fulfill different needs in daily life.

The cafes that have a conservative concept have found place for themselves in the growing cafe culture of İstanbul especially after the 2000s and started to create their own dynamics among others.

[7] Göle, 2017, **ibid,** 14.
[8] Uğur Kömeçoğlu, "Örtünme Pratiği ve Toplumsal Cinsiyete İlişkin Mekânsal Bir Etnografi", **Doğu Batı**, vol. 23 (2003): 37.
[9] Kömeçoğlu, 2003, **ibid**, 38.

1.1. The Present Study

Whilst some research[10] has been carried out on the conservative consumption practices in Turkey, only a few studies have focused on conservative cafes. Kömeçoğlu[11] investigates three cafes (two in Sultanahmet and one in Üsküdar) within the frame of gender and veiling practice specifically focusing on young Islamic actors in his study. Doğan,[12] in her thesis, studies particular public places in Çengelköy, including some cafes in terms of conservative women's production of the third places. Another study on conservative cafes conducted by Sevinç[13] gives us insight into the symbolic space consumption and sociality that take place in Fatih Horse Bazaar, an area home to a plenty of cafes in Fatih district of İstanbul. An article by Mendillioğlu[14] also focuses on the cafes in Fatih Horse Bazaar in terms of conservative women's socialization practices.

The present thesis aims to investigate four cafes in İstanbul in terms of conservative consumption and tries to explore how and for what purposes the conservative middle class consumes the space, and where this type of consumption stands in the global economy of taste. In this direction, four cafes - Çikolata & Kahve, Nevmekân, Mihrimah Kahve and Huqqa- were investigated.

The current thesis seeks to address the following research questions:

1. What are the prominent features of conservative cafes?
    a. What factors are influential in attracting conservative customers to these cafes?

[10] Sandıkçı, Ger, 2002, **ibid**, 465-470; Kılıçbay, Binark, **ibid**, 495-511; Bilici, **ibid**, 216-236; Abdullah Özbolat, "Tüketim Bağlamında Dindarlığın Dönüşümü", **Birikim Dergisi** (2014) http://www.birikimdergisi.com/guncel-yazilar/1127/tuketim-baglaminda-dindarligin-donusumu#.XN_zQmQzafQ [18.05.2019]; İlknur Meşe, "Tüketim, Din ve Kadın Bağlamında İslami Moda Dergileri", **Eskişehir Osmangazi Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi**, vol.17, no.1 (June, 2016): 95-110; İlknur Meşe, "İslami Bir Moda Dergisi Örneğinde Moda ve Tesettür: Ne Türden Bir Birliktelik?", **Fe Dergi**, vol.7, no.1 (2015): 146-158; Önder Kantarcı, "İslami Kadın Modernliğinin Tüketim Toplumunda Temsili: Ala Dergisi Üzerine Bir İnceleme" (Master Thesis, Marmara University, Institute of Social Sciences, 2015).

[11] Kömeçoğlu, 2003, **ibid,** 37-74.

[12] Tuba Doğan, "Production of Third Places for the Conservative Women: A Case Study of Çengelköy" (Master Thesis, İstanbul Şehir University, 2018).

[13] Bayram Sevinç, "Simgesel Mekan Tüketimi ve Yeni Kamusal Alanlarda Toplumsallık: Fatih At Pazarı Örneği", **International Journal of Social Science Studies**, vol.6, no.4 (April 2013): 1003-1028.

[14] Ali Mendillioğlu,Muhafazakâr Kadının Sosyalleşme Mekânı: At Pazarı (December 26, 2011), http://www.adilmedya.com/muhafazakâr-kadinin-sosyallesme-mekaniat-pazari [18.05.2019].

b. What kind of publicity do cafes with a conservative concept offer to their customers?

2. Where do conservative cafes stand on the market when compared to Western-style cafes?

It is assumed that Islamic conservatism has undergone some transformations in the last decades in relation to macro social and political vicissitudes of Turkey. Without doubt, consumption practices of conservatives in Turkey have not been impervious to these transformations. Hence, the current study investigating the consumption practices of the conservatives building on the aforementioned cafes as research sites is expected to bear valuable insights to better understand the interplay between the conservative worldview and its manifestations in everyday life and will add to the broader research body in the literature by sampling four local cases.

The terms "conservative" and "Islamic" will be elaborated on in Chapter 3, however, throughout the study these terms will be used interchangeably.

1.2. Theoretical Framework

Public visibility and consumption practices of conservative people in Turkey have undergone transformations as a result of various factors including the rise of conservative political parties such as the Motherland Party, the Welfare Party and the Justice and Development Party. As a result of the neoliberal economy policies that was incited by Turgut Özal, who was the founder of the Motherland Party and the prime minister of Turkey between the years 1983 and 1989, Islamic capital has gained a place in the market and Islamic subjects in Turkey took place in the market both as producers and consumers. The integration of the Islamic circles into the global market has resulted in transformations in Muslim way of living in various aspects.

The notion of "habitus" put forward by Pierre Bourdieu has been regarded a useful concept in explaining the changing lifestyles and dispositions of conservative subjects in Turkey through their consumption practices and performances. Bourdieu expresses habitus as:

> "The conditioning associated with a particular class of conditions of existence produce habitus, systems of durable, transposable dispositions, structured structures predisposed to function as structuring structures, that is, as principles which generate and organize practices and

> representations that can be objectively adapted to their outcomes without presupposing a conscious aiming at ends or an express mastery of the operations necessary in order to attain them."[15]

To put a more explanatory interpretation of the concept, it is "the unconscious dispositions, the classificatory schemes, taken-for-granted preferences which are evident in the individual's sense of the appropriateness and validity of his taste for cultural goods and practices – art, food, holidays, hobbies etc".[16]

To Bourdieu, the habitus is "a product of history"; past experiences constitute certain "schemes of perception, thought and action", which operate in the production of not only individual but also collective practices happening at present.[17]

Navarro claims that habitus develops in the socialization process and generates frames of mind that shape individuals' behavior in that community.[18] However, it is not an immutable form; it may show changes and come into being in a different form on the condition that it does not fit in the social environment in which it grows. Navarro elaborates on this as follows:

> "Habitus is especially developed through processes of socialisation and determines a wide range of dispositions that shape individuals in a given society. It is not a 'structure' but a durable set of dispositions that are formed, stored, recorded and exert influence to mould forms of human behaviour. It may vary in accordance to the social environment, because unstable social domains may produce unstable systems of dispositions that generate irregular patterns of action. It does reinforce cohesion but also stimulates change and innovation, especially when it does not fit the surrounding social world where it evolves."[19]

When we look at the concept of "habitus" within the framework of this present study, it will be useful to investigate the dispositions of the conservatives and how these dispositions change and take on new forms. In this respect, examining the habitus of the conservative people via consumption is critical in this study.

In addition to Pierre Bourdieu's concept of "habitus", Henri Lefebvre's perspective on social space is regarded crucial for a better analysis of the cafes in the scope of this thesis. Lefebvre elaborates on "verbal and non-verbal signs" in interpreting a space and seeks answers to the questions of whether spaces have meanings or whether a space that is occupied by a social group can be considered as

---

[15] Pierre Bourdieu, **The Logic of Practice**, trans. Richard Nice (Stanford, Calif: Stanford University Press, 1990), 53.
[16] Mike Featherstone, **Consumer Culture and Postmodernism** (London: Sage Publication, 1991), 88.
[17] Bourdieu, **ibid**, 54.
[18] Zander Navarro, "In Search of a Cultural Interpretation of Power: The Contribution of Pierre Bourdieu", **IDS Bulletin,** vol. 37, no. 6 (2006): 16.
[19] **ibid**

a message.[20] He states that spaces carry messages: "Every language is located in a space. Every discourse says something about a space (places or sets of places); and every discourse is emitted from a space".[21]

Spaces and its actors have the power to transform each other as denoted by Lefebvre. The existence of a space pre-determines the presence, actions, discourses and performances of a subject as well as the subjects have the power to transform the space.[22] Therefore, it could be said that space and its actors have the power to transform each other mutually.

While making sense of the relationship between human, space and consumption in the post-capitalist era, Lefebvre's approach to space and consumption has important implications for us. Lefebvre contrasts "the space of consumption" with the "consumption of the space",[23] which can be interpreted as the spaces going beyond just being the means for consumption and become the means of consumption.

This study aims to gain insight into the consumption practices of the conservative in Turkey in the cafes in the last decades; and the abovementioned notions of Bourdieu and Lefebvre are considered integral in making sense of conservative consumption in Turkey, which has become more apparent especially in the last decades.

1.3. Methodological Framework

This thesis has aimed to understand conservative consumption practices in Turkey in the last decades with a special focus on four cafes located in İstanbul. As research method, qualitative method was found useful since a quantitative method would remain incapable to provide sufficient data to be able to understand the complex nature of human relations and performances. That's why; qualitative method was used in the study. Semi-structured interviews and participatory observation techniques provided the data for the study as well as the discussions on the Internet, newspaper reports, columns and social media.

---

[20] Henri Lefebvre, **The Production of Space**, trans. Donald Nicholson-Smith (Oxford, OX, UK: Blackwell, 1991): 131
[21] **ibid,** 132.
[22] **ibid,** 57.
[23] **ibid,** 352-353.

I conducted interviews with two cafe owners, a cafe manager and a human resources assistant. I recorded the interviews after getting the consent of the interviewees and transcribed all the interviews on Microsoft Word afterwards. Since the interviews were conducted in Turkish that is the native language of the interviewees, I translated them into English and did my analysis accordingly. Apart from the interviews, I observed the cafes throughout 10 months, visiting each cafe around 20 times to collect data for my study. In order to provide supporting data to my thesis, I investigated the news and discussions on the Internet about the relevant cafes and included them in my discussions at times.

1.4. Limitations of the Study

The present thesis is a case study on four cafes in İstanbul in order to gain an understanding of conservative consumption. The findings of the study are expected to provide insights into the conservative consumption practices and performances falling within these particular public spheres and it does not aspire to make broad generalizations about conservative consumption. Participatory observation and semi-structured interviews with the cafe owners/managers were used as data collection tools as well as the news and discussions on the Internet. The findings of the study were based upon the statements of the interviewees and personal observations basically. Interviews with the customers who visit these cafes would have supported the existing data and help build this research from different perspectives. However, because of time limitation and the difficulty of persuading a sufficient number of people to have interviews in their leisure time, this study was built on personal observations and interviews with two cafe owners, a cafe manager and a human resources assistant who constitute valuable sources in finding answers to the targeted research questions.

Not being able to have interview with the cafe manager of Huqqa constitutes another limitation of this study. Being able to get in touch with only one of the co-owners of Çikolata & Kahve and Mihrimah Kahve created a limitation, as well. I managed to conduct individual interviews instead of a focus group interview due to the tight work schedule of the interviewees.

1.5. Significance of the Thesis

Though there have been some studies on the consumption practices of the conservatives in Turkey, cafes as urban manifestations of conservative consumption are understudied. The studies of Kömeçoğlu (2003), Doğan (2018), Sevinç (2013) and Mendillioğlu (2011) provide valuable data in understanding the sociality and gender issues in cafes that appeal to the conservatives in İstanbul, Turkey. Kömeçoğlu[24] focuses on the veiling practice and gender in his study and foregrounds Islamic identity and civil publicity as the central themes in his analysis. The study of Doğan[25] investigates certain cafes in Çengelköy in terms of the production of the *third places* for conservative women. The studies of Sevinç[26] and Mendillioğlu[27] specifically focus on the cafes in Fatih Horse Bazaar in terms of sociality and from gender perspectives. However, the present study is about the cafes located in Üsküdar and Beşiktaş and provides data about the cafes in these areas. This thesis aims to contribute to the literature on consumption patterns of conservative people with the sampling of four cafes that they frequently visit in Üsküdar and Beşiktaş.

This thesis builds upon the existing body of academic work by touching upon the sociality in a public sphere participated by conservatives who formerly stayed out of this site and aims to contribute to the field by introducing common traits of such cafes as well as their distinctive features. Changes in the consumption practices of conservative people especially after the 2010s, hence the changing habitus of the conservative in the last decades will be put under the scope of this thesis.

1.6. Organization of the Thesis

This thesis is composed of five chapters. The first chapter starts with an introduction to the thesis and introduces the research questions as well as the theoretical framework, the methodology, limitations and significance of the thesis.

Chapter 2 deals with coffee and coffeehouses; the history of coffee and the emergence of coffeehouses are discussed in the first place. In order to better understand modern day cafes, it is necessary to have knowledge about the

[24] Kömeçoğlu, 2003, **ibid**.
[25] Doğan, **ibid**.
[26] Sevinç, **ibid**.
[27] Mendillioğlu, **ibid**.

coffeehouses -as the prototype of cafes-. For this reason, Ottoman coffeehouses and their roles in everyday lives of common people are examined. The chapter concludes with coffee shops in the contemporary times in relation to the cafes to be studied in this current thesis.

Chapter 3 is concerned with two main issues: conservatism and conservative consumption. The first part of the chapter gives a brief history of the concept of "conservatism" and discusses neo-conservatism and conservatism in Turkey. The second part of the chapter gives an overview of the recent history of Islamic consumption in Turkey. This part sheds light on the rise of Islamic movements in the last decades and examines how conservative consumption practices evolved in this process.

Chapter 4 analyzes the findings of the interviews categorizing them under four characteristics. Not only the statements of the interviewees but also personal notes and observations of the researcher as well as the data collected from the Internet are used in this part in order to make a comprehensive analysis.

Finally, the conclusion chapter gives a brief summary and critique of the findings regarding the conservative consumption in cafes of İstanbul in the last decades.

2. CONSUMING COFFEE

The present chapter aims to give a brief overview of the history of coffee and coffeehouses. It starts with a short history of coffee in the East, and then oppositions to coffee and coffeehouses will be discussed. Following this, Ottoman coffeehouses as the prototype of modern coffee shops and their social aspects will be examined. Finally, coffee in the contemporary times will be reviewed with a discussion of waves of coffee and global coffee chains.

2.1. Coffee

"Coffee is the common man's gold; and like gold, it brings to every person the feeling of luxury and nobility."[28]

Coffee is defined as a "beverage brewed from the roasted and ground seeds of the tropical evergreen coffee plant of African origin".[29] However, coffee, which had an effect on the social, political and economic dynamics of the societies from the moment it emerged, is more than just a beverage. The emergence of coffee as a beverage at the center of social interactions and the conflicts brought with coffee will be discussed in the following sections.

2.1.1. Brief History of Coffee in the East

The homeland of the wild coffee plant is known as Ethiopia. The indigenous people of Ethiopia were using ripe coffee fruits in the 14th century. The main purpose in consuming coffee fruit was because it was nutritious and a good stimulant for the people of that region.[30] Although coffee plant was first discovered in East Africa, the way people made use of this plant was different when brought to the Near East. The

[28] Sheik Ansari Djezeri Hanball Abd-al-Kadir, **In Praise of Coffee**, 1587.
[29] "Coffee", https://www.com/topic/coffee [10.01.2019]
[30] Ulla Heise, **Kahve ve Kahvehane**, trans. Mustafa Tüzel (Ankara: Dost Kitabevi, 2001), 13.

use of coffee in the sense that we use it today –namely by roasting the coffee beans and brewing coffee- happened in Yemen.[31]

There exist various stories about the first consumption of coffee in Arab lands. The most well accepted story is that of the Sufi Order, a religious order in Yemen. According to this account, coffee consumption took place in the meetings of the Sufi Order at nights to keep its members alive at long religious rituals called *dhikr,* around 1450s. The Sufi Order was not a self-enclosed sect so it did not take long for the people of Yemen to hear about this exotic drink.[32] Ralph S. Hattox, in his book *Coffee and Coffeehouses,* also states that members of the Sufi Order did not exclude themselves from society and that their involvement in daily activities had a great impact on the spread of coffee among the public. By the 1510s, coffee had already reached many parts in Arabian Peninsula including Mecca, Hejaz and Cairo. The influence of religion on the spread of coffee in those regions was undeniable. The travel of Sufi members from one place to another and pilgrimage visits were factors that promoted the spread of coffee. The fact that coffee consumption was generally taking place close to mosques and theological complexes (i.e. Azhar Theological Complex*)* shows the initial religious connections of this drink. However, over time, coffee drinking became widespread among people from different groups and it became a social drink more than being a drink with a religious connotation.[33]

Heise states that in the 1600s, coffee was consumed by a large segment of the society: by poor and rich, by men and women in the East, from North Africa to South India.[34] However, he also notes that women were consuming coffee in the private sphere, namely at home, while men consumed coffee in the public sphere.[35]

Coffee consumption was not confined to the Near East. The travellers in the 17th century played role in the transmission of coffee beans to Europe, with different reasons such as commercial, botanical or scientific purposes.[36] It is known that it was Venetian merchants who first took coffee to Europe in 1615 and it was drunk first in

[31] **ibid,** 14.
[32] **ibid,** 18.
[33] Ralph S. Hattox, **Coffee and Coffeehouses: The Origins of a Social Beverage in the Medieval Near East**, 3rd ed. (Seattle: University of Washington Press, 1996), 26-28.
[34] Heise, **ibid,** 31.
[35] **ibid.**
[36] **ibid.**

Venice and Marseille in the first half of the 17th century.[37] Ottoman ambassadors and merchants had also contributions to the introduction and spread of coffee in European cities such as Vienna and Paris in the 17th century.[38] Ottoman ambassadors visiting Vienna in 1665 and Paris in 1669 aroused curiosity about drinking coffee during their visits to these cities.[39] Coffee entered in the European luxury culture along with other exotic substances such as chocolate, tea and tobacco and appealed to the tastes of the high society.[40] On the other side, since it was a good stimulant and non-intoxicating, it became quite popular among middle classes in the late 17th century.[41] Not only the upper classes but also people from middle and lower classes became coffee addicts. Although upper classes' passion for coffee was more related to the "coffee fashion",[42] the consumption of coffee in middle and lower classes in the 17th century Europe was related to the fact that it was a stimulant drink. In this regard, coffee as a sober beverage was well suited with the ideals of the Protestant ethic that emphasizes hard work and discipline.[43]

In the 17th century, first coffeehouses in Europe opened in cities such as Vienne, Venice, Oxford, London and Paris.[44] It can be said that coffee had been accepted as a social drink in the 18th century in Europe.[45]

The spread, impact and dynamics of coffee consumption in European cities differ from each other; hence it is difficult to make generalizations about them. Since this is a very broad discussion, it will not be discussed here in detail. I will just refer to European coffee consumption and European coffeehouses at some points in order to make comparisons with the Ottoman coffeehouses and the coffeehouses in Turkey today.

---

[37] Deniz Gürsoy, **Sohbetin Bahanesi Kahve** (İstanbul: Oğlak Yayıncılık ve Reklamcılık Ltd. Şti., 2005), 40.
[38] **ibid**; Taha Toros, **Kahvenin Öyküsü** (İstanbul: İletişim Yayıncılık, 1998), 43.
[39] Heise, **ibid,** 32.
[40] Wolfgang Schivelbusch, **Tastes Of Paradise: A Social History Of Spices, Stimulants, and Intoxicants** (New York: Pantheon Books, 1992), 19.
[41] **ibid.**
[42] Heise, **ibid,** 62.
[43] Schivelbusch, **ibid,** 18.
[44] **ibid**; Gürsoy, **ibid,** 40.
[45] Heise, **ibid,** 103.

2.1.2. Oppositions to Coffee And Coffeehouses

Coffee had confronted some oppositions when it appeared in Arab lands for the first time in the 16th century. As it is said, the members of the Sufi Order in Yemen were instrumental in the recognition of coffee among the public living there. Common people also enjoyed this exotic drink. Although Sufi members in Yemen did not have ideological concerns in consuming coffee, the religious scholars, physicians and those who preserved the order in Mecca were alarmed against the spreading coffee consumption among the public. Widespread consumption of coffee in Mecca aroused hot debates among scholars as to whether it was permissible to drink coffee in Islam or not.[46] Hattox suggests that fast spread of coffee in a very short time could be one of the factors triggering such uneasiness, and also the changing motives in drinking coffee, from a religious context into secular one, with an emphasis on pleasure rather than on devotional purposes, namely *dhikr*, could be another reason for the first oppositions to coffee.[47]

As a result of the uneasiness caused by coffee consumption in public, jurists, physicians, the ulema[48] and the executives in Mecca decided to prohibit coffee in 1511. However, after long debates in Cairo, it was decided that gathering of men for drinking coffee could be disturbing but there were not any inconveniences in drinking coffee in terms of Islamic laws. Therefore, this prohibition did not last long and people went on drinking coffee in open areas again.[49]

Prohibition of coffee in Mecca in 1511 aroused great public attention. This prohibition should be considered in order to understand the mentality of the prohibitions that was encountered later in Hejaz and Istanbul. Gathering around the act of drinking coffee, namely, a form of socialization that occurred outside the control of the central authority, created uneasiness and confronted oppositions.[50] These oppositions came from the ulema and the authorities. However, Hattox states that religious community was not of a single mind about the prohibition of coffee in Mecca. Although the ulema did not have a consensus on the prohibition of coffee, civil authority was alarmed against this form of socialization occurring outside its

[46] **ibid,** 20.
[47] Hattox, **ibid,** 30.
[48] Ulema is used to refer to the scholars of law and theology in İslam.
[49] **ibid,** 33-36; Heise, **ibid.**
[50] Ekrem Işın, "Bir İçecekten Daha Fazla: Kahve ve Kahvehanelerin Toplumsal Tarihi", **Tanede Saklı Keyif, Kahve**, ed. Selahattin Özpalabıyıklar (İstanbul: Yapı Kredi Yayınları, 2001): 15.

control. As a result, the fear of authority and the thought of pleasing the ruler led the ulema to develop an attitude against coffee.[51]

How could the coffee-drinking act, which was spreading among the public, be stopped? Putting the reasons for not drinking coffee in a religious frame was the best way to restrain people from coffee drinking, by extension gathering around the act of coffee drinking. By explaining the religious disadvantages of coffee consumption, this new form of socialization that emerged around the act of coffee drinking could be prevented and this would no longer pose a threat to authority.

The reasons put forward by the ulema claimed that drinking coffee was not in accordance with Islamic laws. One of these reasons was based on a claim that coffee was intoxicating, thus harmful for the body. The other reason was about a step in the preparation of coffee that is roasting the beans to the point of carbonization, which was not acceptable in Islam.[52] These explanations –although not accepted by all the members of the ulema and rejected by them in the end[53] – stemmed from the concern that coffee-drinking places would disrupt the social order as mentioned above.

Similar oppositions came from the ulema in İstanbul, after coffee was introduced there. Initial oppositions to the consumption of coffee in İstanbul stemmed from two main reasons regarding Islam. The first reason –as in the Mecca case- considered the cooking process of coffee, which was not found appropriate for Islam. To put it more explicitly, carbonization of the coffee beans during the roasting process was the reason for the oppositions because according to the Hanafi School of Islam, anything carbonized could not be among the eating and drinking habit of a Muslim, that's why it would be considered illicit. The second reason for not to drink coffee was because of the interaction between coffee drinkers while consuming it. The passing of the coffee cup from hand-to-hand resembled the consumption of pleasure-giving substances and was regarded as a sign of a dissolute life style, therefore not a desirable way of interaction in Islam.[54]

---

[51] **ibid,** 41-44.
[52] Hattox, **ibid,** 6.
[53] **ibid,** 114.
[54] Ayşe Saraçgil, "Kahvenin İstanbul'a Girişi 16. ve 17. Yüzyıllar", **Doğu'da Kahve ve Kahvehaneler,** ed. Hélène Desmet Grégoire, François Georgeon, trans. Meltem Atik, Esra Özdoğan (İstanbul: Yapı Kredi Yayınları, 1999): 28.

The first coffee consumption in İstanbul is reported to be in 1517 in *Kahve ve Kahvehane,* by Ulla Heise.[55] However, the accounts of Katip Çelebi give the year 1543 as the arrival of coffee to İstanbul.[56]Although there is not a clear date on the entrance of coffee to İstanbul, it is known to have arrived there in the first half of the 16th century. Işın states that at first it was known and consumed at court and in the mansions of the ulema. Also the dervish lodges were familiar with this drink during the first half of the 16th century.[57] The spread of coffee consumption in İstanbul was similar to the Arab cities, religious orders such as the *Halvetiyye Order*, of which the Ottoman Sultan Süleyman was a member, the *Kalenderis* and the *Bektashi Order* were influential in the recognition and spread of coffee consumption in İstanbul. In the first years of its arrival in Istanbul, there was no reaction to the consumption of coffee because it was adopted by a religious group and approved by the Sultan.[58] It is known that Sultan Süleyman enjoyed coffee a lot and even appointed a *kahvecibaşı* (chief coffeemaker) at the court.[59] Although at the very beginning religious institutions were effective in the introduction of coffee to the public, it was mostly known and consumed at the court or by the elite circles in the years following the arrival of the coffee. Later on, coffeehouses promoted the spread of this new habit at the neighbourhood level.[60]

Two Syrians, Hakem from Aleppo and Şems from Damascus, opened the first coffeehouse in İstanbul in Tahtakale neighbourhood in 1554 according to historian Peçevi's accounts.[61]

The fact that Tahtakale was a busy commercial site of İstanbul in the 16th century was thought to play a crucial role in opening the first coffeehouse there. Tahtakale was a neighbourhood where people from different occupational and social groups coexisted. As the number of the coffeehouses increased and coffeehouses became a site visited by people from all walks of life including the people from lower-class background, this aroused kind of curiosity among the ruling class as to

---

[55] Heise, **ibid,** 21.
[56] Evliya Çelebi, **Narrative of Travels in Europe, Asia, and Africa in the Seventeenth Century,** trans. Ritter Joseph von Hammer (New York: Johnson Reprint Corp, 1896), 119.
[57] Işın, 2001, **ibid,** 24.
[58] Saraçgil, **ibid,** 29-30.
[59] İsmail Hakkı Uzunçarşılı, **Osmanlı Devletinin Saray Teşkilatı,** 2nd ed. (Ankara: Türk Tarih Kurumu Yayınları, 1984), 327.
[60] Işın, 2001, **ibid,** 24.
[61] İbrahim Peçevi, **Peçevi Tarihi,** comp. Bekir Sıtkı Baykal, vol.2 (Ankara: Kültür Bakanlığı,Yayınları 1981), 258.

the function of coffeehouses as places with a potential to threaten the state-control. Rather than the coffee as a drink, coffeehouses as social gathering sites were the focal point of concern on the part of the Ottoman authorities.[62]As noted earlier, Islamic justifications for not drinking coffee were put forward to close down these institutions. The most obvious indication of the fear and negative attitude against coffeehouses was the *fatwa*[63] which Shaykh al-Islam Ebussuud Efendi gave on the coffee ban. The exact date for the release of this fatwa is not known, however, according to Işın, it is probable that the fatwa on the ban on coffee took place during the reign of Sultan Selim II (1566-1574), Sultan Süleyman's successor. Considering the opening of the first coffeehouse in 1554 and the death of Sultan Süleyman in 1566, as well as the positive attitude of the Sultan Süleyman towards coffee, Işın bases the date of this fatwa to the period of Sultan Selim II.[64]

During the reigns of Selim II and Murad III, which covers the periods 1566-1574 and 1574-1595 respectively, various attempts had been made to close down the coffeehouses. As well as the orders of the sultan, a variety of fatwas were given. However, coffeehouses in İstanbul had somehow managed to survive and these prohibitions were terminated.[65]

The most severe objections to the coffeehouses were at the time of the Ottoman Sultan Murat IV (1623-1640), who is known for his strict and prohibitive attitude towards coffee, tobacco and alcohol. He ordered to close down all the coffeehouses not only in İstanbul but also in the provinces of the Ottoman Empire. The cause of the ban is said to be the great fire of Istanbul in the early 1630s, and the coffeehouses in Istanbul were demolished as a precaution against a rebellion that might arise after the fire.[66] When we look at the reasons for the closure of the coffeehouses in the period of Murat IV, it is seen that the fear of coffeehouses becoming a center of rebellion shows itself so clearly that it outweighs religious reasons. In the period of Sultan Mahmud IV, coffeehouses reopened.

---

[62] Işın, 2001, **ibid**, 24-27.
[63] Fatwa, in Islam, a formal ruling or interpretation on a point of Islamic law given by a qualified legal scholar (known as a mufti). Fatwas are usually issued in response to questions from individuals or Islamic courts. Though considered authoritative, fatwas are generally not treated as binding judgements; a requester who finds a fatwa unconvincing is permitted to seek another opinion. "Fatwa", https://www.britannica.com/topic/fatwa [12.02.2019].
[64] Işın, 2001, **ibid**, 29.
[65] Saraçgil, **ibid,** 35-36.
[66] Talat Mümtaz Yaman, "Türkiye'de Kahve ve Kahvehaneler", **Karacadağ**, no. 53 (1942): 695, https://core.ac.uk/download/pdf/80960467.pdf [24.02.2019].

Ottoman coffeehouses were closed down mostly with the fears that these places were a potential rebellion plot. Similar fears were observed in the coffeehouses of Europe. Heise puts forward that coffeehouses in European cities were closed down and banned by the states from time to time until the 18th century. One of the reasons why the states put a ban on coffeehouses was that coffeehouses were regarded as a meeting point for the people who threaten public order; in short these places were a kind of a "rebellion plot".[67] However, in spite of the bans and restrictions, coffee had become a social drink not only in the Ottoman world but also in Europe at the start of the 18th century.

Çağlayan states that at the start of the 18th century, coffee and coffeehouses became an inseparable part of the Ottoman social life, and the negative attitude of the ulema and the fears of the ruling class against coffee and coffeehouses disappeared.[68]

According to Işın, oppressive attitudes towards coffee and coffeehouses were ineffective in creating the pressure that the authorities desired because of the public dissent as well as the economic value of such habit-forming consumer goods.[69]

2.2. Ottoman Coffeehouses

Coffeehouses became the center of attention since they first emerged, and they occupied an important place in the Ottoman social life. Coffeehouses in İstanbul from the 16th to the 20th century will be discussed here with emphasis on different types of coffeehouses and their social functions.

According to D'Ohsson, there were 50 coffeehouses in İstanbul at the end of the reign of Sultan Süleyman[70], and this number reached 600 at the end of the reign of Sultan Murad III (1574-1595).[71] Heise states that coffeehouses became an inseparable part of everyday life around 1600. Although there were initially some concerns about coffeehouses because of the thought that these places were like illegal wine houses and not suitable for the public, these concerns proved false and coffeehouses gained acceptance as an irreplaceable public place in the Ottoman

[67] Heise, **ibid,** 137.
[68] Savaş Çağlayan, "Anadolu'nun İlk Kamusal Mekanı: Kahvehane", **Muğla Sıtkı Koçman Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi**, no.29 (2012): 104.
[69] Işın, 2001, **ibid,** 32.
[70] First coffeehouses in İstanbul opened in the period of Sultan Süleyman (1520-1566).
[71] Mouradgea D'Ohsson, **Tableau Général de l'Empire Ottoman**, vol.4 (Paris, 1824), 79.

Empire.[72] These places became prevalent in daily lives of the Ottomans in the 17th and 18th century and reached a number close to 2,500 in the first half of the 19th century.[73]

However, Kırlı states that coffeehouses were male dominated institutions in the Ottoman Empire, not only the customers but also the owners and the servants were male. Children as well as women were excluded from the Ottoman coffeehouses.[74] While coffeehouses were socialization and coffee consumption places for men, public baths served a similar function for women.[75] Women, who could not be a part of the coffeehouse publicity, were drinking coffee at home or in the public baths and socializing there.[76] It was only in the 20th century that women consumed coffee in public, namely in the cafes of the 20th century.[77]

In European coffeehouses until the 19th century, although women were not active participants of the coffeehouses, they could work in the coffeehouses as servers. Women's involvement in the European coffeehouses showed dramatic changes, as they became coffeehouse owners and then customers in the 19th century.[78]

As it is stated above, Ottoman coffeehouses have created a space of publicity for male citizens only. As coffeehouses became widespread, different types of coffeehouses that were preferred by various occupational groups emerged. Some of these coffeehouses were neighbourhood coffeehouses, artisan coffeehouses, janissary coffeehouses, fire brigade coffeehouses, minstrel coffeehouses, musical coffeehouses, storytellers' coffeehouses, hashish coffeehouses and intellectuals' coffeehouses.

---

[72] Heise, **ibid,** 21.
[73] Alan Mikhail, "The Heart's Desire: Gender, Urban Space and the Ottoman Coffeehouse", **Ottoman Tulips, Ottoman Coffee: Leisure and Lifestyle in the Eighteenth Century,** ed. Dana Sajdi (London: I.B. Tauris, 2007): 139.
[74] Cengiz Kırlı,"Coffeehouses: Leisure and Sociability in Ottoman Istanbul", **Leisure Cultures in Urban Europe, 1700-1870**, ed. Peter Nigel Borsay, Jan Hein Furnee (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2016): 165; Cengiz Kırlı, "İstanbul Bir Büyük Kahvehane", **İstanbul Dergisi,** no.47 (2003): 76.
[75] Hattox, **ibid**, 124.
[76] François Georgeon, "Osmanlı İmparatorluğu'nun Son Döneminde İstanbul Kahvehaneleri", **Doğu'da Kahve ve Kahvehaneler,** ed. Hélène Desmet Grégoire, François Georgeon, trans. Meltem Atik, Esra Özdoğan (İstanbul: Yapı Kredi Yayınları, 1999): 49; Heise, **ibid,** 36-37.
[77] Kırlı, 2016, **ibid,** 165.
[78] **ibid.**

Neighbourhood coffeehouses were the most common sites for socialization for men not only in İstanbul but also in the cities of Anatolia and the Balkans. They were situated near the mosque; male inhabitants of the neighbourhood who went to the mosque for prayer were also the clients of the neighbourhood coffeehouses.[79] As a meeting point and communication center for the residents of the neighbourhood, these coffeehouses became an indispensable part of the Ottoman daily life.[80] They met the need for socialization outside of the mosque,[81] and undertook various functions in the lives of the Ottomans and transformed the urban life starting from the 16th century.[82]

Işın explains what kind of impact neighbourhood coffeehouses made on the lives of the residents of İstanbul as follows:

> "Ottomans continued to spend their lives inside the triangle of home-mosque-bazaar up to the mid-16th century. With the opening of the local coffeehouses at the end of this century, a process begins in which everyday life is shaped by these venues. Coffeehouse regulars are individuals highly regarded by the local populace. A form of relations other than the traditional neighborly ties, based on the principle of supervision and closely bound up with the social aspect of everyday life, emerges for the first time in the local coffeehouses. With the transformation of the coffeehouse into a virtual neighborhood parliament, the importance of the imam's residence as an administrative center wanes."[83]

Although coffeehouses were situated near the mosque at the beginning, they moved away from the mosque in time and formed their own identity. This situation also increased the diversity of people who came round to these coffeehouses. Neighbourhood coffeehouses also served as a ground where neighbourhood problems were solved and decisions about the neighbourhood were made. Beyond just being a place to kill time, neighbourhood coffeehouses were the site of conversation and discussion regarding local problems or political issues.[84]

As it can be understood from this point, what the coffeehouses brought to the Ottoman society was that it provided an opportunity for the people to establish social relations and to exchange ideas in an atmosphere that was not available to them before.

---

[79] Işın, 2001, **ibid,** 34-35.
[80] Georgeon, **ibid**, 60.
[81] Işın, 2001, **ibid,** 27.
[82] Burçak Evren, **Eski İstanbul'da Kahvehaneler** (AD Yayıncılık A.Ş.: 1996), 47.
[83] Ekrem Işın, **Everyday Life in İstanbul,** trans. Virginia Taylor Saçlıoğlu, 4th ed. (İstanbul: Yapı Kredi Publications, 2018), 277.
[84] Evren, **ibid,** 49.

Hattox calls coffeehouses "taverns without wine".[85] Because coffee, as a soft drink, had seemed to be ideally suited for a society that is Muslim[86] and Muslims did not see any inconveniences in frequenting these places, chatting with the people in their neighbourhood or drinking coffee.

In addition to neighbourhood coffeehouses, artisan coffeehouses were also quite common. They emerged from the late 16th century and were mostly located in Eminönü, Beyazıt or Aksaray neighbourhoods of İstanbul close to Grand Bazaar where most of the buying and selling took place. These coffeehouses mostly functioned as a meeting place for people from different occupational groups such as porters, construction workers, hawkers or watermen.[87] As a natural consequence of this, they became a center of interaction and communication for people from different social segments coming together mostly with the purpose of conducting business.[88] It can be said that these coffeehouses strengthened solidarity between business lines and served as job employment agencies in a way.[89]

One of the most remarkable Ottoman coffeehouses was the Janissary coffeehouse, established around the mid 17th century. A janissary is defined as a "member of an elite corps in the standing army of the Ottoman Empire from the late 14th century to 1826. Highly respected for their military prowess in the 15th and 16th centuries, the Janissaries became a powerful political force within the Ottoman state."[90]

As being the soldiers of the Ottoman Army, janissaries had substantial salary until the mid 17th century. The answer to the question of why janissaries run coffeehouses is that since the mid-17th century, economic crises had created additional work requirements for the janissaries, and also coffeehouses were a place where janissaries frequently came together, that's why it was not surprising to see them running most of the coffeehouses in İstanbul.[91]

---

[85] Hattox, **ibid**, 72.
[86] Kırlı, 2016, **ibid**, 161.
[87] Cem Sökmen, **Aydınların İletişim Ortamı Olarak Eski İstanbul Kahvehaneleri,** 3rd ed. (İstanbul: Ötüken Neşriyat A.Ş., 2016), 34.
[88] Sökmen, **ibid,** 35.
[89] Evren, **ibid,** 50-51.
[90] "Janissary", https://www.britannica.com/topic/Janissary-corps [25.02.2019].
[91] Kırlı, 2003, **ibid,** 76.

On the one hand, janissary coffeehouses had a military character, since the Janissaries played active role in the establishment of them; on the other hand, they had a religious nature due to their identification with the Bektashi order.[92] However, the most significant feature of Janissary coffeehouses was their ties with politics through the discussions regarding state politics. Janissary coffeehouses became a center where *devlet sohbeti* (state talk) was going on. "State talk" can be defined as political discussions broadly taking place in coffeehouses.[93] Coffeehouse regulars talked about issues of daily politics or problems regarding regime, which made janissary coffeehouses a venue of molding public opinion.[94] Uncontrollable and unpredictable nature of these talks brought with them various concerns on the part of the state. Authorities were disturbed by the *rumour*, particularly political rumour because of its potential to arouse political grouch, so such kind of talks became the main reason for holding the coffeehouses in check.[95]

Even though janissary coffeehouses were not the only places where political talks were going on, they were politically unstable and suited for rebellions since janissaries hold "the means of coercion" and could step into action easily.[96] Thus, janissary coffeehouses served as headquarters of the janissary riots that frequently took place. Janissary coffeehouse owners also played a role in the rebellions that dethroned Sultan Selim III and Sultan Ahmet III, after Patrona Halil Rebellion (1730) and Kabakçı Mustafa Rebellion (1807).[97]

Coffeehouses in Europe had also some political aspects like the coffeehouses İstanbul. The most obvious example of these coffeehouses could be found in Paris, London and Amsterdam in the 18th century.[98] The new emerging bourgeoisie were talking about political issues in these coffeehouses out loud, which disturbed the ruling class and the intelligentsia a lot.[99] Especially the coffeehouses in Paris, like the ones in İstanbul, took an important place in the rebellions against the authorities until the 19th century. Before the French revolution, it was seen that all the political groups

[92] These coffeehouses operated as Bektashi lodges for a while. Evren, **ibid,** 55.
[93] Ali Çaksu, "Janissary Coffeehouses in Late Eighteenth-Century İstanbul", **Ottoman Tulips, Ottoman Coffee: Leisure and Lifestyle in the Eighteenth Century,** ed. Dana Sajdi (London: I.B. Tauris, 2007): 122.
[94] Sökmen, **ibid,** 36.
[95] Kırlı, 2016, **ibid,** 167.
[96] Çaksu, **ibid,** 123.
[97] Kırlı, 2003, **ibid,** 76.
[98] Heise, **ibid,** 162.
[99] **ibid,** 163.

were represented in the cafes of Paris. There were cafes where almost every political view was represented.[100] However, the political activities in the coffeehouses were restricted due to the increase of bureaucracy and state control, and after the 1800s, political activities were carried out in the unions under the state control.[101]

Coming back to the janissary coffeehouses in the Ottoman Empire, we see the intervention of the state in these coffeehouses because of the rising political voices there. Since janissary coffeehouses had the potential to easily mobilize public towards an uprising and thus posed a threat to the state, as well as being the center of rumour about politics, Sultan Mahmud II, removed these coffeehouses in 1826. Later on, fire brigade coffeehouses emerged as an extension of the janissary coffeehouses.

Minstrel coffeehouses were the places visited by folk poets and musicians both from the countryside and the urban areas of İstanbul since the 16th century. Those poets and musicians shaped the cultural world of minstrel coffeehouses by being fuelled by not only rural but also urban culture. Minstrel coffeehouses created a forum that reflected the voice of the newcomers of the city as well as the feelings and thoughts of ordinary people in daily events.[102]

Musical coffeehouses emerged during the Tanzimat period (1839-1876) and operated in a similar fashion to minstrel coffeehouses. Unlike the minstrel coffeehouses where folk minstrels played just the saz, musical coffeehouses offered a variety of instruments including drum, harmonica or clarinet as well as saz.[103] Musical coffeehouses were quite active during the month of Ramadan[104] and they offered programmed entertainment in a European style starting after the tarawih prayer until the suhoor -pre-dawn meal of the Muslims during the fasting month-.[105] The Tanzimat is the period covering the years 1839-1876, when innovations were made in the fields of military service, education, management, economy and law. This period can be considered as the first phase of the transition to democracy and Westernization. The first traces of Western style sense of entertainment could be seen in musical coffeehouses. In this respect, musical coffeehouses can be seen as a platform reflecting the changes that society had undergone. At this point, Işın states,

[100] **ibid,** 166.
[101] **ibid,** 168.
[102] Işın, 2001, **ibid,** 37.
[103] Sökmen, **ibid,** 42.
[104] Ramadan is the fasting month of Muslim believers.
[105] Işın, 2001, **ibid,** 38.

"Tanzimat period coffeehouses were the most striking places reflecting the complexity of traditional culture and social values".[106]

Storytellers' coffeehouses, as the name suggests, were the ones where storytellers, called *meddah,* used to tell stories or fairy tales to entertain the male audience at nights. Storytellers' coffeehouses occupy an important position in the cultural history of the Ottoman Empire since they were the scene of cultural production and performance. Heise states that coffeehouses functioned as production and exhibition areas of folk literature until the mid 20th century starting from the mid-17th century in Arab and Turkish lands. Public storytellers in Turkish coffeehouses were entertaining the listeners by imitating human and animal sounds or by mocking current issues. Besides, people who wished to watch not only humorous but also "informative" performances that included some gossip about courtiers frequented these coffeehouses.[107] Apart from them, there was a traditional shadow puppetry, *Karagöz-Hacivat*, which aimed to entertain the listeners while giving them didactic messages.[108] Kömeçoğlu remarks that *Karagöz-Hacivat* and m*eddah* shows include political and social satire, which mock and mimic even high-ranking officials.[109] In this respect, we can witness how political taboos were reversed through shadow puppetry and the stories told by *meddahs,* who were also male, in storytellers' coffeehouses.

Hashish coffeehouses, customers of which consisted of hashish addicts as the name suggests, were mostly located in Tahtakale, Tophane, Silivrikapı and Mevlevihane neighbourhoods of İstanbul. Those coffeehouses had a disgusting and dirty look but had a certain order and functioning.[110] Since it seemed uncanny, everyone would not dare to enter these coffeehouses. In case of need, it allowed its customers to spend the night there.[111]

Intellectuals' coffeehouses emerged in the 19th century as a result of the transformations that took place in the Ottoman Empire towards modernization.

---

[106] **ibid,** 39
[107] M. Murtaza Özeren, "Coffeehouses in Ottoman Society", https://www.dailysabah.com/history/2018/07/20/coffeehouses-in-ottoman-society [25.02.2019]
[108] Heise, **ibid,** 28-29.
[109] Uğur Kömeçoğlu, "Homo Ludens ve Homo Sapiens Arasında Kamusallık ve Toplumsallık: Osmanlı Kahvehaneleri", **Osmanlı Kahvehaneleri: Mekan, Sosyalleşme, İktidar,** ed. Ahmet Yaşar (İstanbul: Kitap Yayınevi, 2009): 59.
[110] Evren, **ibid,** 93.
[111] Abdulkadir Emeksiz, "İstanbul Kahvehaneleri," **Karaların ve Denizlerin Sultanı İstanbul**, ed. Filiz Özdem (İstanbul: Yapı Kredi Yayınları, 2009):134.

Actually, such kind of coffeehouses had already existed in Europe. Starting from the 17th century, coffeehouses, especially the coffeehouses of England and France had functioned as the centers of communication with newspaper publishing.[112] The scholars, philosophers, and writers who came together in these coffeehouses were influential in the publishment of newspapers and in the formation of scientific, literary and political public opinion.[113]

In England, Will's coffeehouse, The Turk's Head and Cafe Royal had been among the most prominent coffeehouses for intellectuals at different times between 17th and the 20th century. France was most famous for Café Procope, Café de La Régence and Café de Flore. Cafe Greco had been the center of art not only in Italy but also in Europe until the first half of the 19th century. The number of the literary cafes in Austria was quite high especially after the 1900s; among the most well known of them were Cafe Central, Cafe Museum and Cafe Imperial.[114]

Intellectuals' coffeehouses in the Ottoman period offered books, magazines and newspapers for the customers. Besides, they offered cultural and entertainment activities such as exhibitions, presentations of traditional arts or performing arts, and also contemporary art talks et cetera.[115] Although these coffeehouses provided the ground for intellectuals and general public to meet and discuss ideas, hence creating public opinion, they underwent some transformations in time. The focus of these coffeehouses shifted from reading books and magazines to playing board games.[116]

Looking at the coffeehouses in İstanbul between the 16th and 20th centuries, we see a variety of coffeehouses that can appeal to people from different social strata, hence function in line with the interests and needs of their customers.

2.2.1. Sociability in Ottoman Coffeehouses

Regarding the social functions of the coffeehouses of Ottoman İstanbul, we see that *conversation* shows up at the forefront as one of the most distinctive features of these places. Especially for men, it was an ideal ground to socialize and for entertainment. They could have conversations with their friends, play games such as

[112] Heise, **ibid,** 143.
[113] **ibid,** 145.
[114] i**bid,** 172-179.
[115] Evren, **ibid,**196-198.
[116] Kemalettin Kuzucu, "Kahvehaneden Kıraathaneye Geçiş ve İlk Kıraathaneler", **Türk Kahvesi Kitabı,** ed. Emine Gürsoy Naskalı (İstanbul: Kitabevi Yayınları, 2011): 205.

chess, backgammon and feel at home more importantly.[117] Although there were some other institutions to socialize such as mosque, bazaar, bath or taverns, none of them were as inclusive as the coffeehouses in terms of the variety of the customers or the activities.[118]

Kırlı states that non-Muslims as well as Muslims frequented coffeehouses; spy reports written in the 1840s present us this information. According to these reports, people from different religions could come together in the coffeehouses. Also, it was seen in the reports[119] that coffeehouse customers were usually "tradesmen, merchants, people who came to Istanbul from the provinces temporarily, low-middle class government officials such as tipstaff and clerk, and soldiers".[120]

However, in terms of gender, we cannot say that they were that inclusive. Kırlı states that coffeehouses were "men's places"; not only women but also children could not become coffeehouse customers.[121] The reason why coffeehouses gained a lot of popularity among Ottoman men is partly because of the physical structure of Ottoman houses. Classical Ottoman houses were divided as *selamlık* (men's zone) and *harem* (women's zone). Although some families had the facilities to design their houses in this way, many families could not afford such big houses with *harem* and *selamlık,* which made it difficult for them to host guests at home.[122] The coffeehouses then served as *selamlık* for many poor residents to socialize with their friends and opened a space at home for women to host their female guests.[123]

Neighbourhood coffehouses, except being like a second home to Ottoman men, had also a mission to be a meeting place and communication center for the residents of the neighborhood. News was spreading easily and all kinds of rumour revolved there.[124]

Similar to neighborhood coffeehouses, artisan coffeehouses have also become meeting and communication centers. We must note that communication and

[117] Georgeon, i**bid,** 48-49.
[118] Kömeçoğlu, 2009, **ibid,** 51.
[119] Cengiz Kırlı, "Kahvehaneler ve Hafiyeler: 19. Yüzyıl ortalarında Osmanlı'da Sosyal Kontrol", **Toplum ve Bilim** (1999-2000): 58-77.
[120] Kırlı, 2003, **ibid,** 77-78.
[121] **ibid,** 76.
[122] Mikhail, **ibid,** 146.
[123] Georgeon, **ibid,** 48; Mikhail, **ibid,** 146.
[124] Georgeon, **ibid,** 49.

gathering in artisan coffeehouses increased unity and solidarity among the artisans, and that these coffeehouses functioned like an employment agency in a way.

Socialization in the coffeehouses had not only economic but also political dimension. When we look at the example of janissary coffeehouses, we can see how a place where ordinary people could talk about state affairs was created and how this kind of socialization posed a challenge to the state power. Challenging the authority did not just happen through state talk going on in the janissary coffeehouses. Storytellers' coffeehouses have also been the scene of state criticism through storytelling and *Karagöz-Hacivat* shows. Here we see that entertainment and politics were intertwined in these coffeehouses. Coffeehouse entertainment, especially in the musical coffeehouses, can also be related to the modernization and Westernization of Ottoman society (regarding that how European style entertainment programs influenced coffeehouse entertainment in the Ottoman Empire during the Tanzimat period).

Another function undertaken by coffeehouses in the process of modernization is that they were used as reading room, as in the case of intellectuals' coffeehouses, where reading books or magazines became popular.

Paradoxically, there were also hashish coffeehouses, as well as intellectuals' coffeehouses during the Ottoman Period. Hashish coffeehouses can be regarded as places where an undesirable section of society could get a foothold.

When we look at the sociability in Ottoman coffeehouses, we can lay emphasis on the following features. First of all, coffeehouses offered a new space for socialization outside home, *conversation* standing out as the main activity. Secondly, they occupied a significant place in Ottoman urban life in terms of communication and news spreading. It is also worth noting that they created an arena where political talk took place. Besides, they had great contributions to the entertainment in Ottoman daily life.

2.2.2. Ottoman Coffeehouses as Heterotopias

As mentioned earlier in this chapter, Ottoman coffeehouses embodied a number of functions for the urban life. Those coffeehouses were important places where men had the opportunity to meet their friends, to socialize with them and have conversations on a range of topics from family to neighbourhood goings-on.

However, according to Alan Mikhail, the consideration of coffeehouses only as a public space is an insufficient evaluation. Mikhail, in his article *The Heart's Desire: Gender, Urban Space and the Ottoman Coffeehouse*, studies urban neighbourhood coffeehouses mostly in İstanbul, Cairo and Aleppo, by focusing on their diverse functions in the social life of city dwellers. Mikhail is cautious about approaching these coffeehouses as merely belonging to the public sphere because of the complex structure of Ottoman cities regarding the public and private spheres.[125] That's why he finds Habermas's proposition of public and private sphere useless in understanding the multi-layered structure of Ottoman cities and refrains from approaching Ottoman coffeehouses from this perspective.[126] Habermas depicts the bourgeois public sphere in the West, in the 18th century as follows:[127]

> "The bourgeois public sphere may be conceived above all as the sphere of private people come together as a public; they soon claimed the public sphere regulated from above against the public authorities themselves, to engage them in a debate over the general rules governing relations in the basically privatized but publicly relevant sphere of commodity exchange and social labor."

In this regard, Habermas distinguishes public sphere from private sphere, arguing that private sphere consists of the civil society -"the realm of commodity exchange and of social labor"- and family, while public sphere can be formed with private individuals getting together as a public and discussing about their needs and requests from the state, creating public opinion.[128] In this context, Habermas treats coffeehouses as institutions of the public sphere together with the *salons* and the table societies.[129]

According to Mikhail, such a distinction between public and private sphere does not fit for Ottoman coffeehouses, instead, he finds Michel Foucault's notion of "heterotopia" more useful in analysing these places. According to Foucault, a heterotopia is a space "capable of juxtaposing in a single real place several spaces, several sites that are in themselves incompatible".[130] Mikhail argues that Ottoman coffeehouse had connections to the neighbourhood, market and home, but had a

---

[125] Mikhail, **ibid,** 134-136
[126] **ibid.**
[127] Jürgen Habermas, **The Structural Transformation of the Public Sphere: An Inquiry into a Category of Bourgeois Society**, trans. Thomas Burger with the assistance of Frederic Lawrence (Massachusetts: The MIT Press, 1989), 27.
[128] **ibid,** 30-31.
[129] **ibid.**
[130] Michel Foucault, "Of Other Spaces: Utopias and Heterotopias", **Architecture/Mouvement/Continuité,** trans. Jay Miskowiec (October 1984): 6, http://web.mit.edu/allanmc/www/foucault1.pdf [03.03.2019].

unique role in itself standing at the corner of these divergent places and serving multifunctional purposes.[131]

Space in Ottoman neighbourhoods was not divided strictly as public and private. Residents of a city could use space freely as long as they did not disturb the others, for example there were dead-end streets used by a few neighbours as a supplementary space in addition to their private houses. So, it could be said that domestic life and public life were intertwined with each other somehow.[132] Coffeehouses served a similar function for some residents. As mentioned earlier in this chapter, Ottoman houses had two different zones: men's zone and women's zone. However, not all families could afford to design their houses this way, which obstructed men to host their friends at home. Coffeehouses were used for the purpose of meeting and hosting male friends for the Ottoman men.[133] Here again we see the intertwinement of the public and private spheres.

In conclusion, Mikhail puts emphasis on the changing nature of Ottoman coffeehouses between public and private spheres, by approaching coffeehouses as heterotopias, where multiple functions intermingled.

2.3. Coffee and Coffee Shops in the Contemporary Times

2.3.1. Waves of Coffee

In the 20th and 21st century, coffee market and coffee consumption has faced transformations regarding capitalism, globalization and changes in the consumption trends. The intricate relationship between capitalism, globalization and consumption has affected the way people consume and appreciate coffee, resulting in the emergence of coffee waves.

The first wave of coffee can be traced to the 1950s when coffee started to become commodified with the rise of brands such as Folgers, Maxwell House, Jacobs, Douwe Egberts and other well-known brands.[134] In this wave, large

[131] Mikhail, **ibid,** 137.
[132] **ibid,** 145-146.
[133] **ibid.**
[134] Edward F. Fischer, "Quality and Inequality: Taste, Value, and Power in the Third Wave Coffee Market", **MPIfG Discussion Paper**, No. 17/4 (2017): 8.

companies controlled the coffee market to a great extent and coffee was produced en masse.[135]

The second wave of coffee corresponds to the period of coffeehouse chains such as Starbucks, Gloria Jean's, The Coffee Bean and Tea Leaf et cetera that came to be seen in urban centers such as storefronts and malls in the early 1990s (in the USA).[136] Especially, the rise of Starbucks can be interpreted as the peak of the second wave of coffee.[137] The growth of such coffeehouse chains meant a new move towards specialized coffee production and consumption rather than mass production and consumption of the past decades. To put a finer point on it, this meant diversity of coffee choices and new modes of coffee consumption; namely coffee has become "the beverage of postmodernism" in this wave.[138]

Coffee in the second wave, offered pleasure in a variety of forms; not only the aroma of the coffee but also the atmosphere of the place where the coffee is consumed, the way it is delivered, social interactions taking place in the cafes have marked the second wave.[139]

The third wave of coffee has arisen at the beginning of the 21st century. The third wave of coffee is characterized by independent and small-chain coffeehouses.[140] The third wave has been currently approaching coffee as an artisanal product and aims to improve all the steps in the making of coffee starting from growing till the brewing.[141] Therefore, in the third wave, coffee started to be seen as a privileged taste; all stages of the coffee were considered important and it was meticulously prepared and delivered to the consumer.

---

[135] Inma Borrella, Carlos Mataix, Ruth Carrasco-Gallego, "Smallholder Farmers in the Speciality Coffee Industry: Opportunities, Constraints and the Businesses that are Making it Possible", **IDS Bulletin**, vol. 46, no. 3 (2015): 31.
[136] John Manzo, "Machines, People, and Social Interaction in "Third Wave" Coffeehouses", **Journal of Arts and Humanities**, vol.3, no.8, (2014): 3.
[137] Fischer, ibid, 8.
[138] William Roseberry, "The Rise of Yuppie Coffees and the Reimagination of Class in the United States", **American Anthropologist, New Serie**s, Vol. 98, No. 4. (Dec., 1996): 763.
[139] **ibid**, 762-763.
[140] Manzo, **ibid**, 3.
[141] Borrella, Mataix, Carrasco-Gallego, **ibid**, 32.

2.3.2. A Glance at Global Coffee Chains

The second wave of coffee is marked by the expansion of worldwide coffee chains such as Starbucks, Gloria Jeans Coffee, Lavazza Coffee, Dunkin' Donuts, Caffè Nero et cetera especially after the 1990s.

Starbucks has been a global phenomenon not only with its high-quality coffees and successful advertising but also with its unique way of interaction with the customers. The first Starbucks Coffee opened in Seattle, in the USA, in 1971. In 1983, Howard Schultz (Starbucks chairman and chief executive officer) brought Italian coffeehouse tradition to the United States. Then, Starbucks aspired to be a place for conversation and a "third place"[142] between work and home. Today it has become a worldwide popular coffee shop with over 21.000 shops in 65 countries around the world.[143]

The arrival of Starbucks to Turkey dates back to 2003, when the first Starbucks of Turkey opened in İstanbul. Turkish people experienced an "American style" coffee drinking culture and way of life with the coming of Starbucks as a result of the effect of globalization.[144] Three factors are influential in the growth of Starbucks as a global coffee chain: coffee, staff and the atmosphere of the store.[145]

As well as offering high-quality whole bean coffees to the customers, Starbucks aspires to present a rewarding coffeehouse experience, too.[146] To provide such an experience, it is stated that baristas in Starbucks are trained on many subjects such as making eye contact with the "guests", sensing their needs, making concise explanations about different types of coffees et cetera.[147]

---

[142] Ray Oldenburg (1989) defines the spaces between work and home as "third places". Third places are areas in which people interact with each other and know or feel that they are members of the same community. These places can be seen in every city such as bars, taverns, cafes and coffeehouses. James H. Gilmore, Joseph Pine, **Deneyim Ekonomisi**, trans. Levent Cinemre (İstanbul: Optimist): 72.
[143] "Tarihçe" http://www.starbucks.com.tr/about-us/our-heritage/ [06.06.2019].
[144] Yeşim Kaptan, "Üçü Bir Arada: Melez Bir Mekanın Kuruluşu ve Starbucks Üzerine Gözlemler", **Kültür ve İletişim,** vol.16, no.2 (2013): 74.
[145] Özlen Özgen, Zaliha İnci Karabacak, "Tüketim Mekanlarının Dönüşümünde Görsel İletişimin Rolü: Küresel Kahve Dükkanları", **İletişim Kuram ve Araştırma Dergisi**, vol.37 (Fall 2013): 129.
[146] "Company Information", https://www.starbucks.com/about-us/company-information [07.06.2019]
[147] Howard Schultz, Dori Jones Yang, **Starbucks: Gönlünü İşe Vermek**, trans. Ömer Faruk Birpınar (İstanbul: Babıali Kültür Yayıncılığı: 2007), 270.

Everything at Starbucks is a product of a calculated creation.[148] Clark points out that at a time when everyone was advertising in the same way, Starbucks followed a different and new marketing method: the stores became the billboards of Starbucks and everything within the store became the representative of the brand.[149] As well as Starbucks itself being an area of advertisement, word of mouth has also been an important factor in its gaining recognition and rapid popularity.[150] To recapitulate, the underlying factor behind Starbucks' success is that it creates a cultural dimension in consumption, giving coffee a new and high status as well as the design and the language used in its stores.[151] Thompson and Arsel[152] state that one of the most important factors in the success of Starbucks is its ability to apply creatively standardized and applied *third place* ambience globally. Therefore, it wouldn't be wrong to say "no longer would consumers just grab coffee, now they would come for the 'Starbucks Experience' ".[153]

Other global coffee chains such as Gloria Jean's Coffee and Lavazza Coffee hit the marketplace in Turkey after the 2000s. Gloria Jean's Coffees is a global brand specializing in coffee and a brand that is identified with coffee quality and leading franchise systems.[154] Opening its first store in 1979 in Chicago, the USA, Gloria Jean's Coffees has spread to the whole world, with more than 1200 branches in about 50 countries around the world.[155] Gloria Jean's Coffees' Turkey adventure started in 1999 with opening its first branch in Mydonose Showland in İstanbul. Currently it has 28 branches in İstanbul.

Another global coffee chain, Lavazza, has been established in 1895 in Italy and has made its name in Europe starting from the late 1970s and has rapidly grown in the 1980s.[156] In the 1990s, it reached an international success and became the

---

[148] Taylor Clark, **Starbucked: A Double Tall Tale of Caffeine, Commerce and Culture** (New York: Little, Brown and Company: 2007), 88.
[149] **ibid.**
[150] Arturs Kalnins, Laure Stroock, "Pouring Israel into a Starbucks Cup", **Cornell Hospitality Quarterly**, vol. 52, no. 2 (2011): 136.
[151] Michael Broadway, Robert Legg, John Broadway, "Coffeehouses and the Art of Social Engagement: An Analysis of Portland Coffeehouses", **Geographical Review**, vol. 108, no. 3 (2018): 434.
[152] Craig J. Thompson, Zeynep Arsel, "The Starbucks Brandscape and Consumers' (Anticorporate) Experiences of Glocalization", **Journal of Consumer Research**, vol. 31, no. 3 (December 2004): 633.
[153] Clark, **ibid**, 89.
[154] Özgen, Karabacak, **ibid**, 133.
[155] "Hikayemiz", https://www.gloriajeans.com.tr/ [07.06.2019].
[156] "Hakkımızda", http://www.lavazzakahve.com/hakkimizda.htm [07.06.2019].

world's best-known Italian coffee representative.[157] Lavazza coffee chains were launched in 2008 in Turkey with Lavazza Best Coffee Shop and Coffee in Plaza. Today it has 45 branches in Turkey, 43 of them being in İstanbul. In İstanbul, they are mostly situated in universities, plazas and shopping centers.[158] Lavazza Best Coffee Shop's mission is to give priority to customer satisfaction, to keep product quality and security at the forefront with emphasis on team success and become Turkey's number one coffee shop.[159]

After the 2000s, global coffee chains such as Starbucks, Gloria Jean's Coffee, Lavazza and Caffè Nero gave a new impulse to the coffee experience of people in Turkey, especially İstanbulites, since they first open in İstanbul. They not only introduced good-quality coffee, but also provided opportunities for its customers to "experience" the atmosphere of the coffee shop.

The coffee market in Turkey has been affected by the global trends. In 2004, *Kahve Dünyası*, a local coffee shop chain in Turkey, was established in Eminönü, İstanbul.[160] The most important element in the marketing strategy of Kahve Dünyası is the *product*, namely coffee. Coffee is the experience that Kahve Dünyası offers to its customers in its stores.[161] Just as Starbucks uses the store as a site of advertising, Kahve Dünyası believes that the product itself offered in the store will function as a tool of marketing and advertising.[162] Kahve Dünyası has a brand and corporate communication department and works with professional agencies in order to ensure that everything works in the store in integrity, which shows similarity to Starbucks in terms of marketing communications.[163] In the process of globalization, Starbucks applies methods such as licensing, joint venture, strategic merger and direct investment; Kahve Dünyası only aims to apply direct investment method. Direct investment is a method in which the control can be maximized,[164] so they aim to guarantee the quality in this way.[165] Kahve Dünyası offers a different experience

[157] **ibid.**
[158] "Şubelerimiz", http://bestcoffeeshop.com.tr/subelerimiz [07.06.2019].
[159] "Franchising Hakkında", http://bestcoffeeshop.com.tr/franchising-hakkinda [07.06.2019].
[160] Günay Kurtuldu, " "Starbucks" İş Modeli ve Globalleşme Sürecine Kıyasla Bir İş Modeli Olarak "Kahve Dünyası"nın Gelişimi ve Globalleşmesi", **Kırklareli Üniversitesi İktidari ve İdari Bilimler Fakültesi Dergisi**, vol.5, no.2 (2016): 46.
[161] **ibid**, 48.
[162] **ibid.**
[163] **ibid.**
[164] **ibid,** 54.
[165] "Hakkımızda", https://www.kahvedunyasi.com/kesfet/hakkimizda [07.06.2019].

from Starbucks' experience with its features like Turkish coffee and treats brought with coffee, space design and differentiation of service features (table service, treats et cetera).[166] Today, Kahve Dünyası has more than 180 stores including Turkey and foreign countries such as England, Romania, Kuwait and Saudi Arabia. Apparently, Kahve Dünyası aims to be a globally known brand and coffee chain by offering a unique experience to the consumers with reference to Turkish culture.

In the 21st century, coffee shops in İstanbul show a great deal of variety. On the one hand, global chains keep pervading the urban centres of İstanbul, on the other hand, specialty coffee shops, traditional coffee shops or concept cafes emerge day by day. This present thesis aims to explore conservative cafes within this diversity. In this respect, four cafes in İstanbul were explored in terms of conservative consumption within the scope of this thesis.

[166] Ceyda Kurtar Anlı, Nuri Yavan, "Deneyim Yaratmada Mekanın Rolü: Starbucks ve Kahve Dünyası'nın Deneyim Ekonomisi ve Üçüncü Yer Bakımından Analizi", **Gaziantep University Journal of Social Sciences**, vol.18, no.1 (2019): 125.

3. CONSERVATISM AND CONSUMPTION

The present chapter has been divided into two main parts. The first part of the chapter aims to review the literature on conservatism while the second part focuses on conservative consumption in Turkey. In the first part, the concept of conservatism, the history of conservatism as a political ideology and its basic principles will be discussed. Then, neo-conservatism, which emerged in the 1980s, will be examined. The second part of the chapter aims to present a historical sketch of conservatism in Turkey and give insight into the transformations after 1980 and focus on the changing public visibility of Islamic subjects through their consumption practices starting from 1980. The political and economic atmosphere of Turkey after the 1980s facilitated the participation of Islamic subjects, who stayed at the periphery[167] until then, to the economic, political and cultural spheres. In accordance with this, new forms of self-expression and consumption practices emerged. In order to better understand the conservative consumption practices in cafes, a recent and common form of consumption among conservatives, I will overview the transformations that took place in Turkey after the 1980s with a focus on Islamic movements. After sketching out the historical path of conservatism in Turkey, I will make a very brief discussion of the terms "Islamism" and "Islamic movements" and then review the rise of Islam and Islamic capital in Turkey. As a result of the rise of Islamic movements after the 1980s, Islamic subjects became more visible in the public sphere; therefore public visibility of Islamic subjects will be discussed thirdly. The participation of Islamic groups in the market economy and consumption practices evoked some debates both among seculars and among Islamists, this will be discussed in the fourth place and finally the relationships between consumption and identity formation in this process as well as the new Islamic Islamic bourgeoisie of the 2000s will be reviewed.

[167] Nilüfer Göle, "Secularism and Islamism in Turkey: The Making of Elites and Counter-elites", **Middle East Journal,** vol. 51, no.1 (1997): 52 http://www.jstor.org/stable/4329022 [23.04.2019].

3.1. History of Conservatism

Conservatism could be understood as a "style of thought" as suggested by Mannheim[168] or as an "attitude" or a "state of mind" that can be built into any type of doctrine or ideology.[169] Conservatism in this sense can date back to the earliest times of the history of humankind. However, the history of conservatism as a political doctrine and specific ideology is not that old.[170] The formation of conservatism as a political ideology could be traced to the 18th century when great social, political and intellectual changes such as the Industrial Revolution, Age of Enlightenment and the French Revolution made profound changes not only in Europe but also in other parts of the world.[171] These three historical phenomena swept away all the former structural and intellectual institutions such as traditions, values and movements of thought after they stepped into the stage of history.[172]

To briefly state, the Industrial revolution changed the modes of production radically; traditional modes of production were abandoned and replaced by capitalist modes of production. This led to a change not only in the economic sense but also in the social relations, creating the capitalist class and the working class.

Another phenomenon that marked the 18th century was the Enlightenment. During the Enlightenment period, rational thinking came to the fore in all aspects of life. The idea of enlightenment precedes the *human reason* in all spheres of life by throwing over traditional values. Finally, the French Revolution (1789) that can be considered as a natural outcome of the Enlightenment philosophy led to dramatic changes not only in Europe but also in the whole world by abolishing monarchies and the feudal system. Monarchies collapsed and new nation states were formed following the revolts in France and the world political system has been reshaped.

All these revolutionary movements were influential in the formation of conservative thought. However, it can be said that conservatism as a political ideology appeared as a reaction to the radical changes imposed by the French

---

[168] Karl Mannheim, **Essays on Sociology and Social Psychology,** (London: Routledge and Kegan Paul Nietzsche, 1969), 74-78.
[169] Ahmet Çiğdem, "Muhafazakârlık Üzerine", **Toplum ve Bilim**, no.74 (1997): 32.
[170] Bekir Berat Özipek, "Muhafazakârlık, Devrim ve Türkiye", **Modern Türkiye'de Siyasi Düşünce: Muhafazakârlık,** (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2003): 66.
[171] **ibid**; Hasan Ufuk Aktaşlı, "Türk Muhafazakârlığı ve Kemalizm: Diyalektik Bir İlişki", **Doğu-Batı**, no.58 (2011): 147.
[172] Doğu Ergil, "Muhafazakâr Düşüncenin Temelleri", **Ankara Üniversitesi SBF Dergisi.** no. 41 (2015): 269.

Revolution. Edmund Burke, British political theorist and philosopher, is considered to be the founding father of "conservatism" as he gave one of the earliest reactions to the transformations that were created by the Enlightenment Age in the philosophical sense and the French revolution in the political sense.[173] Burke's stand against the Enlightenment rationalism and his defence of the old order -the Ancient Regime- is what makes him an important figure not only for France but also for all European states.[174] However, the claim that Burke was opposed to all forms of change would be a mistake.[175] Burke's conservatism defends gradual change that would not undermine the traditional social fabric rather than the radical change of the French revolution. In this sense, conservatism that Burke defends should not be understood as a total rejection of the change or a total commitment to the past. Instead, his conservatism should be regarded as defending a certain type of change.[176] To put a finer point on it, the clash of "change" between conservatism and modernization is not a conflict between the new and the old; it is the conflict between the method of renewal and whether or not to repeat some historical, social, political and traditional values and principles in the process of renewal.[177]

According to Muller[178], society is a whole consisting of various institutions and norms for the conservatives. These institutions, which conservatives consider valuable, emerge as a product of historical development, not as a result of natural rights, universal human dispositions or an open contract. That's why; conservative politics is against the political dispositions that may cause harm to the present social structure and order.[179] Change is acceptable but it should not overturn the existing social order for the conservative thought. We can say that, for the conservative change, the actors of social change such as religion, culture and tradition are superior to the actors of political change such as ideology, revolution, state and leader.[180] The importance of preserving existing structures such as family, religion, church or the

[173] Fatih Duman, "Edmund Burke- Muhafazakârlık, Aydınlanma ve Siyaset", **Muhafazakâr Düşünce Dergisi**, no.1 (2004): 32.
[174] **ibid**, 35-36.
[175] Jennifer M. Welsh, **Edmund Burke and International Relations – The commonwealth of Europe and the Crusade against the French Revolution**, (New York: St Martin Press, 1995), 93.
[176] **ibid,** 94.
[177] Halis Çetin, "Muhafazakârlık: Kaosa Karşı Kozmos", **Muhafazakâr Düşünce Dergisi**, no.1 (2004): 95.
[178] Jerry Z. Muller, **Conservatism: An Anthology of Social and Political Thought from David Hume to the Present** (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1997), 11.
[179] Duman, **ibid,** 38.
[180] Çetin, **ibid,** 102.

local community was highlighted by Burke, and also by other traditionalists such as Bonald, de Maistre and Tocqueville.[181]

Conservatism sees society as a living organism and believes the importance of the harmony of every piece that constitutes this organism with each other. Family is seen as one of the most important parts of this organism as an intermediate institution between the individual and the state. In this context, while liberalism puts the individual at the center and socialism considers the society important, conservatism tries to protect the institution of the family.[182]

Although there are common points for classical conservatism, we cannot speak of a single type of conservatism. Conservatism has manifested itself in different forms based on the region it appeared. It showed varieties from society to society depending upon the social, economic and historical factors of that community. For this reason, it would be useful to examine conservatism in continental Europe and Anglo-American world separately.[183] However, this debate is beyond the scope of this study. Neo-conservatism as the recent form of conservatism will be discussed in the following section.

3.1.1. Neo-conservatism

Neo-conservatism has arisen in the 1980s in the Anglo-American world. The main characteristic of neo-conservatism is that it assembles liberalism and conservatism. Conservatism is important for the modern liberal societies because it provides the values and cultural identity without which those societies would fail.[184] Freedom, progress and creativity provided by liberalism could only survive on the condition that some basic values of the society were maintained.[185] Some basic principles of neo-conservatism and its difference from classical conservatism can be outlined as follows:

---

[181] Robert Nisbet, **Conservatism Dream and Reality** (New York: Routledge, 2017), 19.
[182] Murat Yılmaz, ""Muhafazakâr Demokrat" Bir Politikanın Temel Özellikleri Neler Olabilir?", **Muhafazakâr Düşünce Dergisi**, no.1 (2004): 144-145.
[183] Özipek, 2003, **ibid**, 67.
[184] Murat Sezik, "Muhafazakâr Siyaset İdeolojisi ve Türkiye'de Muhafazakârlık", **I. Türkiye Lisansüstü Çalışmalar Kongresi,** June 29-July 1, 2012 (Konya: Selçuk Üniversitesi, 2012): 113.
[185] **ibid.**

Neo-conservatism embraces the main principles of classical liberalism such as individual entrepreneurship without the restrictions of the state.[186] While the advocates of classical conservatism are opposed to the dominance of giant economic organizations and capital groups in the market, neo-conservatives see this as a natural requirement of the era.[187] That's why we can say that neo-conservatives are more individualistic than the classical conservatives. Neo-conservatives, unlike classical conservatives, go against and resist the principle of social equality. According to neo-conservatives, demanding social equality is a utopian ideal and it provides a hindrance for the individuals who want to use their full potential to upgrade in the market.[188]

Although neo-conservatives are more in line with the necessities of the time, they still aim to keep in contact with the traditions. Neo-conservatism tries to reconcile the orders of the day with the traditions, because the necessity of the already existing institutions and values is already obvious, but at the same time innovations of the era should not be ignored. Hence it functions as a bridge between the past and the present.[189]

However, it faces an extremely difficult mission, such as the reconciliation of a new and complex culture with the traditional culture, institutional foundation of which has been largely destroyed.[190] In this regard, it can be said that neo-conservatism has taken the place of conservatism that could not manage to save the past and it adopted saving at least the day as a principle to itself. Hence it tries to prevent ruptures between the human and community life.[191]

3.1.2. Conservatism in Turkey

Today, it is possible to speak of two main conservatisms around the world, which can be classified as classical conservatism and liberal conservatism.[192] Particularly the period after 1980 has been the scene of the association of conservatism and liberalism in the main domains of human life such as politics and economy. Conservatism, along with liberalism, opposed to totalitarian state,

[186] Ergil, **ibid,** 270-292.
[187] **ibid,** 287.
[188] **ibid,** 287-290
[189] **ibid.**
[190] **ibid.**
[191] **ibid,** 292.
[192] Bekir Berat Özipek, **Akıl, Toplum, Siyaset**, 2nd ed. (İstanbul: Kadim Yayınları, 2005), 138.

collectivism, radicalism, founding rationalism and socialism.[193] By the 1970s, conservatism in the Anglo-American world separated from its traditional dimensions turning its face to liberalism and became a part of the new right under the name of "neo-conservatism". However, on the other side "classical conservatism" or "traditional conservatism" subsisted.[194]

While there are some common grounds between the conservatism in the Western sense and conservatism in Turkey, they are not the same. They both give importance to the traditional values, to the role of the religion in the social life and try to protect the institution of the family.[195] However, if we look at the point where conservatism stands in Turkey today, we see that it is quite different from conservatism in the West. In order to understand the evolution of conservative thought in Turkey, we first have to look at the emergence of conservatism in Turkey. Although it is thought to be starting with the process of the establishment of Turkish Republic, Sezik states that the beginning of Turkish conservatism can be traced to the period (1839-1876) when radical change and transformations towards modernization in the Western sense took place in order to catch up with the innovations and developments of the West. As a result of this, political, military, administrative, legal, economic, social and literary innovations were made during the Tanzimat period. The radical changes that were made in this period were not fully successful and they faced various reactions. In the Tanzimat period, it can be said that the tradition of conservatism has started in response to the wrong and inadequate attempts for modernization.[196] However, conservative political ideology did not have a strong effect in the Ottoman Empire and Turkey, until at least the second half of the 20th century.[197]

As it is stated earlier in this chapter, conservatism emerged in Europe as a reaction to the Enlightenment and the French Revolution. In Turkish case, we can say that it flourished in parallel to the social and political transformations in the last decades of the Ottoman Empire and to the revolutions in the foundation process of Turkish Republic. The most significant difference of the Republican reforms from

[193] Özipek, 2005, **ibid,** 140.
[194] **ibid,** 138-139.
[195] Sezik, **ibid**, 113.
[196] **ibid,** 117.
[197] **ibid.**

the Tanzimat period reforms was that Republican Reforms tried not only to establish the "new", but also to eliminate what they evaluated as the "old" and "useless".[198]

Conservatism in Turkey manifests itself in different forms and together with different ideologies. We can talk about different types of conservatisms such as national conservatism, Islamic conservatism, liberal conservatism and neo-conservatism, which is prominent in characterizing the new form of conservatism in Turkey in recent years.[199] In addition to such differing types of conservatisms, "republican conservatism" has been regarded as one of the earliest forms of Turkish conservatism.

The reforms of the newly-established Turkish Republic, which envisaged a complete rejection of the old in order to create a new order, was not acceptable for the conservatives.[200] Hence, the reactions to the revolutionary Kemalist movements of Turkish Republic formed the basis for republican conservatism. Actually, it should not be regarded as a total reaction to Kemalism. According to İrem, republican conservatism can be seen as a new interpretation of Kemalism produced within the debates of Kemalist revolutions that emerged in the 1930s.[201] Republican conservatism, as a critique of Turkish modernity, is important as it emerges within the Kemalist movement itself.[202]

Republican conservative intelligentsia, who criticized the founding political traditions of Western modernity such as socialism and liberalism, argued that these ideologies, which arose in response to the problems of Western modernity, lacked the means to explain Turkish modernization.[203] Turkish modernism that had developed in a different style than the Western modernism had to be handled according to the conditions of Turkish cultural development. That's why republican conservatives emphasize that Kemalism must be developed in such a way that it should remedy the crisis experienced by Turkish society without being exposed to

---

[198] Murat Belge, "Muhafazakârlık Üzerine", **Modern Türkiye'de Siyasi Düşünce: Muhafazakârlık** (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2003): 98.
[199] Tanıl Bora, "Muhafazakârlığın Değişimi ve Türk Muhafazakârlığında Bazı Yol İzleri", **Toplum ve Bilim**, no. 74 (1997): 7.
[200] Özipek, 2003, **ibid,** 81.
[201] Nazım İrem, "Bir Değişim Siyaseti Olarak Türkiye'de Cumhuriyetçi Muhafazakârlık", **Modern Türkiye'de Siyasi Düşünce: Muhafazakârlık** (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2003): 106.
[202] **ibid.**
[203] **ibid,** 110.

individualism, materialism or economism.[204] Öğün states that Turkish republican conservatism interprets republican modernism as the result of the historical continuity unlike the radicalism of Kemalism that evaluates republican modernism as new and completely different from the old structure.[205] We cannot interpret republican conservatism as a stance against modernism, but it can be said that it does not stand up for the radical transformation of the society by refusing its history. In this respect, Karadeniz emphasizes that Turkish republican conservatism can be explained with the concepts like "social harmony" or "balance" rather than "anti-revolution" or "preserving the status quo".[206] They advocated change that did not transform the social order completely with an emphasis on the preservation of the beneficial and fundamental elements. Republican conservative intellectuals had the opinion that society is an organic structure and it goes under constant change in its own dynamics. Hence, for republican conservative intellectuals, society should be protected from any external intervention that could damage its own natural dynamics.[207] That's why the concept of "order" works as a dominant cultural code in shaping republican conservatism in Turkey. This expresses a traditional lifestyle that works harmoniously in the protection of the existing institutions.[208] But as it is emphasized before, republican conservatives were in favour of keeping a balance between what is old and new.

Among the most well known conservatives of the republican era were İsmail Hakkı Baltacıoğlu, Mustafa Şekip Tunç, Hilmi Ziya Ülken, Peyami Safa, Yahya Kemal Beyatlı and Ahmet Hamdi Tanpınar. Peyami Safa who is one of the first intellectuals, who contributed to the formations of republican conservatism, formulates his vision of conservatism on the "synthesis of the West and the East". According to Safa, "the positive science of the West and the mysticism of the East" should be synthesized to form a new tradition.[209] Traditionalism in Turkish republican conservatism can be understood from this perspective; it neither totally

[204] **ibid,** 112.
[205] Süleyman Seyfi Öğün, "Türk Muhafazakârlığının Kültürel Politik Kökleri", **Modern Türkiye'de Siyasi Düşünce: Muhafazakârlık** (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2003): 549.
[206] Sıtkı Karadeniz, "Kemalist Modernleşme Sürecinde Türk Muhafazakârlığı ve Günümüze Yansımalar", **Tezkire**, no. 27-28 (2002): 90.
[207] İrem, **ibid,** 113.
[208] Öğün, **ibid,** 540.
[209] Peyami Safa, **Doğu-Batı Sentezi** (İstanbul: Yağmur Yayınları, 1963), 19.

discards the tradition nor totally becomes westernized.[210] In this context, it has to be noted that republican conservatism in Turkey is distinguished from the classical conservatism in Europe in its stand to the revolution of Turkey. Republican conservatism, a branch of conservatism in Turkey, has a positive attitude towards revolution, embraces Kemalism - on the condition that it constitutes its content itself- and it wants to have a role in shaping the society.[211]

Although republican conservatism has some different aspects from Western conservatism, it was exposed to negative attributions such as being "irrational" and "reactionary" just as Western conservatism confronted. According to Weiss, the difference between conservatives and reactionaries is more distinctive than it is thought. Conservatives, like reactionaries, are sensitive to the past and traditions, but they are not as sensitive as the reactionaries about the traditions. Traditions that do not comply with the conditions can be changed for the conservatives.[212] Although Turkish republican conservatives were of this opinion about change, the conservatives in the first years of the Republic, just like in the last years of the Ottoman Empire could not get rid of the accusation of being "reactionary", so they had to repeat that they had no intention of resurrecting the old, that they were in favour of change.[213] They considered the past important not because they wanted to resurrect the past, but because they think that it functions as a bridge for today.[214] However, conservatism in Turkey was thought to be a hindrance to progress and was identified with "reactionism".[215]

From the establishment of Turkish Republic to the present day, conservatism has been integrated into various ideologies. Thereby, when we look at conservatism in Turkey, it is hard to define a single type of conservatism. Other than republican conservatism, different types of conservatisms such as national conservatism, Islamic conservatism, liberal conservatism, and neo-conservatism have arisen until the present day of Turkey.[216] According to Bora, the reason for the constant renewal of

[210] Karadeniz, **ibid,** 93.
[211] **ibid,** 89.
[212] John Weiss, **Conservatism in Europe 1770-1945** (London: Thomas & Hudson, 1977), 40.
[213] Sezik**, ibid,** 118.
[214] Karadeniz, ibid, 91.
[215] Sezik,**ibid**, 116.
[216] Sezik, **ibid,** 113.

conservatism is that modernization that it reacts is constantly changing. Hence, conservatism shows a paradoxical form of reaction. [217]

3.2. Islamic Movements in Turkey after the 1980s

3.2.1. Islamism versus Islamic Movements

The term "Islamism" has shifting meanings at different social settings. Although we cannot propose a single rigid definition for Islamism, I will include here some definitions of what the term "Islamism" refer to. According to Mozaffari, Islamism is a "religious ideology with a holistic interpretation of Islam whose final aim is the conquest of the world by all means".[218] Göle defines contemporary Islamism as "an endeavour to rename and to reconstruct Muslim identity by freeing it from traditional interpretations and by challenging modernism".[219] According to Göle, Islamism has undergone two stages.[220] She explains the first stage of Islamism with reference to the movements that emerged in Muslim countries in the late 1970s and got radicalized by the Iranian revolution and the establishment of the Islamic Republic in Iran in 1979.[221] She notes that Islamic movements pursued different historical paths in different national settings and explains the manifestations of Islamism at different occasions as follows: Iranian Islamic Revolution that took place in 1979, the rise of an Islamist Party (the Welfare Party) to power through elections in Turkey in 1996, political oppression of Islamic movements in Egypt and Tunisia, and social fragmentation and terrorism happening in Algeria in 1992.[222] Göle defines the second phase of Islamism as a period when Islamism lost its political and revolutionary fire but began to pervade social and cultural daily life practices.[223]

On the other hand, according to Salwa "the term 'Islamism' is used to encompass both Islamist politics as well as re-Islamisation, the process whereby various domains of social life are invested with signs and symbols associated with

---

[217] Bora, **ibid**, 7.
[218] Mehdi Mozaffari, "What is Islamism? History and Definition of a Concept", **Totalitarian Movements and Political Religions**, vol. 8, no. 1 (March 2007): 21.
[219] Göle, 1997, **ibid**, 54.
[220] Göle, 2017, **ibid,** 20.
[221] **ibid.**
[222] **ibid.**
[223] **ibid,** 137.

Islamic cultural traditions."[224] Salwa focuses on the influence of Islamism in the social and cultural domain along with its political implications. Göle also states that Islamism has undergone a shift from a radical political stand to a social and cultural trend but this did not happen by an external force, the actors of Islam who adopted a modern lifestyle in professional, economic or cultural fields transformed Islamism.[225] Avcı states that the period of "Islamism" ended after the 1980s and the period of "Islamic movement" replaced it.[226] With the emergence of Islamic movements, matters such as belief, defining the self and male-female relations started being discussed in public space and in the political arena.[227] As for the visibility of Islamic actors in the public space, Kömeçoğlu points out:

> "As the radical Islam in the 1980s, times when religion and language were close to ideology rather than metaphysics, started to lose its influence among the new Islamic actors, the participants started to get involved in a process of Western subjectivation by removing themselves from the devotion to a cause."[228]

So, it can be said that with the transformation of "Islamism" into "Islamic movements", Islamic actors in Turkey started to get more individualized and reconcile with modernity. Therefore, they became more visible in the public arena starting from the 1980s and that gained momentum after the 1990s.

3.2.2. The Rise of Political Islam and Islamic Capital

In order to understand the Islamic visibility in Turkey that gained intensity after the 1980s, looking at the position of Islam in Turkish politics since the modernization period of Turkish Republic is crucial.

Göle states that during its modernization process, Turkey underwent a series of reformations that would cut its ties with its Ottoman past. Some radical changes in the existing institutions marked these reforms such as the abolition of some religious institutions from the public arena, the secularization of education, the adoption of Latin script and purifying Turkish language leaving out Arabic and Persian words. The former elites, if they could not adapt to these changes, lost their prestige and social status while the ones who were in line with the principles of secularism and

[224] Salwa Ismail, **Rethinking Islamist Politics: Culture, the State and Islamism** (New York: I.B. Tauris & Co, 2003), 2.
[225] Göle, 2017, **ibid**, 33-34.
[226] Özlem Avcı, **İstanbul'da Dindar Üniversite Gençliği: İki Dünya Arasında** (İstanbul İletişim Yayınları: 2012), 54.
[227] Nilüfer Göle, "Modernist Kamusal Alan ve İslami Ahlak", **İslamın Yeni Kamusal Yüzleri**, ed. Nilüfer Göle (İstanbul: Metis Yayınları, 2013): 31.
[228] Kömeçoğlu, 2003, **ibid**, 52.

progress became the new Turkish Republican elites.[229] "National identity" that the republican regime aspired to build aimed at reaching Western civilization and left out the religion identifying it with "reactionism" and "traditionalism".[230] As a result, a distinction arose between the republican elites who conformed to Western and secular way of living and those who were connected to traditional and religious practices and values. The project of modernization that was based on Western, secular lifestyle alienated the secular elites from the local, traditional people.[231] However, Islam has continued to be a primary reference point in shaping identities and the structure of Turkish society even though it was exposed to some control and restrictions by the state in the modernization period.[232] Those who were at the periphery gained new forms of political expression through Islamism that emerged after the 1950s and increased after the 1980s.[233] The increasing visibility of Islam in Turkey cannot be traced to a single factor. The transition from single-party to multi-party period, migration from rural to urban areas and economic developments played role in the Islamic revivalism in Turkey.[234]

The period after 1980 is significant in understanding how dynamics of Turkish society have changed in the social, political, economic and cultural fields. Turkey experienced a military coup d'état in 1980. The Motherland Party, as a center-right party, came to power in 1983 and Turgut Özal, the founder of the party, became the 19th prime minister of Turkish Republic. Göle states that the Motherland Party's identity was built especially onto three themes. First, the party adopted a soft political style contrary to the rigid political atmosphere of the preceding decades. Second, it advocated a pragmatic attitude as its policy and aimed to bring the "action" to the fore rather than "rhetoric". Thirdly, it sought to establish a synthesis between market values and Islamist conservative values and formed its identity in this direction.[235] It can be understood that the strict political and economic atmosphere of the last decades started to fade away with the policies of the

[229] Göle, 1997, **ibid,** 49-50.
[230] Fuat Keyman, "On the relation between Global Modernity and Nationalism: The Crisis of Hegemony and the Rise of (Islamic) Identity in Turkey", **New Perspectives on Turkey**, no. 13 (1995): 106.
[231] Göle, 1997, **ibid,** 52.
[232]Talip Küçükcan, "State, Islam and Religious Liberty in Modern Turkey: Reconfiguration of Religion in the Public Sphere" (September 19, 2003):
475, https://ssrn.com/abstract=2498563 [27.04.2019].
[233] Göle, 1997, **ibid,** 52.
[234] Küçükcan, **ibid**, 506.
[235] Göle, 2017, **ibid**, 45-46.

Motherland Party. Especially, the economic model that Turgut Özal aspired to build changed the dynamics of Turkish society not only in the financial sense but also in cultural and social aspects. Özal supported and promoted "economic liberalism" as the new economic model of Turkey. Economic liberalism can be described as an approach that suggests that the best way to accelerate development and the general well being in a society is to free and release the private enterprise from any obstacle.[236]

The economy system before liberal economy model was under the control of the state to a great extent. The statist economy system was set up by prohibitive rules, which set limits on individual and social entrepreneurship. People were dependent on the state in economic, political and social areas because of a number of prohibitions and limitations on various issues such as the establishment of private institutions, foundations or media tools.[237] The Motherland Party adopted a free market economy and started a massive privatization movement.[238] Political and economic liberalism provided freedom and autonomy to the areas that were kept under control by the state before.

The development of the market economy, export-oriented economy, the growth of private radio and televisions, private universities and foundations established in all areas have all incited the spirit of enterprise and built up new communication networks. All these developments have brought dynamism to Turkish society by creating new opportunities aside from the state.[239] This economic atmosphere has triggered entrepreneurship and the Islamic circles got the chance to take place within this system and started to shape educational, political and economic fields with their own norms.[240] During the period of Turgut Özal, the contribution of Islamic subjects on the economic growth through their integration into the market economy was encouraged and Islamic groups were seen integral in economic growth.[241] An important indicator of the rise of Islam in the economic sphere was the rise of a capital with religious and conservative identities, also known as "Green Capital", "Islamic Capital" or "Anatolian Tigers", which became more prominent

[236] Nur Vergin, **Din, Toplum ve Siyasal Sistem** (İstanbul: Bağlam Yayınları, 2000), 235.
[237] Göle, 2017, **ibid**, 56
[238] Küçükcan, **ibid**, 493.
[239] Göle, 2017, **ibid**, 56
[240] M. Hakan Yavuz, "Political Islam and the Welfare Party", **Comparative Politics,** vol. 30, no. 1 (1997): 70.
[241] Bilici, **ibid,** 223.

after the 1990s. The establishment of organizations such as MUSIAD and ASKON is an indication of the existence of an Islamic capital against the old elites.[242]

Turgut Özal, as well as encouraging Muslim capitalists, also paved the way for traders who came from smaller cities of Anatolia with a religious background, which resulted in the inclusion of the Islamists in the market along with secularists.[243] Islamic businesses then started to produce all sorts of goods necessary for everyday life. What distinguished them from secular companies was their emphasis on the appropriateness of the goods for Islam. Islamic values were highlighted in the marketing strategies of the Muslim companies.[244] The emergence and growth of "Islamic consumerism" developed as the capital accumulated among Islamically-oriented circles and Islamic consumerism has been manifested through the preferences of consumers for certain brands or companies.[245]

As a result, Islamic actors started to regulate everyday life by creating alternative forms to the mainstream forms of communication channels, consumption practices or public places. In this regard, Islamic newspapers, music and films, Islamic clothing and fashion shows, hotels or restaurants that do not sell alcoholic beverages and pay attention to the prayer times increased in number and new forms of participation in public life have emerged.[246]

3.2.3. Public Visibility of Islamic Subjects

According to Göle, public sphere in Turkey where modernist practices and lifestyle pervaded was shaped by the Republican elites while the Islamic subjects who did not manage to become Westernized fell outside of this public sphere.[247] Therefore, regarding the exclusion of certain groups from the public sphere, Habermas's definition of public sphere,[248] as a meeting ground for all the citizens where issues regarding the public are discussed, did not fit in Turkish context at least not until the last decades of the 20th century.

---

[242] İpek Göçmen, "Muhafazakârlık, Neoliberalizm ve Sosyal Politika: Türkiye'de Din Temelli Sosyal Yardım Organizasyonları", **Doğu-Batı**, no.58 (2011): 122.
[243] Yael Navaro-Yashin, "The Market for Identities: Secularism, Islamism, Commodities", **Fragments of Culture: The Everyday of Modern Turkey**, ed. Deniz Kandiyoti, Ayşe Saktanber (New York: I.B. Tauris & Co, 2002): 224.
[244] **ibid**.
[245] Genel, Karaosmanoğlu, **ibid**, 477.
[246] Göle, 2013, **ibid,** 34.
[247] **ibid**, 24.
[248] Habermas, **ibid,** 27.

As it is mentioned previously in this chapter, Islamic groups became more involved in the public sphere after the adoption of liberal economy policies and the inclusion of the Islamists in the market. Kılıçbay and Binark state that the rise of the Islamic local bourgeoisie as a result of their investments in various areas facilitated their entrance into the domains of the "center".[249] As a result of their investments and inclusion in the market, Islamic subjects started to get more involved in the public sphere by transforming or creating certain institutions suitably with Islamic lifestyle. The desire for an Islamic way of living brought about changes in the existing structures and created new forms such as Islamic radio and television stations, banking systems such as interest-free banking, and new forms of consumption including fashion and tourism.[250]

Islamic groups were introduced new consumer items and new forms of leisure activities. Among the new consumer items introduced to the new rising Islamic class were new *tesettür* (veiling) shops, living quarters which offered gender-segregated facilities and holiday resorts that were compatible with Islamic way of living with facilities such as gender-segregated beaches and religious facilities in the hotel.[251]

The habits of the Muslim subjects and their way of life changed as a result of the creation of an "Islamicized leisure".[252] Namely, the ones who stayed at the periphery started to enjoy the opportunities and lifestyles of the "center".[253] Islamic tourism can be given as an example for Islamicized leisure. Bilici, in his study, discusses Islamic consumption through Caprice Hotel, the first Islamic/conservative hotel in Turkey, which opened in 1996 in Aydın. Caprice Hotel comes into prominence with its services suitable for Islamic way of living. It serves non-alcoholic drinks to its customers, has a big prayer room and has separate beaches for men and women.[254] As a new site of conservative consumption, Caprice Hotel evoked debates not only among seculars but also among the Islamist intellectuals.[255] While seculars interpreted Caprice Hotel as a place where holiday "becomes Islamicised", Islamic intellectuals defined it as a place where Islamic identity was

[249] Kılıçbay, Binark, **ibid,** 496-497.
[250] Göle, 2017, **ibid**, 137.
[251] Genel, Karaosmanoğlu, **ibid**, 477-478.
[252] Kılıçbay, Binark, **ibid,** 499.
[253] **ibid.**
[254] Bilici, **ibid,** 217.
[255] Göle, 2017, ibid, 154.

defeated by Western consumption culture.[256] Bilici states that as well as creating new opportunities for socialization, Caprice Hotel refines the new upper class, functioning as a "status filter".[257]

Apart from Islamic holidays, veiling fashion also aroused interest and led to debates not only in terms of conservative consumption but also in terms of the visibility of Islam in the public sphere. Veil holds an important position among other consumer goods produced by Muslim companies after the 1980s. Many companies flourished to produce clothing items for hijabi women after this date.[258] As a result, the practice of veiling became part of the consumption patterns and was influenced by the trends of the market economy.[259] The new veiling fashion became compatible with the commodification process, conveying multi-layered meanings. The integration of veil with fashion reshaped the lifestyles of Muslim women by providing new opportunities for them to become more visible in the public arena. This has resulted in a shift in the position of Muslim women challenging the dichotomy of modern and traditional.[260] Genel and Karaosmanoğlu also state that new veiling fashion in Turkey has important implications for understanding how Islamic capital shapes new Muslim identity that is neither totally "traditional" nor extremely "radical" Islamists.[261]

Islamic women became visible in the public sphere and reformulated their identity after the 1980s. Göle[262] draws an analogy between the roles of Islamic women after this date and republican women in the modernization process of Turkey after the establishment of Turkish Republic. In contemporary Islamist movement, public visibility of Islamic women had a critical role in the integration process of the Islamic groups in public life. In this respect, the visibility of Islamic women in universities, in political life and in urban areas had a symbolic importance. In a similar manner, women in the Republican era held an important position as agents of modernity in Turkey's modernization project.[263]

---

[256] Bilici, **ibid,** 219.
[257] **ibid,** 226.
[258] Navaro-Yashin, **ibid**, 225.
[259] Kılıçbay, Binark, **ibid,** 499.
[260] Salwa Ismail, "Being Muslim: Islam, Islamism and Identity Politics", **Government and Opposition**, vol. 39, no.4 (September 2004): 626.
[261] Genel, Karaosmanoğlu, **ibid**, 478.
[262] Göle, 2013, **ibid,** 27.
[263] **ibid.**

As mentioned earlier, veiling fashion and alternative consumption trends such as conservative holidays have increased the public visibility of Islam, creating various debates and tensions between the secularists and Islamists.[264] However, there also arised tensions among Islamic groups regarding the changing consumption patterns of the Islamic middle class. Islamist intellectuals, in particular, have criticized the Islamic middle class that conformed to the patterns of consumption in the Western style and, in turn, advocated the "authenticity of identity".[265]

3.2.4. Islamist Intellectuals and Debates over Conservative Consumption

After the 1980s, a new group called "Islamist intellectuals" who have knowledge of not only Islamic literature but also Western social theory showed up. They tried to show that it is possible to find solutions for social and economic problems through Islamic thinking. [266] Göle describes these Islamist thinkers in Turkey as follows:

> "They use modern Turkish language, discuss thinkers, discuss issues such as postmodernism, participate in public debates with secular intellectuals, and master Western foreign intellectuals and Western foreign languages. Although Islamist intellectuals seek to define an Islamic identity and society through their writings, they have a lot in common with the secular intellectuals in their social profiles, in their writing and communication styles, and their use of the mass media."[267]

Turkish radical Islamic intellectuals of the 1980s built their Turkish identity on a critique of Westernization and thus approached consumerism in Turkey context as an indicator of Western lifestyle. In this respect, secularists were criticized for being "fake" and losing their "authentic identity" since they were regarded imitating Western lifestyle.[268] Thus Islamist intellectuals took a stand against what they regarded as a spinoff of Western modernity such as consumerism, pollution, nationalism and degradation. [269]

Navaro-Yashin claims that although Islamist movements associated commodity cultures with Western way of life and values and had a reactionary stance against them, both secularists and Islamists in Turkey took place in the activities of

---

[264] **ibid,** 34
[265] **ibid,** 36.
[266] İhsan D. Dağı, "Rethinking Human Rights, Democracy and the West: Post-Islamist Intellectuals in Turkey", **Critique: Critical Middle Eastern Studies**, vol.13, no.2 (2004): 135.
[267] Göle, 1997, **ibid**, 56.
[268] Navaro-Yashin, **ibid**, 248.
[269] Göle, 1997, **ibid,** 54.

commodification.[270] Islamic movement formed its intellectuals, professionals and middle class. These groups changed the dynamics of the Islamic movement in turn by getting more individualized and getting involved in the market economy, in the world of media and art.[271] The actors of the Islamic movement transformed the dynamics of social relations and consumption after the 1990s by reconciling with modernity and getting involved in the consumption culture. Regarding this, Islamic intellectuals of the late 1990s lost their faith in the Islamization of not only politics but also society when compared to the Islamist intellectuals of the 1980s. On the contrary they reproduced modern notions.[272]

In conclusion, it can be said that intellectual dreams of the 1980s in order to Islamicize the lifestyles and polity in Turkey terminated in the late 1990s since post-Islamists faced the challenges of the social and political conditions of Turkey.[273]

3.2.5. Consumption and Identity Formation

Identities and social relations in the post-modern period are formed through commercialization and commodification. Consumerism has affected not only Islamists but also secularists in terms of identity formation.[274] Navaro-Yashin states that the consumer culture of the 1980s and 1990s was closely related to the politics of identity, not only for Islamists but also for secularists as well.[275] Both groups represented their identities through commodification in these decades[276] but they differed in the way they represented themselves. The following quote elaborates on conservative consumption:

> "The consumption culture of religious people is defined as the social reality which is constructed by going beyond a secular imposition and by creating its own 'area', by building walls around it and by controlling the entrances and exits. In other words, there is a consumption culture that takes into account the sensitivities of religious people. This consumption culture can be explained by dressing/not dressing, eating/not eating, drinking/not drinking according to their beliefs, the use of symbols that define the identity of the religious group and showing their difference from the 'other' not only with objects but also with spatial

[270] Navaro-Yashin, **ibid**, 222.
[271] Göle, 2017, **ibid,** 14.
[272] Dağı, **ibid**, 138-139.
[273] **ibid**, 143.
[274] Ismail, 2004, **ibid,** 626.
[275] Navaro-Yashin, **ibid**, 224.
[276] **ibid**, 247.

> divisions. Moreover, shopping centers, restaurants, hotels and so on that are created based on this are the places that maintain the culture of consumption on the basis of religiosity."[277]

As stated here, Islamism in the post-modern era started to manifest a distinct lifestyle along with particular consumption patterns.[278] However, according to Göle,[279] the fact that Islamic groups formed their own consumption practices and way of life did not merely come out as a reaction to the established secular way of life but it also formed its own paradigm and cultural model of modernity. The groups who stayed at the periphery – non-secular, traditional groups- reconciled not only with modernity but also with the secular elites through Islamic movement[280] because after their involvement in the market, they had to interact with the "other" and created hybrid institutions and identities.[281]

3.3. New Islamic Bourgeoisie of the 2000s

The neoliberal economy policies of the Motherland Party were sustained by the JDP after it came to power in 2002. The 2000s were the years when the bourgeoisie and the bureaucracy changed hands with the rise of the JDP to power; the state ideology settled on a right-conservative line and there was a radical transformation in the center-periphery relations.[282] The JDP, founded in 2001 under the leadership of Recep Tayyip Erdoğan, defines itself as "conservative democrat"; it is "conservative in the sense of protecting the cultural heritage and democrat in terms of defending modern institutions and values".[283] According to Erler, the JDP has a very eclectic appearance; he evaluates the stance of the JPD (6 years after its foundation) as a party that is nationalist conservative culturally and politically, advocates free market economy and liberalism in terms of economy policies and highlights religion in the social sphere as well as its emphasis on democracy and the West.[284]

---

[277] Hasan Hüseyin Aygül, Özgür Öztürk, "Dini Çoğulculuk ve Kamusal Alanda Dindar Tüketim Kültürü", **Hacettepe Üniversitesi İletişim Fakültesi Kültürel Çalışmalar Dergisi**, vol. 3, no.1 (2016): 194.
[278] Ismail, 2003, **ibid,** 53.
[279] Göle, 1997, **ibid**, 53.
[280] **ibid.**
[281] Bilici, **ibid,** 236.
[282] Sıla Sabancılar Eren, Selahaddin Bakan, "2000'lerde Türkiye'de Burjuvazi Sınıfının Siyasal Dönüşümü", **Birey ve Toplum**, vol.7, no.13 (Spring 2017): 141.
[283] Özgür Erler, "Yeni Muhafazakârlık, AKP ve "Muhafazakâr Demokrat" Kimliği", **Stratejik Araştırmalar Dergisi**, vol.10 (2007): 129-130.
[284] **ibid**, 131.

It is an undeniable fact that political activities have an impact in the economic, social and cultural fields and the JDP government that has a religious character, played an active role in normalizing the relationship between capitalist economy and religious culture.[285] So, Islamic capital groups have gained a more "moderate" perspective for economic empowerment and have adapted to the capitalist consumption culture.[286] The JDP, as a conservative democrat party, has supported the Islamic bourgeoisie with which it has socio-cultural similarity.[287] Akarçay states that government support to the Islamic bourgeoisie has resulted in the rise of Islamic capital as an important force in the central economy during the rulership of the JDP more than in the period of any other political parties.[288] Privatizations, tenders, loans and all kinds of state support are given to those who are coming from Islamic backgrounds, which bourgeoisifies the Islamic circles as well as "Islamicising" the bourgeoisie.[289] In the meantime, the Western-national (in other words secular) bourgeoisie began to lose power as the Islamist bourgeoisie became stronger with the support of the JDP government.[290] It should be noted that ideological, cultural and religious differences have been effective in weakening the ties between the secular bourgeoisie and the government.[291]

Akarçay argues that Islamic capital, despite attributing importance to Islamic values, endeavours to reconcile with capitalist values and become secular.[292] Therefore, it is possible to observe the emergence of a new bourgeoisie typology: an Islamic bourgeoisie that has Islamic sensitivities but whose sensitivities diminish as they become capitalist, whose consumption practices change along with a desire to move to the "center" from the "periphery".[293] Getting richer, the religious / conservative circles became more visible in the public sphere and new consumption areas emerged. In particular, the areas they avoided on the grounds that they were not

[285] Sümeyye Aydın, "Dini Kültür ve Tüketim: Modern ve Postmodern Düşünce Bağlamında Dini Kültür-Tüketim İlişkisinin Bir Kritiği", **VII. Ulusal Sosyoloji Kongresi Bildiri Kitabı II, October 02-05, 2013** (Muğla: Muğla Sıtkı Koçman Üniversitesi, 2013): 28.
[286] Sabancılar Eren, Bakan, **ibid**, 143.
[287] **ibid**, 144.
[288] Erhan Akarçay, "Türkiye'de İslam Ahlakı ve Kapitalizmin Ruhu (Olabilir Mi?)", **VI. Ulusal Sosyoloji Kongresi Bildiri Kitabı,** October 2009 (Aydın: Adnan Menderes Üniversitesi): 185.
[289] Kurtar Tanyılmaz, "Türkiye Burjuvazisinde Derin Çatlak: Burjuvazinin İç Çatışmasının Sınıfsal Temelleri", **Devrimci Marksizm**, vol.12 (2011): 74.
[290] Sabancılar Eren, Bakan, **ibid**, 141.
[291] **ibid**, 143.
[292] Akarçay, **ibid**, 197.
[293] **ibid**.

suitable for religious life have been regulated regarding the Islamic rules and became new sites for the accumulation of capital.[294] It is in these political and economic developments regarding the conservatives of Turkey that these conservative cafes have emerged.

[294] Aygül, Öztürk, **ibid**, 197.

4. INVESTIGATION OF FOUR CAFES IN İSTANBUL IN TERMS OF CONSERVATIVE CONSUMPTION

This chapter analyzes four cafes in İstanbul: Çikolata & Kahve, Nevmekân, Mihrimah Kahve and Huqqa under four headings in order to shed some light on the consumption practices of conservative people in Turkey, specifically in İstanbul, in the last decade. In this regard, physical properties and general atmosphere of the cafes, the customer profile, distinct features of the cafes and finally their use of social media were examined in order to comprehend what contributes to the making of these cafes a conservative place. After looking deep into these cafes under aforecited characteristics, three overarching themes were identified in order to discuss these cafes regarding consumption practices of the conservatives. Therefore, an overall analysis of these cafes was conducted in order to see how the habitus of religiously sensitive people has been shaped and how it has changed in these urban places in the era of globalization and consumption.

4.1. Research Design

In order to understand conservative consumption practices, four cafes in İstanbul were analyzed in this thesis. Three of these cafes, Mihrimah Kahve, Nevmekân and Çikolata & Kahve are located in Üsküdar, a neighbourhood on the Anatolian side of İstanbul where mostly conservative people reside. Huqqa, as opposed to these three cafes, is located in one of the most secular neighbourhoods of İstanbul: Beşiktaş, on the European side. These four cafes are among the favorite spots of the conservative circles in İstanbul. The aforementioned cafes in Üsküdar have a conservative look with their general atmosphere, so I have decided that they could set a good example for this thesis also by observing the customer profile going to these cafes. As said above, Huqqa is located in a secular area. What distinguished Huqqa from the cafes in that specific area is its being a non-alcoholic place and its praying facilities that attract conservative people there as well as the seculars. Huqqa, after opening in Kuruçeşme, near the most well known nightclubs of İstanbul, has

been at the centre of public attention and had media coverage. The appearance of the cafe on the media as a non-alcoholic place that is situated along the Bosphorus has contributed to and is related to Huqqa being a center of attention for the conservatives, especially for the ones who belong to upper classes of the society. For the reasons mentioned above, Huqqa has been considered important in understanding the consumption patterns of conservatives, especially the conservative bourgeoisie in the last decade and is expected to provide valuable data in understanding the changing habitus of contemporary Muslims in this study.

In order to better understand the features and customer profile of the cafes to be studied, I visited the cafes on a regular basis, paying around 20 visits to each cafe and spending 1 or 2 hours on my each visit. In these visits, I adopted the participant observer role. During my visits, I observed the details of the cafes such as the decoration, the music preferences, the menu, customer profile visiting these venues and all kinds of relations and activities taking place there.

Apart from participatory observation, I used semi-structured interview technique in order to collect data. I conducted semi-structured interviews with two cafe owners, a cafe manager and a human resources assistant. All the interviewees, except for the interviewee in Huqqa, were male. Interview questions were prepared by the researcher and the questions consisted of four thematic parts. In the first part, the interviewees gave information about how they started the cafe business. In the second part, questions regarding the features of the cafes such as their decoration, design, music and menu preferences were asked to the interviewees. The third part of the interview consisted of questions about the customer profile of the cafes and in the last part, social media use and the events taking place in these cafes were explored.[295]

Before the interviews were done, the interviewees were asked for permission for the audio recording of the interview. They were also informed about the confidentiality of the interview and assured that the data will only be used for the present academic study.

I contacted the owners of Çikolata & Kahve and Mihrimah Kahve during my visits and when I asked whether it was possible to have an interview with them, they willingly accepted. I was able to interview only one of the co-owners of Çikolata &

[295] For the details of the interview questions, see Appendix 1-4.

Kahve due to the tight work schedule of the cafe owners. We had the interview in one of the upper rooms of Çikolata & Kahve and it took about 50 minutes. The interviewee was quite open and friendly during the interview and answered my questions sincerely. As for Mihrimah Kahve, I had the interview with one of the four owners of the cafe. Because of the difficulty of planning a focus group interview, I was able to conduct an individual interview, which lasted for 25 minutes. The interview took place in the cafe, as it was the most suitable place for both the cafe owner and me. As for Nevmekân, I had the interview with the cafe manager because the cafe is owned by the state. My contact with the manager of Nevmekân was a bit hard; first I had to go to Üsküdar municipality to ask for permission since Nevmekân belongs to Üsküdar municipality. The concerned officers in the municipality directed me to KENTUR Inc. & Co., the company running the business of Nevmekân. After my contact with the managers of the company, they directed me to the manager of Nevmekân and I was able to contact with him for the interview. The interview took place in Nevmekân upon the request of the cafe manager as he was there most of the time running the businesses of the cafe. I went to the cafe on the arranged time and date and had a 40-minute interview with the cafe manager who answered the questions genuinely. As for Huqqa, despite my endeavours to get in touch with the cafe manager via email and social media tools, I was not able to reach him as he was abroad on business. After sending an email to the official email account of Huqqa, they directed me to the human resources assistant. She accepted my request to have an interview and we had the interview in her office in Atasay Holding in Bahçelievler. Although she was not informed about the cafe down to the ground, she gave me valuable information about Huqqa. Not being able to contact with the cafe manager or the owners did not create a big gap in terms of my analysis since I was able to find newspaper interviews conducted with the cafe manager and the owner in the previous years.

After the interviews were conducted, the audio-recordings were transcribed on Microsoft Word and the transcriptions were translated into English. After analyzing the statements of the participants, I identified four characteristics based on the data and categorized the data under these characteristics. Categorizing the statements under certain headings helped me better see the points common to all cafes as well as the points differentiating them from each other. Following this, I

specified three overarching themes to discuss the conservative cafes in relation to the existing literature and to provide implications for further research.

As well as personal observations and interviews, news and opinion columns provided data for my study, especially for Huqqa. In this respect, reviewing the news and discussions on conservative cafes has also contributed to my analysis of these cafes in terms of conservative consumption practices.

The aforementioned cafes were analyzed within the scope of this thesis under four headings as can be seen in the following parts. After all the cafes were analyzed separately, a general analysis of the cafes was made in order to understand conservative consumption practices and performances based on three encompassing themes.

4.2. Çikolata & Kahve: "a Little Old-fashioned"

4.2.1. Physical Properties and Atmosphere of Çikolata & Kahve

Çikolata & Kahve is a three-storey wooden cafe located in Çengelköy, Üsküdar. It was opened in 2006 in a small building and moved to its current place in 2014. The cafe belongs to private individuals and currently there are two co-partners of the cafe. The whole staff in the cafe is male.

The outer view of the cafe resembles a typical Ottoman mansion. The exterior of the building is light green and the window shutters are painted bottle green. At the entrance, there is a three-wing revolving wooden door. The interior of the building gives the impression of a sitting room with its lively and cozy atmosphere. The first and second floors of the cafe are designed for serving the customers while the third floor consists of restrooms, washrooms for ablution, prayer rooms and two small rooms named *has oda* and *zümrüt oda*, which were opened on demand of the female customers who wanted to sit among themselves without being disturbed. Ladies may hire these rooms when they want to use them privately, have birthday organizations and "gold days"[296] there.

[296] "Gold day" is a leisure activity held by women in Turkey, usually at home. In this social gathering, women come together with their friends or neighbours with the purpose of collecting gold coins as well as chatting and having fun together. At every gathering, one of the participants becomes the host and the others bring gold coins on their visit the host. Thus, all the participants get gold coins on their

The first and second floors are decorated with avant-garde tables, chairs, candelabras and chandeliers. The dominant colors are green, brown, beige and golden yellow. The walls are decorated with Ottoman-style motifs. Besides, Arabic verses of the Koran are used on the walls of the setting. There are framed prints of Arabic letters such as "ا" and "و", which are used in many religious contexts and respectively symbolize the "oneness" of God and "servitude" to God in Islam. There are also calligraphy paintings of some *sura*s (section of the Koran) such as *Felak* and *Nas* suras. The founder of Çikolata & Kahve is interested in calligraphy, that's why the walls of the cafe are decorated with calligraphy works. There are also framed prints of a whole page from the Koran on certain walls of the cafe. On my interview with one of the owners of the cafe, the interviewee stated that his co-partner, the founder of the cafe, is "a person who wants to reflect what is inside him to out". That's why the cafe was designed in such a way and Çikolata & Kahve was the first to make such a concept. He states: "At the time he (the founder of the cafe) intended to make such a concept, nobody dared to do that. Well...Verses of the Koran and the prophet Muhammad's sayings and hilya sharif[297] on the walls…" He states that such a concept was well received by people and puts emphasis on a "need for such a concept" on the part of the customers. That's why, it would not be wrong to say that Çikolata & Kahve was conceptualized to satisfy a need on the part of conservative people to spend time and join a public place with a sense of belonging.

The cafe owner states that they were inspired not only by Eastern but also Western influences in the interior decoration of the place. It can be labeled as an "East-West synthesis" according to him. The third floor of the cafe is mainly used for praying. The cafe owner states that because of the concept, majority of their customers are from conservative circles. He further notes that the lack of a prayer room crates a problem for religiously sensitive people when they go out. This is because; they wanted to solve the prayer room and ablution room problems of especially female customers when they started expanding their business.

As for the background music, the songs of *İncesaz* (a Turkish musical group), Turkish classical music, and even Islamic hymns are played in the playlist of the

---

turn. Gold days are not only instrumental in saving money, but they also provide opportunities for women to socialize.

[297] The Hilya Sharif is the description in text of the physical qualities and appearance of the Messenger of Allah (Prophet Muhammed). "Hilya Sharif", http://seerah.learnislam.org.uk/hilya-sharif/ [10.06.2019].

coffee. They also play Western style classical music from time to time. The cafe owner states that sometimes customers find it odd when classical music is played since they are not accustomed to hearing such music there. The cafe owner further notes:

> "We will play Western style classical music more...We already call this place the synthesis of the East and the West. After all, when you look at here, it's not a small mosque; it's a public place. People from all walks of life visit us. We have friends from different social circles and we want this place to relate to everyone."

There is only one menu that can be seen at the entrance because the beverages to be ordered are limited. The menu consists of Turkish coffee, hot chocolate and hot chocolate with coffee (specialty of Çikolata & Kahve). On ordering Turkish coffee, they bring a bar of chocolate, a glass of water and Ottoman sherbet with it. The cafe owner says that they do not want to include too many things in the menu. They just want to specialize in coffee and chocolate. As for the reason for such a preference, he says: "Actually, we are a little old-fashioned. Let the butcher do the butchery, let the grocer do the grocery. We're the people who love the old-fashioned understanding of trade". He says that they do not aim to serve food in the cafe; however, they may add new beverages to the menu such as herbal tea and drip coffee. He points out that they will call its name as *süzme kahve*[298] in order to be in Turkish with an emphasis on the locality and nationality. The cafe owner says that they do not write a bill at the cafe since they have a trust-based relationship with the customers. The customers just tell what they drank and pay for it. However, paying by credit card is not valid in Çikolata & Kahve because of religious concerns. Using credit card is a controversial issue in Islam and the cafe owners made the decision not to accept credit card as a payment option.

4.2.2. Customer Profile

The customers of Çikolata & Kahve are mostly young people aged between 18 and 30. There are families and children, too. The cafe has customers not only from İstanbul but also from other cities of Turkey, and abroad. The cafe owner depending on his talks with the customers says "people from abroad (referring to Turkish people living abroad) are moved when they come here, probably because they find their inner worlds being reflected here".

[298] "Filter coffee"

Among the customers visiting Çikolata & Kahve, conservative customers are slightly more than the others according to the accounts of the cafe owner. The design and atmosphere of the cafe is influential in attracting conservative people there according to him since they find "their inner worlds" being reflected in this cafe.

Conservative people have sensitivities about food, atmosphere and the existence of religious facilities in a public place, and Çikolata & Kahve satisfies these expectations as pointed out by the owner. The cafe owner states that customers do not question the products being *halal* or not, because they see the concept of the shop and understand what kind of a place it is.

The cafe owner describes their relationships with the customers as an intimate one seeing them as "guests" rather than "customers". Depending on the statements of the cafe owner, we can say that Çikolata & Kahve has a traditional approach to their relationships with their customers:

> "We are like a family with our customers. It has been nearly 13 years and since the very first day until now, we are in contact with most of our customers...We have bonds of love with our customers...We can be a friend, brother, uncle to our customers. Of course this is also about the approach of the customers who come here to us."

When compared to global coffee chains, the owners differentiate Çikolata & Kahve from them in terms of its relationships with the customers. The owner says: "When you go to Starbucks, you get your paper coffee cup and go out. It's not like that here. People who come here are blessed for us...We wish that anyone who come here should leave gladly. Anyone coming here is the guest of Allah for us".

However, he stated that they sometimes receive negative comments from customers as well as positive feedbacks. He says "there are people who give negative reactions, too... There are those who come inside the shop and immediately go out swearing". Such kind of a reaction obviously stems from the image of the cafe as a conservative place. The cafe owner points out:

> "When they enter the building, they see hilya sharif, Arabic letters and basmala and say 'Mmm…This is the place of zealots', and go out. Maybe he/she can find something in common with us if he/she has a chat with us but seeing these writings changes the dimension of the issue on the part of hem/her".

4.2.3. Distinct Features of Çikolata & Kahve

One important thing to point out about Çikolata & Kahve is that coffee fortune telling is not permitted there since it is forbidden in Islam and the customers are expected not to tell fortunes.

When we look at the growth of fortune telling practice in the cafes in İstanbul, it is seen that fortune-telling cafes started to flourish in İstanbul in the early 2000s after the commodification of the practice of fortune telling. The emergence of fortune telling cafes as a business served well for the entrepreneurs, providing an advantage for them in the cafe market.[299] *Melekler Kahvesi* leads the way for the emergence of fortune telling cafes in İstanbul. After the opening of *Melekler Kahvesi* in Beyoğlu in 2001, plenty of fortune-telling cafes came out in that area.[300]

Historically, fortune telling was prohibited in Turkey by a law promulgated in 1925[301], as part of Turkey's "nationalist and modernist secularization project" since fortunetellers were not desired subjects in Turkey's aspirations for constituting a national culture set by republican elites.[302] Considering this legal barrier, fortune telling cafes must meet the following requirements in order to come into being: "the attachment of fortune telling to a legally permissible commodity, the marketing of fortune telling as a 'complimentary' service and the informal employment of fortunetellers".[303] The act of fortune telling cannot be realized by itself if not attached to a legal commodity.

Fortune telling cafes have increased in number and become an economic source after the 2000s. According to a report in a daily Turkish newspaper, *Hürriyet*, fortune-telling cafes have grown rapidly, reaching 230 in Istanbul in 2005, with an average of 20 thousand people visiting a fortuneteller. The newspaper presents this as a "fortune telling mania".[304] In 2007, a report in a Turkish newspaper, *Türkiye*, declares that the number of fortune telling cafes in İstanbul reached 2000 and such kind of cafes are harshly criticized in the report since they exploited the visitors both materially and morally. These cafes are accused of being "hope mongers" because they offer some kind of consolation for those who are hopeless about their lives and desperate of hearing some good news from the coffee cup fortuneteller no matter

[299] Zeynep K. Korkman, "Fortunes for Sale: Cultural Politics and Commodification of Culture in Millennial Turkey", **European Journal of Cultural Studies,** vol. 18, no. 3 (2015): 321.
[300] Korkman, **ibid**, 321.
[301] "Tekke Ve Zaviyelerle Türbelerin Seddine Ve Türbedarlıklar İle Bir Takim Unvanların Men Ve İlgasına Dair Kanun (Law No. 677)", **Resmi Gazete**, 243 (December, 1925): 113.
[302] Korkman, **ibid**, 328.
[303] Korkman, **ibid**, 325.
[304] "Kafelerde Fal Çılgınlığı", http://www.hurriyet.com.tr/kelebek/kafelerde-fal-cilginligi-336240 , [16/05/2019].

how much it costs.[305] Great interest in fortune telling cafes has continued after the 2010s. An article published in a Turkish newspaper, *Vatan*, in 2014 reports that there has been a boom in public interest in fortune telling in the preceding five years. Popular fortune telling cafes in Taksim – a neighbourhood in İstanbul where fortune telling cafes first flourished – host customers from different segments of the society including housewives, CEOs, bureaucrats and even artists. The charges for coffee fortune telling may even reach to 1000 Turkish liras according to the news.[306]

There is no doubt that the increase of fortune-telling cafes in İstanbul has an economic dimension. But in a country where the majority are Muslims, the phenomenon of fortune telling has a religious dimension, too. In Islam, fortune telling is not allowed since it is believed that only God has the knowledge of the future. Çikolata & Kahve, a cafe that stands out with its religious sensitivities, does not allow any fortune telling activities in the cafe. There are even written warnings on the walls about it. As for the reason for disallowing fortune telling in the cafe, the cafe owner puts forward religious concerns:

> "Fortune telling has been reduced to a small and simple situation today... Fortune telling may lead individuals to polytheism (*shirk*) but it has come down to a very simple situation. We want to draw attention to this...Each Muslim believer has the duty to 'enjoin what is good and forbid what is evil' and everybody is responsible for that as much as they can… How helpful we can be to people, both materially and morally...Trade in our day is money-driven but we are not very competitive people. Consequently, we wanted to 'enjoin good and forbid evil' while earning money. How can I do this as a Muslim believer? I can't pull a stranger out of his arm and say, 'Brother, fortune telling is forbidden in Islam'. But I can hang this warning here. In the end, we are Muslims and we have to earn and spend as we believe."

The cafe owner is attentive about warning the customers about fortune telling and says that they -as a staff- try not to be rude when they confront such a situation. They also pay attention to not using the word "prohibited" and try to warn those who tell fortune in a polite way saying that they disallow coffee fortune telling in the cafe.

The owner says that they also plan to put a warning about sitting within the frame of Islamic codes of conduct in the cafe, namely avoiding intimate relationships between males and females. He states that young people sometimes sit in an impudent way disturbing the others, especially the families with children. He says that they try to ensure that customers sit within the code of conduct and warn or send them if they are involved in an indecent act. He underlines that they have values and

[305] Cemil Yıldız, Gültekin Kaya, M. Kurtbay Önür, "Fallı Soyguna Dikkat", https://www.turkiyegazetesi.com.tr/Genel/a328483.aspx [16/05/2019].
[306] Pınar Tarcan, "Seansı 1000 TL'ye Falcıya Giden Var", http://www.gazetevatan.com/seansi-1000-tl-ye-falciya-giden-var-736190-pazar-vatan/ [16/05/2019].

they are a bit conservative in this respect. He states that they try to preserve these values at the expense of losing customers and says: "We keep our values at the forefront, and financial worries are in the background".

Warnings about coffee reading or sitting in accordance with Islamic codes of conduct sometimes create a tension and resistance from the customers. According to the accounts of the cafe owner, customers may get irritated after being warned about sitting properly and they say: "What age do we live in". The cafe owner says "there are people who do this not only among what we call 'modern' circles, but also conservative circles. This is valid for fortune telling issue as well". He states that they come across some customers who get angry with this, with the thought that "I pay on this, I do what I want" or vice versa, there are those who say "thank you, may god bless you, we never looked at it (coffee reading) from this point of view".

The cafe owners have sensitivities about warning people against coffee reading and take on responsibility as a believing Muslim by saying "if one person in a thousand obeys this and saves himself/herself, that's enough for us". He criticizes the way "religious" circles in Turkey behave and act, regardless of being male or female. He criticizes the conspicuous consumption on the part of conservative people in Turkey and expresses his disturbance by the fact that Muslims in Turkey got spoiled after rising to wealth:

> "They pay too much attention to fashion and show off…I think everyone should have a cause to live, anyone without a cause is a wally... I look at 'religious' people; they are without a cause... Unfortunately, there is a generation who lives for creating a mass of his/her own on Instagram or somewhere else...A Muslim can be rich but they should be modest. Money should be in the pocket not in the heart. Unfortunately we put it in our hearts...We have become a religious society living in order to consume...We can see it better here."

The cafe is closed during the Jumu'ah (Friday prayer). Friday is the holy day of Islam and it is not permitted in the Koran to work during the Jumu'ah.[307]

Çikolata & Kahve, standing as a venue addressing mostly to conservative people, offers opportunities for the socialization of conservative women outside their homes with its private rooms that allow for holding events such as gold days and birthday organizations. Similar to the Ottoman coffeehouses that functioned as a site of socialization for males who could not have the facilities at home to host their male

[307] "O you who have believed, when [the adhan] is called for the prayer on the day of Jumu'ah [Friday], then proceed to the remembrance of Allah and leave trade. That is better for you, if you only knew." Koran 62:9 http://corpus.quran.com/translation.jsp?chapter=62&verse=9

guests and prefer coffeehouses as a meeting ground with their friends, Çikolata & Kahve functions as a "third place"[308] especially for the conservative women.

4.2.4. Social Media Use and the Recognition of Çikolata & Kahve

As for the advertisement and social media use of the cafe, the cafe owner says that they just use Instagram as a social media platform. Currently, the Instagram page of the cafe has 17,100 followers and 608 posts.[309] Photos of the chocolates and beverages are shared on the Instagram page as well as the messages for the holy days of Islam such as Friday and eids. Photos of the customers have not been shared on Instagram.

During the month of Ramadan, the cafe serves after iftar till the suhoor, namely during the allowed eating hours in the month of Ramadan. However, the shop is open for the customers who want to buy chocolate during the day. This has been announced through a post on Instagram by the owners with a caption "Like every Ramadan in Çikolata & Kahve, we will not serve beverages before iftar during Ramadan, but our shop will be open for your chocolate package purchases, beverage service will start after iftar and continue until 2 a.m.".[310]

Some of the posts on the Instagram page of Çikolata & Kahve were shared with messages regarding the holy day of Muslims, that is Friday. Some of these posts were the photos of the cafe, photos of a natural or a historical view and photos of mosques with a caption "have a blessed Friday".[311] One of the posts is the video taken while the sound of the *azan*[312] was rising from a nearby mosque.[313] References to religious values have been manifested in several posts; one of them being the

[308] Ray Oldenburg, **The great good place: cafés, coffee shops, bookstores, bars, hair salons, and other hangouts at the heart of a community**, (Philadelphia: Da Capo Press, 1999), 16.
[309] Çikolata Kahve (@cikolatakahveistanbul), accessed June 15, 2019, https://www.instagram.com/cikolatakahveistanbul/.
[310] Çikolata Kahve (@cikolatakahveistanbul), "Çikolata & Kahve'de her ramazan olduğu gibi bu Ramazanı şerifte de iftar öncesi içecek servisimiz olmayacaktır", **Instagram photo**, May 25, 2017, https://www.instagram.com/p/BUglmudBnze/.
[311] Çikolata Kahve (@cikolatakahveistanbul), "Hayırlı Cuma", **Instagram photo**, April 28, 2017, https://www.instagram.com/p/BTbJ2NmBHU6/; Çikolata Kahve (@cikolatakahveistanbul), "Cuma Mübarek", **Instagram photo**, February 24, 2017, https://www.instagram.com/p/BQ41m1sBasl/.
[312] *Azan* is the call to prayer for Muslims.
[313] Çikolata Kahve (@cikolatakahveistanbul), "Hayırlı Cumalar", **Instagram video**, May 4, 2018, https://www.instagram.com/p/BiWgU3nhJLb/.

video entitled “Jerusalem is the harem of the Muslim believers”[314] taken from a Turkish TV series *Payitaht Abdülhamit*.[315]

Although they have an active Instagram page, the cafe owner states that the popularity of the cafe spreads by word of mouth and “everything flows naturally”.

Çikolata & Kahve, with its design, atmosphere and emphasis on religious and cultural values is a place where mostly people with religious sensitivity spend time and enjoy themselves. However, the cafe owner points out that everyone who wants to share his/her inner world with them are welcomed and if a person can relate to this place, it doesn’t matter conservative or not, he/she leaves there happily.

4.3. Nevmekân: “a Wisdom Project”

4.3.1. Physical Properties and Atmosphere of Nevmekân

Nevmekân is a book cafe situated in the same complex with Bağlarbaşı Congress and Culture Center, in Bağlarbaşı, Üsküdar. It is owned by the state and belongs to Üsküdar municipality. The site of the cafe was once used as bus garage, tramway depot and transport museum, and later on transformed into a book cafe in 2015 as one of Üsküdar municipality's social responsibility projects. According to the accounts of the business manager of Nevmekân Bağlarbaşı, the cafe is the prototype of *kıraathane* (book cafe) in Turkey. The purpose in designing such a cafe is to provide students and the other customers with the facility to both read their books and have some food and drinks at a reasonable price. Not only Turkish cuisine but also food from the world cuisine is provided to the customers on their demand.

The cafe was restored without ruining its historic fabric. Ottoman and Turkish motifs are dominant in its decoration. At the entrance of the cafe, there is a model tram with the names of two neighbourhoods in İstanbul written in Arabic: Beşiktaş and Karaköy. There are candlesticks on the walls and huge chandeliers on the ceiling of the building. Green and yellow colors are dominant in the design of the cafe. There are many objects that have Islamic connotations such as the paintings and ornaments with whirling dervishes, Ottoman figures et cetera. A mystical

[314] Çikolata Kahve (@cikolatakahveistanbul), “ Kudüs Müminlerin Haremidir”, **Instagram video**, May 18, 2018, https://www.instagram.com/p/Bi7bG2eHxre/.
[315] *Payitaht Abdülhamid* is a Turkish TV series about the fight of Abdülhamit II to keep Ottoman Empire and Caliphate alive. It has been broadcasted in Turkish state channel TRT since 2017. “Payitaht Abdülhamid”, https://www.imdb.com/title/tt6536562/ [16.06.2019].

atmosphere is created with books, dim light and relaxing music. The windows are half-round shaped like those of the mosques. There exists a special corner on the second floor of the cafe that is used for hosting Turkish statesmen. The cafe manager says that although this corner is reserved for statesmen, they do not prevent anyone wishing to use that area.

The cafe manager says that they try to play instrumental music that can address to everyone and try to play Turkish music predominantly. Turkish classical music, instrumental music with violin or the reed flute is played in general. The cafe manager states that they do not prefer playing mere Sufi music because it is does not strike everybody's fancy.

The menu is quite rich in content; breakfast, meals, desserts and beverages are available. The menu starts with a description of the cafe with an emphasis on the functions of the cafe as a meeting point in order to sustain the intellectual, literary and artistic values by saying "Nevmekân is a wisdom project". Regional and national values are underlined and this cafe is seen as a place to establish a setting in order to preserve these values. The menu gives special importance to Turkish coffee and Ottoman sherbet. In the menu, there is a page on the consumption of coffee in the Ottoman palace and the short history of Ottoman sherbet.

4.3.2. Customer Profile

Customer group of Nevmekân mostly consists of students, academics, writers and families with children. According to the manager of the cafe, conservative people prefer to visit Nevmekân as it is a place that belongs to Üsküdar municipality (the JDP municipality) and as they feel comfortable and peaceful in Nevmekân.

When I asked about the customer profile of the cafe, the cafe manager stated that initially, conservative customers were visiting this place mostly, but now people from different circles visit Nevmekân although conservatives are still predominant. He states that conservative customers visit Nevmekân since they find it reliable in terms of its appropriateness to Islamic orders and its decency. He says that "conservative customers pay attention to the hygiene, the ingredients of the food served and halal food, they sometimes ask about the brand of the meat or chicken…but they trust here". According to the statements of the cafe manager, not only people with a conservative background, but also people from other social

backgrounds visit the cafe despite some prejudices. The cafe manager says “people who are coming from different backgrounds, other than conservative backgrounds, come here with some prejudices since this place belongs to the municipality (of the JDP) ...But in the end we have customers from all walks of life”.

He evaluates the fact that they attract customers from different views as a positive thing and says: “I think it's a good thing for the municipality to attract both sides (seculars and conservatives). Eventually, this place belongs to the JDP municipality but it should be realized that such things can happen, beautiful things are done”. In this sense, it can be said that Nevmekân stands in a position where people from different social and political backgrounds may come together, not only those who are identified as conservatives.

The cafe manager highlights the proposition that conservative customers should not be evaluated with stereotypes and may have different requests other than what they are supposed to have. He states that their conservative customers sometimes ask for a certain type of coffee like those of Starbucks, which shows how they are influenced by global trends. Another example given by the cafe manager was about the music preferences. He says: “We have conservative customers but they do not always want Sufi music to be played. They have also different preferences. We should not look at the issue that way. They may have different requests”.

4.3.3. Distinct Features of Nevmekân

The cafe manager emphasizes that Nevmekân, other than being just a cafe, is the social responsibility project of Üsküdar municipality. That’s why it is in the book cafe format and aims to provide social service to especially university students. The most prominent feature of Nevmekân is that it is an ideal place for its customers for spending long hours to study because of its book cafe format. Especially students spend long hours in Nevmekân because of its format and it does not create pressure on the customers, which make them feel comfortable during their stay.

There is a special area in the cafe for voluntary service activities. There are some items to be sold in this area for the children in need as part of this voluntary service. They also help visually impaired people or cancer patients within the scope

of this social responsibility project. So, the importance given to social responsibility projects distinguishes Nevmekân from the others.

4.3.4. Social Media Use and the Recognition of Nevmekân

The cafe manager sets forth that Nevmekân owes its popularity mostly to its customers. People who visit the cafe are quite effective in the rising popularity of it. He states that people shared Nevmekân on social media a lot and it showed up on TV, that's why it is a quite busy cafe. Also, Üsküdar municipality has been instrumental in the use of media to attract customers to Nevmekân since the media organs of the municipality help increase the popularity of the cafe. Nevmekân appears on the official website of Üsküdar municipality (www.uskudar.bel.tr) on a frequent basis. News regarding the opening of the cafe,[316] the announcement of an art exhibition,[317] visits of the statesmen (those who are members of the JDP)[318] and a seminar given by Esra Albayrak[319] (the daughter of President Erdoğan who is also the head of the running party) are some of the examples that are shared on the official website of Üsküdar municipality.

Other than the media organs of Üsküdar municipality, mainstream media organs also mentioned Nevmekân; a news report in *Sabah*, a progovernment mainstream newspaper in Turkey, mentions the cafe with the heading "Old Bus Garage is now the Place of Art".[320] The cafe attracts attention as being a favored venue for the conservatives as seen in an article published on a web page on women and life. Under the heading "Places where the Conservative Circles Socialize", Nevmekân is mentioned as:

> "With its nostalgic atmosphere, Nevmekân is one of the places conservative young people spend most of their time and it has become a favorite among university students. Nevmekân has been one of the most preferred cafes on the Anatolian Side since its opening. Nevmekân,

[316] "Üsküdarlıların 'Nev'mekanı' Açıldı", https://www.uskudar.bel.tr/tr/main/news/uskudarlilarin-Nevmekâni-acildi/415 [29/05/2019].
[317] ""At'nağme-Atlar ve Hatlar" Sergisi Üsküdar Nevmekânda Ziyarete Açıldı", https://www.uskudar.bel.tr/tr/main/news/atnagme-atlar-ve-hatlar-sergisi-uskudar-nevme/439 [29/05/2019].
[318] "Nevmekân Başbakan Ahmet Davutoğlu'nu Ağırladı", https://www.uskudar.bel.tr/tr/main/news/Nevmekân-basbakan-ahmet-davutoglunu-agirladi/418 [29/05/2019].
[319] "Dr. Esra Albayrak'ın Katılımlarıyla "28 Şubatta Aslında Ne Oldu?" Semineri Nevmekân Bağlarbaşında Gerçekleştirildi", http://www.uskudar.bel.tr/tr/main/foto/dr-esra-albayrakin-katilimlariyla-28-subatta/1314 [29/05/2019].
[320] "Eski Otobüs Garajı Şimdi Sanatın Mekanı", https://www.sabah.com.tr/pazar/2017/11/26/eski-otobus-garaji-simdi-sanatin-mekani [29/05/2019].

which hosts the most beautiful conversations, with its decoration completed with books and the fresh air, seems to continue to be one of the most popular cafes of Üsküdar."[321]

Its appearance on the media has increased the popularity of the café. Another factor affecting the popularity of Nevmekân is its being located next to Bağlarbaşı Culture Center. A lot of activities took place in Bağlarbaşı Culture Center such as theatre plays, cinema, concerts and exhibitions, which naturally affect the dynamism of the cafe. Therefore, Nevmekân, other than being a book cafe, has become home to activities such as concerts, book launches, book signing events, exhibitions and interviews with writers, poets, journalists and statesmen.

The official Instagram page of the cafe has 9.374 followers and 267 posts currently.[322] Mostly, the events to be held in the cafe are shared on the Instagram page as well as the customer views and opinions about the cafe. Activities such as an interview with a Turkish author İskender Pala,[323] an origami exhibition[324] and concerts by Sedat Anar[325] and Anatolian Quartet[326] are announced on the Instagram page of Nevmekân.

4.4. Mihrimah Kahve: "Our Values"

4.4.1. Physical Properties and Atmosphere of Mihrimah Kahve

Mihrimah Kahve is located in Üsküdar, next to Valide-i Cedid Mosque. The cafe is located in a central place, in the heart of Üsküdar. It was originally located next to Mihrimah Mosque in 2014, so it was named after Mihrimah mosque. Then they moved the cafe to its current place. However, the owners kept the name of the cafe the same after its relocation. It is owned by private individuals and it has four co-partners at present.

---

[321] "Muhafazakâr Kesimin Sosyalleştikleri Mekanlar", http://www.yasemin.com/yasam/haber/2686684-muhafazakâr-kesimin-sosyallestikleri-mekanlar [25/05/2019].
[322] Nevmekân (@nev_mekan), accessed June 24, 2019, https://www.instagram.com/nev_mekan/
[323] Nevmekân (@nev_mekan), "Prof. Dr. İskender Pala ile taze kitap kokusu", **Instagram photo**, February 4, 2019, https://www.instagram.com/p/Btdmb3_hpJ9/.
[324] Nevmekân (@nev_mekan), "Japon Kültür Haftası kapsamında Origami ve Sumi-E sergimiz 7 Mayıs'a kadar devam edecektir", **Instagram photo**, May 1, 2016, https://www.instagram.com/p/BE3AE5oxeKy/.
[325] Nevmekân (@nev_mekan), "Cumartesi akşamı Sedat Anar Nevmekân'da", **Instagram photo**, April 15, 2016, https://www.instagram.com/p/BEN5_zeReF8/.
[326] Nevmekân (@nev_mekan), "Anatolian Quartet bu Cumartesi akşamı Nevmekân'da", **Instagram photo,** April 6, 2016, https://www.instagram.com/p/BD2lKNMxeC6/.

The cafe is designed in a classical Ottoman architectural style and keeps Ottoman culture authentic in its atmosphere. The cafe owners describe the atmosphere of the cafe as "nostalgic" and pay special attention to details that reflect the traces of Ottoman culture, which is definitely the distinctive feature of this cafe among others in İstanbul according to its owners. The general setting of the cafe resembles that of mosques. The ceiling has some small domes in some parts, which were delicately ornamented. The walls of the cafe are covered with paintings that depict the Ottoman İstanbul and especially Üsküdar. And there are some photographs of the Ottoman times depicting soldiers and people who spend time in coffeehouses. Besides, there are different kinds of paintings such as miniatures and oil paintings. Also, there is a religious ornament (hilya sharif) on one of the inner walls of the cafe describing characteristics of Islamic prophet Muhammad. Brown, green and dark red colors are predominantly used in the cafe. There is a special smoking area that is covered with trees. There is no special prayer room as the cafe stands next to a historical mosque.

In harmony with the atmosphere, Turkish classical music and Sufi music is played in the background. When there are a lot of customers in the cafe, music stops so that people can chat and have fun, not being disturbed by loud music. Owners try to make sure that people are comfortable and continue their *muhabbet* (friendly conversation).

On each table there are books and the name of each table is named after famous writers or philosophers, all being male. Some of these are Necip Fazıl Kısakürek, Sezai Karakoç, Erdem Bayazıt, Cemil Meriç, Mehmet Akif Ersoy, Cahit Zarifoğlu, Nurettin Topçu, Itri, Malcolm X, İbn Haldun and Aristoteles. The rationale behind putting books on the tables is to encourage people to read printed books as a challenge to today's digital culture. The owners try to present the books of famous Turkish writers in order to create a collective literary memory. Although there are Western thinkers like Aristoteles, most of the writers come from conservative backgrounds, which is obviously an intended preference in line with the conservative worldview of the cafe owners. The owners sometimes ask some questions about the writers whose names are given to the table the customers sit, which creates a genuine interaction between the owners and the customers.

Spiritual atmosphere of Üsküdar is a significant reason why the owners chose the setting in the first place. Unlike neighbourhoods such as Kadıköy and Beşiktaş, Üsküdar stands out as a place where predominantly conservative people reside and this has influenced their decision on the setting of the cafe as the cafe owner states. The cafe serves food from the world cuisine, not just coffee. However, coffee is at the forefront among other beverages or food.

The cafe owners define the atmosphere of the cafe as "homelike" and say that they try to make people feel comfortable as if they were in their homes.

4.4.2. Customer Profile

Cultural elements and values are given special importance in this cafe. Hence, the cafe owners think that their customer mass is shaped in accordance with these values as expressed in the quote:

> "As we try to keep our culture alive, we attract customers that pay attention to these values...If you look carefully, generally conservative people come here. This cafe is among the places preferred by people who have a cause in life; social democrats and leftists are coming too, as well as the conservatives."

University teachers, professors, artists, movie makers, directors and scenarists are among the customers as well as university students and families. Actually this is a place where people from all walks of life may come regardless of their dispositions or sects according to the accounts of the owner.

4.4.3. Distinct Features of Mihrimah Kahve

The cafe owner states that due to the fact that conservative customers are in majority in Mihrimah Kahve, they pay special importance to some issues such as providing a "decent" atmosphere where people behave in certain boundaries of intimacy. He says "since we are also conservative, we put ourselves into their (conservative customers') shoes, if there is something that we don't want to meet when we go to a cafe, we try not to have that thing here".

That's why he says that they pay ultimate attention to every detail from the music to the behavior patterns of the staff, which makes the cafe a reason for preference for families. The cafe owner further states that families do not feel comfortable in some public places not only in terms of noise but also for moral reasons. The cafe owners solve problems regarding moral issues as expressed below:

> "Especially cafes provide young people opportunities for doing whatever they do not dare to do when they are with their families or in the street, however we do not tolerate behaviours such as extremely intimate interactions between couples in no way, which makes us a reason for preference among conservatives. In such cases we talk to these customers one-to-one by telling them that our cafe has an 'identity' and ask them to act according to this 'identity' politely."

In accordance with its emphasis on cultural values, the cafe includes Ottoman sherbets in its menu and they try not to include fizzy drinks in the menu although young people generally prefer ice-tea or coke.

When setting the cafe working hours, they take important days and times in Islam into consideration. For instance, the cafe does not serve food or drinks (although it is open) during the Jumu'ah since it is not allowed in Islam to work during that time span. During the month of Ramadan, the cafe is open after the iftar (the time when Muslims break their fast) and during the suhoor time (pre-dawn eating time).

Apart from serving food or drinks, Mihrimah Kahve is home to different activities such as language courses and job interviews. The cafe meets the demands of the authors to meet with their readers and organize book-signing events. The cafe owners state that they pay particular attention to reading, that's why there are not only books but also magazines on literature, art, cinema and children in the cafe.

Another function of Mihrimah Kahve is that it is sometimes used as an extension of private houses as stated by the cafe owners:

> "Houses become smaller and cafes increase in number today. Meetings and honouring the guests, even gold days took place in such places, that's why these places (cafes) gain importance. Unfortunately people don't want to honour their guests at home today. Therefore, we wanted to open a place that is in harmony with our own culture."

Its emphasis on culture and cultural values is what distinguishes Mihrimah Kahve from others. When asked about their difference from global coffee chains, the owners regard global coffee chains not as an economic structure, but as a result of the outcomes of a culture war, claiming that the West is spreading its culture to the countries it will exploit with such companies. They do not even compare Mihrimah Kahve with such cafes and say, "we have different concerns (implying that Mihrimah Kahve aims to preserve cultural values rather than having economic concerns)...It's not all about money, we try to revive our culture and values here".

The cafe owners state that although the cafe has a conservative atmosphere, they try to refrain from polarizing people and welcome everyone.

4.4.4. Social Media Use and the Recognition of Mihrimah Kahve

As regards to the social media use, the owners of the cafe state that they use social media but emphasize that in general people visit Mihrimah Kahve on recommendation. Therefore, those who visit the cafe, if they like it, are influential in attracting other people there.

The cafe has an Instagram page that has 9.251 followers and 266 posts according to the current state.[327] Instagram sharings of the cafe mostly consists of food, books and casual moments of the customers. Activities to be held in the cafe are announced via Instagram posts such as the *ney* (reed flute) concert[328] happening every Monday. As well as the activities, posts celebrating holy days such as Friday, holy nights and and religious festivals are shared on Instagram. Furthermore, emphasis on history and traditionality has been manifested through the posts. Photo of a flamboyantly ornamented pitcher and a coffee pot behind has been shared with a caption "…We exhibit our traditional works all around Mihrimah Kahve".[329] Another photo shows delicate glass jars filled with spices; the caption under the post says: "…In the unique atmosphere of Mihrimah, you will find the reflections of old İstanbul".[330] Likewise, Ottoman sherbet, one of the elements what makes Mihrimah Kahve special, has been put forward on the Instagram page with a caption indicating the importance of sherbet for the Ottomans, "In every Ottoman house, sherbet was the most important treat that should always be offered to the guests who visit unexpectedly".[331] As it is seen, references to the Ottoman past can be seen via social media account of the cafe.

After analyzing posts in detail, it was seen that *muhabbet* (friendly conversation) stands as a frequent theme underlined through the captions written

[327] MİHRİMAH Kahve (@mihrimah.kahve), June 24, 2019, https://www.instagram.com/mihrimah.kahve/.
[328] MİHRİMAH Kahve, (@mihrimah.kahve), "Mihrimah Kahve'de her Pazartesi 19.00-22.00 arası ney dinletisine bekleriz efendim", **Instagram video**, April 17, 2017, https://www.instagram.com/p/BS_g26uDdi8/.
[329] MİHRİMAH Kahve, (@mihrimah.kahve), "Her bir sanat eseri insanını kendi ufku ve dünyası içinde dağıtır ve yetiştirir. Mihrimah Kahve'nin dört bir yanında geleneksel eserlerimizi sergiliyoruz", **Instagram photo**, November 15, 2018, https://www.instagram.com/p/BqM6U49hGXT/.
[330] MİHRİMAH Kahve, (@mihrimah.kahve), "Bizden detaylar…Mihrimah'ın eşsiz atmosferinde, eski İstanbul'un yansımalarını bulacaksınız dostlar", **Instagram photo**, April 9, 2019, https://www.instagram.com/p/BwB4LR4B8eR/.
[331] MİHRİMAH Kahve, (@mihrimah.kahve), "Osmanlı'da şerbet her evde her zaman ansızın gelen misafire sunulması gereken en önemli ikram idi", **Instagram photo**, August 13, 2018, https://www.instagram.com/p/Bmar6jPg_sS/.

under the posts: “Mihrimah Kahve’s foamy, delicious coffees are cooked with *muhabbet*”,[332] “The heart desires neither coffee nor a coffeehouse, the heart desires *muhabbet*, coffee is simply an excuse”,[333] “Spoken words fly away, *muhabbet* remains”.[334]

4.5. Huqqa: “the Reina of the Conservatives”

4.5.1. Physical Properties and Atmosphere of Huqqa

Huqqa was opened in 2013 in Beşiktaş, İstanbul. Cihan Kamer, a well-known Turkish businessman, owns the cafe. It is located in Kuruçeşme, an area with a lot of entertainment venues. It has branches other than Kuruçeşme in different parts of İstanbul and Turkey, and even abroad. Domestic branches of Huqqa are located in Ankara, Gaziantep, Bodrum and İstanbul. Foreign branches are in Dubai, Iraqi and Oman and Qatar. Huqqa intends to open more branches abroad, especially in Arab countries upon the growing interest of Arabs in the cafe.

Huqqa comes into prominence as being an alcohol-free cafe in an area surrounded by the most popular nightclubs of İstanbul. As well as being alcohol-free, the cafe has facilities for praying with prayer rooms for men and women, an unusual case for the venues in that specific area. It is a two-storey cafe; the first floor is used as a cafe while there are VIP rooms on the second floor allocated for meetings and activities. The cafe has a modern design and is equipped with technological means such as large screen TVs and tablet menus. Huqqa has a concept that blends the East and the West both in its decoration and menu. Geometric patterns and pastel colors are in the foreground in the design of the cafe. There is a wide range of options for eating and drinking in Huqqa and it presents its customers with different tastes from local and international cuisine. The menu includes local food from different regions of Turkey such as *ıslama köftesi* (meatball) from Adapazarı, Afyon soujouk, homemade jams from Antalya, extracted flower honey from the uplands of Eastern Black Sea and cheese from Thrace Region. Besides local food, Huqqa offers food

[332] MİHRİMAH Kahve, (@mihrimah.kahve), “Mihrimah Kahve’nin bol köpüklü, lezzetli kahveleri muhabbet ile pişer, yanına güzel bir kitapla harika gider...”, **Instagram photo**, February 7, 2019, https://www.instagram.com/p/Btk8t4nhAyO/.
[333] MİHRİMAH Kahve, (@mihrimah.kahve), “Gönül ne kahve ister, ne kahvehane, gönül muhabbet ister kahve bahane”, **Instagram**, May 28, 2019, https://www.instagram.com/p/ByAjaC1hqOK/.
[334] MİHRİMAH Kahve, (@mihrimah.kahve), “Söz uçar, muhabbet kalır”, **Instagram photo**, May 20, 2019, https://www.instagram.com/p/BxsPmfrF5KB/.

from international cuisine such as philly cheese steak sandwich from California cuisine, Cajun chicken finger, beef nachos, quinoa tabouli salad, Milano saltimbocca, and oreo cheesecake.

In the background music of the cafe, Western, upbeat music rather than slow music is played in order to raise the customers' energy according to the accounts of human resources assistant of the cafe.

4.5.2. Customer Profile

After interviewing with the human resources assistant of Huqqa on customer profile, I was informed that Arab customers constitute a large part of the customers of Huqqa. When I asked about the reason for this, she made the following explanation:

> "Arabs are fond of eating and show off and our visual shows are at the maximum level here. We pay attention to how we serve the food here. Hookah is also a tempting element for them. However, we do not just aim to address Arab customers. We host 'a-plus' customers as well as European customers but Arab customers are a bit more than the others in number."

Leading businessmen, well-known people as well as the ordinary people constitute the customer profile of Huqqa. The human resources assistant points out that people from all social strata visit Huqqa and it did not intend to appeal to a particular group of people from the very beginning. They have a welcoming attitude towards their customers and prefer to call them not as "customers" but as "guests" like all the other cafes in this study.

4.5.3. Distinct Features of Huqqa

Huqqa is located in an area where modern and secular life practices take place, yet it does not serve alcoholic beverages unlike the cafes/restaurants in that area. Non-alcoholic cocktails and mojitos are attention getting in the menu of Huqqa.

The name of the cafe –Huqqa- comes from Arabic, meaning "hookah", namely"a tobacco pipe of Near Eastern origin with a long, flexible tube by which the smoke is drawn through a jar of water and thus cooled".[335] Hookah is given special importance in the cafe; there is even a special hookah coordinator who just deals with producing special formulas for hookah and there is a special team on it. Therefore, hookah is considered as an essential element of the place.

[335] "Hookah", https://www.dictionary.com/browse/hookah [20.05.2019].

Another feature that distinguishes Huqqa from others is their use of tablets for the menu. In my interview with the human resources assistant, she stated that they prefer a tablet menu rather than a written one in order to make their work easier and also since technology attracts people, using tablets for menu is impressive for their guests.

4.5.4. Social Media Use and the Recognition of Huqqa

Huqqa has social media accounts such as Instagram, Twitter and Facebook. According to what is stated during the interview, there is a specialist in Huqqa who is responsible for managing social media accounts, so they use social media very actively and studiously. The Instagram page of the cafe has 81,100 followers and 1.733 posts currently.[336] Food and beverages as well as the moments of the customers are shared on the official Instagram page of the cafe. They sometimes share photos of stylishly dressed young women wearing headscarf posing with a smiling face.

Huqqa is open during the month of Ramadan. They have special menus for iftar and suhoor, therefore post photos of these menus. These menu presentations emphasize visuality and taste: "We wait for you in Huqqa for an iftar that will not only appeal to your taste buds but also delight your eyes".[337] They claim to be the best address not only for iftar but also for suhoor with a post shared on their official Instagram page: "The best address of iftar and suhoor in Istanbul with a carefully prepared menu".[338] Huqqa not only shares iftar and suhoor menu posts, but also post a video celebrating Eid al-Fitr (Ramadan feast) of the Muslims.[339]

Huqqa is more than a cafe/restaurant and provides facilities for activities such as birthday parties, baby shower parties and even movie premiers.

Huqqa, being located in Kurucesme near nightclubs such as Reina and Sortie, became the center of attention of Turkish media as a non-alcoholic cafe having prayer rooms when it was opened in 2013. It was mentioned in the press as "the cafe

[336] Huqqa (@huqqa), accessed June 24, 2019, https://www.instagram.com/huqqa/.
[337] Huqqa (@huqqa), "Sadece damaklarınızın değil, aynı zamanda gözlerinizin de mest olacağı bir iftar için Huqqa'ya bekliyoruz", **Instagram photo**, May 28, 2019, https://www.instagram.com/p/ByAOsPxHT2i/.
[338] Huqqa (@huqqa), "Sahurda da adres", **Instagram video**, May 22, 2019, https://www.instagram.com/p/BxvZgCHl5TV/
[339] Huqqa (@huqqa), "Her gününüzün bayram tadında geçmesi dileğiyle…Herkese mutluluk dolu bir bayram dileriz", **Instagram video**, June 3, 2019, https://www.instagram.com/p/ByQWsT0BP5h/

of conservative bohemian bourgeois"[340] or "the Reina of conservative bourgeoisie".[341]

Kuruçeşme is an area where mostly upper segments of the society live and entertain in İstanbul. There are luxury restaurants and favorite places for entertainment. Hence, the opening of a cafe that sells alcohol-free drinks and have prayer room facilities aroused interest in the media. The columnists[342] draw attention to "backgammon", "hookah", "alcohol-free mojito", "tablet menu", "prayer rooms" and "women wearing headscarf" in their descriptions of Huqqa. Onur Baştürk, the columnist of the newspaper *Hürriyet*, says that hookah is the alcohol of the cafe and regards Huqqa as an alternative to Reina and Sortie as a "luxury hookah bar" [343] in his column in the newspaper in 2013, just after the opening of the cafe. Besides, he draws attention to sporty girls wearing headscarf smoking their hookahs and the boys who play backgammon.[344] He, looking at the luxury cars in front of the cafe, infers that daughters and sons of upper class conservatives hang out in Huqqa.[345]

The owner of Huqqa, Cihan Kamer who is a well-known Turkish businessman explains how Huqqa emerged in one of his interviews for a newspaper as in the quote:

> "This place was interpreted as addressing conservative people because of being non-alcoholic and having prayer rooms. However, we decided at this concept with commercial concerns because there are dozens of places on this line that serve alcoholic beverages. But there is no alcohol-free place. There is not a luxury venue that both serves alcohol-free beverages and has a good cuisine and service. As we have seen a need for this, we decided to create this concept. Therefore, Huqqa is not just a place for conservative people. Both conservatives and non-conservatives come here. So Huqqa is a complete mix …"[346]

Actually, Cihan Kamer is uncomfortable with Huqqa being attributed to a particular group of people, namely conservatives. On the contrary, he wants Huqqa to be a ground that draws people from all walks of life together.[347] He highlights the

---

[340] Onur Baştürk, "Şampanyalı Lucca'dan Nargileli Huqqa'ya" http://www.hurriyet.com.tr/sampanyali-lucca-dan-nargileli-huqqa-ya-23194222 [06.04.2019].
[341] Işıl Cinmen, "Muhafazakâr Burjuvazinin Reina'sı" https://www.haberturk.com/gundem/haber/863812-muhafazakâr-burjuvazinin-reinasi# [06.04.2019].
[342] Cinmen, **ibid**; Selin Aksel, "Huqqa Alkolsüz Gece Kulübü mü?" https://www.sabah.com.tr/aktuel/2013/09/27/huqqa-alkolsuz-gece-kulubu-mu [06.04.2019].
[343] Baştürk, **ibid**.
[344] Playing backgammon is a typical scene in a hookah cafe.
[345] **ibid.**
[346] Eylem Türk, "'İçkisiz' Zincir Geliyor" http://www.milliyet.com.tr/-ickisiz-zincir-geliyor/ekonomi/detay/1714177/default.htm [06.04.2019].
[347] "Kendisi de Bilmez ama İçkisiz Huqqa Fikri Murat Ülker'den", https://www.aksam.com.tr/ekonomi/kendisi-de-bilmez-ama-ickisiz-huqqa-fikri-murat-ulkerden/haber-209620 [06.04.2019].

importance that they put on binding people from different social circles together in the following quote:

> "You don't have to be conservative to go to a place that is alcohol-free. I want people to get closer to each other. Hijabi or not, people coexist peacefully. Women wearing headscarf are not able to go to many places on the Bosphorus, even if they go, they don't feel that they belong in these places. Let everyone has a place to go and socialize. We should be able to live together in this country. You should also have luxury at affordable prices."[348]

It is also stated by some columnists that Huqqa is a place not only for conservative customers but also for people from all walks of life. Çağrı Bilgin, in his column in the newspaper *Posta,* says "wearing headscarf or not, they are having a good time together. Girls wearing headscarf sitting at one of the tables, girls with short skirts and high-heeled shoes at another table. They sit at the same table, too and even girls and boys together".[349]

Drawing upon the debates, Huqqa can be said to be the place of encounter of people from different circles. Actually, they realized this by opening a room for the conservatives who want to access the blessings that seculars enjoy: having an "a-plus" quality time in a cafe enjoying the view of the Bosphorus.

4.6. Conservative Cafes in Quest for Authenticity

Authenticity stands out among the objectives of Çikolata & Kahve, Nevmekân and Mihrimah Kahve in constructing their identity; the owners/managers of these cafes seem to aspire to revive both Ottoman and Islamic traditions and styles. Arabic writings, paintings depicting Ottoman daily life, calligraphy works, Ottoman sherbets and general look of the cafes are reminiscent of the Ottoman past of Turkey. Such visual elements say a lot about interpreting a space as highlighted by Kömeçoğlu:

> "Understanding the verbal and non-verbal sign systems are of great importance in the analysis of any space. While Islamic greeting forms, poems, common cult names such as Sezai Karakoç, Necip Fazıl, İsmet Özel form verbal sign systems; hookahs, amateur art photographs, calligraphy and marbling art works, historical spatiality of the table cloths and madrasahs, columns, porticoes, sofas, low straw stools, rugs, pictures of the old Muslim cities and so on form non-verbal sign systems. Decor, furnitures, design including physical arrangement, and other background materials often support a scene set for demonstrating human behavior. In the cafes where the Islamic participants keep going, the production of the space includes these verbal and non-verbal systems and integrates them into an Islamic texture."[350]

---

[348] Çağrı Bilgin, "Alkole Gerek Yok Ortam Sarhoş Ediyor", https://www.posta.com.tr/alkole-gerek-yok-ortam-sarhos-ediyor-189658 [06.04.2019].
[349] Bilgin, **ibid.**
[350] Kömeçoğlu, 2003, **ibid**, 55.

Non-verbal systems of signs give some clues about claims to authenticity as can be seen in the cafe names: "Nevmekân" and "Mihrimah Kahve". The word "nev" is of Persian origin meaning "new" and the word "mekân" is of Arabic origin meaning "place" and they together form the name of the cafe, which can be interpreted as a reference to the languages spoken in the Ottoman times. Likewise, Mihrimah Kahve also has some references to the Ottoman past of Turkey since "Mihrimah" is the name of the daughter of Ottoman Sultan Süleyman, also the name given to a historical mosque constructed in Üsküdar during the reign of Sultan Süleyman.

Ottoman sherbet is another item that is given special importance in Çikolata & Kahve, Nevmekân and Mihrimah Kahve. It is served with coffee in Çikolata & Kahve, being among the limited number of beverages of the cafe. Nevmekân includes sherbet among a whole range of food and beverages in its menu and spares a whole page in the menu that gives information about the history of Ottoman sherbets. In Mihrimah Kahve, the cafe owner says that they especially offer sherbets to their customers on their demands of fizzy drinks; also the cafe includes 8 different Ottoman palace sherbets in its menu.

Calligraphy and marbling works as well as paintings depicting Ottoman social life are among the items used in the decoration of these three cafes, which shows the dominance of Ottoman and Islamic motifs there.

Drawing upon the items that have roots in Islam or in the Ottoman past, it can be said that these cafes have a claim to authenticity and reviving the past and traditions as well as conforming to modern day. Seeing 'authentic' elements in the aforementioned cafes, it can be inferred that these cafes as well as being a place to eat and drink, also function as a site where Islamic identity and conservative values are demonstrated through "verbal and non-verbal systems of signs", which are instrumental tools in interpreting a space as stated by Lefebvre.[351]

As for Huqqa, the importance attached to hookah can be regarded as a reference to authenticity; however, Huqqa distinguishes from the other three cafes with its general appearance and international atmosphere. Whereas the other cafes are blended with a traditional touch in terms of their decoration and food, Huqqa

[351] Lefebvre, **ibid**, 131.

strikes as a cafe openly standing between tradition and modernity, local and global, conservative and secular.

4.7. Values versus Financial Concerns

In the cases of Çikolata & Kahve, Nevmekân and Mihrimah Kahve, the cafe owners and managers emphasize values pushing financial concerns into the background.

In Çikolata & Kahve, the emphasis on values is manifested in two forms, first in their relations with their customers and secondly in their attention to "preserve Islamic values". The owner of the cafe during the interview expresses that in their relations with the customers, they pay attention to having a sincere and trust-based relationship hence prefers to use the word "guest" rather than "customer". He highlights that having a sincere relationship with the customers make him feel more satisfied than earning a lot of money. Being able to establish bonds of love with the customers, he claims that they try to keep a genuine connection with them as opposed to the formality of contemporary relationships.

Being in compliance with Islamic values is another point of concern on the part of Çikolata & Kahve. The cafe owners do not look with favor on coffee fortune telling, an exercise that has no place in Islam. Even though they face problems and discontentedness about this issue on the part of the customers, the cafe owners are sensitive about fortune telling and stick to their principles at the expense of losing customers. Furthermore, they pay regard to and advise Islamic codes of behaviour in the cafe and try to ensure that the customers act within this frame.

Mihrimah Kahve is sensitive about preserving values. Preserving historical, traditional and cultural values were highlighted many times by the cafe owner during the interview. The Ottoman past, namely Ottoman traditions and values are regarded crucial and Mihrimah Kahve tries to revive and sustain these values. As part of foregrounding these values, particular importance is given to introducing important figures in "our history", namely socially prominent writers, intellectuals and philosophers, as well as their works through the books and magazines left on the tables.

The importance attributed to authentic items in Mihrimah Kahve is a manifestation of placing emphasis on cultural values as expressed by the cafe owner; for instance when he is talking of sherbet, he takes it as a cultural value to be protected. Therefore, cultural values are maintained through underlining authenticity and reminding of literary and intellectual figures (mostly of Islamic circles).

Nevmekân, different from the other cafes in this study, belongs to Üsküdar municipality. Hence, the effects of the political discourse of Üsküdar JDP municipality that underline "regional and national values" are strongly felt in Nevmekân, even in its menu. On the introductory page of the menu, the aims of Nevmekân are stated as:

> "Maintaining our literary, art and intellectual life in a qualified way,
> Bringing our national values from local to global,
> Establishing a setting of art and conversation based on wisdom,
> Highlighting the cultural identity of Üsküdar that pioneer our civilization"

As well as underlining regional and national values, the cafe lays emphasis on social service. As the cafe manager states, providing a safe and comfortable atmosphere especially for the university students to read and study is one of the biggest motives in the emergence of Nevmekân as a social responsibility project. Thereupon, the cafe manager points out this dimension of the cafe as:

> "...Other private cafes may not tolerate people who want to sit for long hours, especially because of commercial concerns but we don't think about it as Üsküdar Municipality, we try to support students. We are not interested in the commercial dimension of it, rather we prioritize 'social service' here..."

When it comes to Huqqa, its owner and manager see Huqqa as a "unifying" place.[352] It unifies not only secular and conservative circles of the society but also blends the influences of the East and the West in its decoration and food.

4.8. Conservative Cafes as a Means of Claiming Space in Modern Public Life

Space-human relationship is a reciprocal one; not only human beings shape space but also they are shaped by it. The preference of a certain place by certain groups of people indicates a certain degree of overlap of the identity of the space and those who join that specific space. Lefebvre points out the relationship between space and actors:

[352] Cinmen, **ibid**.

> "Every space is already in place before the appearance in it of actors; these actors are collective as well as individual subjects inasmuch as the individuals are always members of groups or classes seeking to appropriate the space in question. This pre-existence of space conditions the subject's presence, action and discourse, his competence and performance; yet the subject's presence, action and discourse, at the same time as they presuppose this space, also negate it."[353]

Therefore, conservative cafes can be regarded as arenas that allow for the production of conservative identity while also being shaped by the actors who have this identity, yet considering the cafes in this study only as sites of constructing a conservative identity would be an inadequate interpretation. Drawing upon the statements of the interviewees, we can infer that these cafes have been arenas where people from different social and political backgrounds/ideologies get together and interact with each other.

Increasing visibility of the conservatives in the public sphere in urban centers of Turkey particularly after the 1990s has led to some forms of reconciliation with secularism and modernity, as well as forcing some boundaries. Kömeçoğlu states "the desire of Islamic actors to be involved in secular or worldly timeframe or in worldly practices reflects efforts to borrow and transform statements from other forms of publicity, and thus to communicate with different segments at different levels".[354]

The emergence of conservative cafes can be regarded as a quest of the religiously sensitive people to find an intermediate platform between secular and religious ways of living as also elaborated by Subaşı:

> "Religious individuals, who remain in between the requirements created by the culture of consumption and religious values and principles with which they are sensitive are seeking legitimacy codes to explain the situation they are in because they live inner contradictions. Religious people desire to be clearly identified, to exist with his/her own preferences, to transform his/her religious inclinations putting them into relation with the popular means of modern society. A typical reflection of this endeavor is undoubtedly observed in the attempt to overcome the classical community togetherness by the tendency of individualism in belief and action."[355]

Therefore it can be said that cafes have become places where Islamic actors get involved in urban life, integrate into the consumer society, "earn and spend as they believe" as one cafe owner puts it,[356] meet global trends, come into contact with those who are not like themselves and reconstruct their identity especially after the 2000s.

---

[353] Lefebvre, **ibid**, 57.
[354] Kömeçoğlu, 2003, **ibid**, 51.
[355] Necdet Subaşı, **Gündelik Hayat ve Dinsellik**, (İstanbul: İz Yayınları: 2004): 126.
[356] This has been stated by the owner of Çikolata & Kahve during the interview.

4.9. Conservative Cafes in comparison to Ottoman Coffeehouses

Ottoman coffeehouses can be regarded as the prototype of modern day cafes. Ottoman coffeehouses, as mentioned in Chapter 3, have varied according to their functionality and the customer profile. Those coffeehouses had functioned as an intermediate place between home and workplace and became an indispensable arena for socialization. However, they were male-dominated public places. Today's cafes are places where both men and women come, spend time and participate in various activities other than just eating and drinking. The cafes in this study are dissimilar to Ottoman coffeehouses in terms of the use of space by both genders. Both male and female subjects occupy cafes mentioned in this study as part of their everyday life experiences. Ottoman coffeehouses, as pointed out by Mikhail[357] served as an extension of the house, which made it possible for the Ottoman men to host their male guests in the coffeehouse. The cafes in this study serve similar facilities for their customers, especially for women, allowing them organize activities such as gold days, birthday parties and so on. Gold day is a typical at-home activity of especially housewives and today this activity goes beyond the boundaries of the house and has been realized at a public place. The owner of Mihrimah Kahve points out that "houses become smaller and cafes increase in number today. Meetings and honouring the guests, even gold days took place in such places, that's why these places (cafes) gain importance". Just as the economic conditions obliged Ottoman men to host their guests in the coffeehouses, the conditions of today - small houses or other reasons such as refraining from the bother of entertaining guests at home – lead people choose cafes as guest honoring sites.

Cafes mentioned in this study can be regarded as an extension of the house, but they may also act as arenas where work affairs such as job interviews or meetings are handled. Especially, Huqqa and Mihrimah Kahve provide such opportunities to their customers. There are multi-purpose VIP rooms in Huqqa, allocated for the special moments of the customers, may it be a job meeting, a birthday party, a baby shower party or a football match-watching event.[358] Likewise, the owner of Mihrimah Kahve

[357] Mikhail, **ibid**, 146.
[358] "Hakkımızda", https://huqqa.com/sayfalar/hakkimizda [07.06.2019].

states that the cafe is home to job interviews from time to time. Remembering Ottoman period artisan coffeehouses that became centers of meeting and communication among artisans and functioned like an employment agency, modern cafes may carry similar functions to those in the past in terms of being areas where work affairs are handled.

In the 19th century, as a result of modernization movements in the Ottoman Empire, intellectuals' coffeehouses came into being. Reading and cultural activities were mainly performed in these coffeehouses that offered books, magazines and newspapers for the customers. Intellectuals' coffeehouse, in other words *kıraathane*, had been center of all sorts of intellectual and cultural activities such as literary talks and art exhibitions.[359] Today, Nevmekân, arising as a book cafe, has the ideal of being the pioneer of the nation-wide intellectuals' cafes. Supported by the present government (the JDP), Nevmekân has actually been an arena where the aspirations of the JDP towards reviving Ottoman intellectuals' coffeehouses in a modern style are manifested.[360] Hilmi Türkmen, member of the JDP and the mayor of Üsküdar, states that students visit Nevmekân in order to study; they may even come with their teachers and have their lessons in the cafe since the cafe provides all sorts opportunities for them: the atmosphere, books and free Internet service.[361] Similar to Ottoman intellectuals' coffeehouses, Nevmekân has been a center of art and culture as stated by Hilmi Türkmen:

> "…This place has been a magnifical center of art and culture. How can a real art center be? It's like this place. Here, in addition to reading, one can eat and drink, filming can be done in studios, exhibitions are held in the gallery and interviews are held. A lot of art activities are realized. We also have a stage here; sometimes we give concerts…"[362]

Likewise, Mihrimah Kahve claims to promote reading through the books and magazines in the cafe despite not being as salient as Nevmekân to be counted as an intellectuals' cafe.

[359] Evren, **ibid,**196-198.
[360] "Kıraathanelere Bir Örnek: Nevmekân", http://www.gercekhayat.com.tr/roportaj/kiraathanelere-bir-ornek-nev-mekan/ [09.06.2019].
[361] **ibid.**
[362] **ibid.**

5. CONCLUSION

This thesis tried to shed some light on the consumption practices of conservative people in Turkey, particularly in İstanbul, by investigating four cafes: Çikolata & Kahve, Nevmekân, Mihrimah Kahve and Huqqa. The findings of the study were presented in Chapter 4 and this chapter gives an overview of the thesis along with a final discussion.

In this thesis, I primarily tried to find answers to the question of what makes a conservative cafe in the context of Turkey. In order to find answers to this question, I observed the aforementioned cafes located in İstanbul. Personal observations and the statements of the cafe owners and managers provided the data to understand what elements contribute to making these cafes a "conservative" place. As a result of this, some prominent features of conservative cafes were identified. Besides, the factors that make these cafes a reason for preference for the conservatives were analyzed based on the statements of cafe owners and managers. Finally, the position of these cafes that are considered to be sites of the reproduction of conservative identity was questioned in Turkey context.

Lefebvre states that social spaces can be used as a medium to analyze a society.[363] Therefore in this thesis, I aimed to investigate conservative production and consumption relations and the sociability that take place in the cafes. According to Sevinç, cafes, like all modern gathering spaces, develop a language and discourse and they become arenas where identities and belongingness are represented through certain techniques and policies.[364] In the case of current conservative cafes, the sense of belonging is created with an emphasis on cultural and religious values and preserving them while not totally rejecting modern elements. The emphasis on authenticity is provided not only through materials that refer to the Ottoman and Islamic roots, but also through manners that bear the traces of a traditional way of living. The statements of the cafe owners/managers that they foreground "values",

[363] Lefebvre, **ibid**, 34.
[364] Sevinç, **ibid**, 1014.

"traditions", "social service" and try to provide a "homelike" and "family like" atmosphere to their "guests" can be considered as the features that distinguish these cafes among others, especially from global coffee chains that represent a modern lifestyle. Actually considering the cafes in this study as merely having a conservative identity misleads us; so it has to be approached cautiously. Even though they position themselves on a traditional and local ground, modern and global forms influence them, as expressed by the cafe owners/managers during the interviews. For instance, the owners of Çikolata & Kahve were inspired by a British/American movie "Chocolat"[365] before they decided to open the cafe as narrated by the cafe owner. Also, while talking about the decoration and background music, the owner of Çikolata & Kahve mentions that they are influenced by Eastern and Western forms and calls the place as a "synthesis of the East and the West". Likewise, Mihrimah Kahve includes the books of not only Turkish Islamist/conservative intellectuals but also the books of the writers from the West. The manager of Nevmekân remarks that they try to include food and beverages from world cuisine and play music that address to everyone. Also, he states that it is not right to approach the conservatives with stereotypes:

> "We have conservative customers but they do not always want Sufi music to be played. They have also different preferences. We should not look at the issue that way. They may also have different requests... Sometimes they ask for a coffee as the ones they drink in Starbucks..."

Huqqa, likewise, aspires to include not only Eastern but also Western elements and be a meeting ground for the opposite poles in Turkey. We can infer from here that the conservative consumers' preference is not only for the local and the traditional but also for the global and modern one. Accordingly, the cafe owners/managers set their sights on "synthesizing the East and the West" and "preserving traditional and religious values while adapting to modernity".

The way the Islamic circles coped with modernism was to live modernism within the framework of Islamic rules. The habitus of the conservative urbanites in the last decades has been shaped as a result of their interactions with global, modern and secular forms; yet trying to hold on to religious and traditional values has become a strategy for them in order not to lose their "identity". That's why; they create their own living quarters, places of entertainment and leisure. Although

[365] "Chocolat" is a 2000 British/American drama-romance film about a woman and her daughter opening a chocolate shop in a conservative French village.
"Chocolat", https://www.imdb.com/title/tt0241303/ [05.06.2019].

Muslim people prefer cafes that have a conservative style, they inevitably interact with what is modern and secular. The interaction of Islamic subjects between tradition and modernity results in the formation of "hybrid identities" as put forward by Göle.[366]

Consequently, cafes as public places in which different segments of the society coexist are meaningful tools to analyse social relations and identities and analysis on cafes in Turkey that are mainly preferred by conservatives has important implications to understand their consumption practices and new identities arising out of their relationships with "the others" in these public places.

[366] Göle, 2017, **ibid**, 106.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Abd-al-Kadir, Sheik Ansari Djezeri Hanball. **In Praise of Coffee**. 1587.

Akarçay, Erhan. "Türkiye'de İslam Ahlakı ve Kapitalizmin Ruhu (Olabilir Mi?)". **VI. Ulusal Sosyoloji Kongresi Bildiri Kitabı,** October 2009. Aydın: Adnan Menderes Üniversitesi, 2009: 180-199.

Aksel, Selin. "Huqqa Alkolsüz Gece Kulübü mü?". https://www.sabah.com.tr/aktuel/2013/09/27/huqqa-alkolsuz-gece-kulubu-mu [06.04.2019].

Aktaşlı, Hasan Ufuk. "Türk Muhafazakârlığı ve Kemalizm: Diyalektik Bir İlişki". **Doğu-Batı**. no. 58 (2011): 147-162.

Avcı, Özlem. **İstanbul'da Dindar Üniversite Gençliği: İki Dünya Arasında**. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2012.

Aydın, Sümeyye. "Dini Kültür ve Tüketim: Modern ve Postmodern Düşünce Bağlamında Dini Kültür-Tüketim İlişkisinin Bir Kritiği". **VII. Ulusal Sosyoloji Kongresi Bildiri Kitabı II, 02-05 October 2013.** Muğla: Muğla Sıtkı Koçman Üniversitesi, 2013: 25-32.

Aygül, Hasan Hüseyin, Özgür Öztürk. "Dini Çoğulculuk ve Kamusal Alanda Dindar Tüketim Kültürü". **Hacettepe Üniversitesi İletişim Fakültesi Kültürel Çalışmalar Dergisi**. vol. 3. no.1 (2016): 190-206.

Baştürk, Onur. "Şampanyalı Lucca'dan Nargileli Huqqa'ya" http://www.hurriyet.com.tr/sampanyali-lucca-dan-nargileli-huqqa-ya-23194222 [06.04.2019].

Belge, Murat. "Muhafazakârlık Üzerine". **Modern Türkiye'de Siyasi Düşünce: Muhafazakârlık**. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2003: 92-104.

Bilgin, Çağrı. "Alkole Gerek Yok Ortam Sarhoş Ediyor". https://www.posta.com.tr/alkole-gerek-yok-ortam-sarhos-ediyor-189658 [06.04.2019].

Bilici, Mücahit. "İslam'ın Bronzlaşan Yüzü: Caprice Hotel Örnek Olayı". **İslamın Yeni Kamusal Yüzleri**. ed. Nilüfer Göle. İstanbul: Metis Yayınları (2013): 216-236.

Bora, Tanıl. "Muhafazakârlığın Değişimi ve Türk Muhafazakârlığında Bazı Yol İzleri". **Toplum ve Bilim**. no. 74 (1997): 6-30.

Borrella, Inma, Carlos Mataix, Ruth Carrasco-Gallego. "Smallholder Farmers in the Speciality Coffee Industry: Opportunities, Constraints and the Businesses that are Making it Possible". **IDS Bulletin**. vol. 46, no. 3 (2015): 29-44.

Bourdieu, Pierre. **The Logic of Practice**. trans. Richard Nice. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1990.

Broadway, Michael, Robert Legg, John Broadway. "Coffeehouses and the Art of Social Engagement: An Analysis of Portland Coffeehouses". **Geographical Review**. vol. 108. no. 3 (2018):433-456.

Cinmen, Işın. "Muhafazakâr Burjuvazinin Reina'sı". https://www.haberturk.com/gundem/haber/863812-muhafazakâr-burjuvazinin-reinasi# [06.04.2019].

Clark, Taylor. **Starbucked: A Double Tall Tale of Caffeine, Commerce and Culture**. NewYork: Little, Brown and Company, 2007.

Çağlayan, Savaş. "Anadolu'nun İlk Kamusal Mekânı: Kahvehane". **Muğla Sıtkı Kocaman Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi.** no. 29 (2012): 95-110.

Çaksu, Ali. "Janissary Coffeehouses in Late Eighteenth-Century İstanbul". **Ottoman Tulips, Ottoman Coffee: Leisure and Lifestyle in the Eighteenth Century.** ed. Dana Sajdi. London: I.B. Tauris, 2007: 117-132.

Çelebi, Evliya. **Narrative of Travels in Europe, Asia, and Africa in the Seventeenth Century.** trans. Ritter Joseph von Hammer. New York: Johnson Reprint Corp, 1896.

Çetin, Halis. "Muhafazakârlık: Kaosa Karşı Kozmos"**. Muhafazakâr Düşünce Dergisi**. no.1 (2004): 95-119.

Çiğdem, Ahmet. "Muhafazakârlık Üzerine". **Toplum ve Bilim**. no.74 (1997): 32-50.

Çikolata Kahve [@cikolatakahveistanbul]. "Cuma Mübarek". **Instagram photo**, February 24, 2017. https://www.instagram.com/p/BQ41m1sBasl/.

Çikolata Kahve [@cikolatakahveistanbul]. "Çikolata & Kahve'de her ramazan olduğu gibi bu Ramazanı şerifte de iftar öncesi içecek servisimiz olmayacaktır". **Instagram photo**. May 25, 2017. https://www.instagram.com/p/BUglmudBnze/.

Çikolata Kahve [@cikolatakahveistanbul]. "Hayırlı Cuma". **Instagram photo**, April 28, 2017. https://www.instagram.com/p/BTbJ2NmBHU6/.

Çikolata Kahve [@cikolatakahveistanbul]. "Hayırlı Cumalar". **Instagram video**, May 4, 2018. https://www.instagram.com/p/BiWgU3nhJLb/.

Çikolata Kahve [@cikolatakahveistanbul]. "Kudüs Müminlerin Haremidir". **Instagram video**, May 18, 2018. https://www.instagram.com/p/Bi7bG2eHxre/.

Çikolata Kahve [@cikolatakahveistanbul]. Accessed June 15, 2019. https://www.instagram.com/cikolatakahveistanbul/.

Dağı, İhsan D. "Rethinking Human Rights, Democracy and the West: Post-Islamist Intellectuals in Turkey". **Critique: Critical Middle Eastern Studies**. vol.13. no.2 (2004):135-151.

D'Ohsson, Mouradgea. **Tableau Général de l'Empire Ottoman**. vol.4. Paris, 1824.

Doğan, Tuba. "Production of Third Places for the Conservative Women: A Case Study of Çengelköy". Master Thesis. İstanbul Şehir University, 2018.

Duman, Fatih. "Edmund Burke- Muahafazakarlık, Aydınlanma ve Siyaset". **Muhafazakâr Düşünce Dergisi**. no.1 (2004): 31-53.

Emeksiz, Abdülkadir. "İstanbul Kahvehaneleri." **Karaların ve Denizlerin Sultanı.** ed. Filiz Özdem. İstanbul: Yapı Kredi Yayınları (2009): 123-141.

Erler, Özgür. "Yeni Muhafazakârlık, AKP ve "Muhafazakâr Demokrat" Kimliği". **Stratejik Araştırmalar Dergisi**. vol.10 (2007): 126-132.

Ergil, Doğu. "Muhafazakâr Düşüncenin Temelleri". **Ankara Üniversitesi SBF Dergisi.** no. 41 (2015): 270-292.

Evren, Burçak. **Eski İstanbul'da Kahvehaneler**. AD Yayıncılık A.Ş., 1996.

Foucault, Michel. "Of Other Spaces: Utopias and Heterotopias". **Architecture/Mouvement/Continuité.** trans. Jay Miskowiec. October 1984: 1-9. http://web.mit.edu/allanmc/www/foucault1.pdf [03.03.2019].

Featherstone, Mike. **Consumer Culture and Postmodernism**. London: Sage Publication, 1991.

Fischer, Edward F. "Quality and Inequality: Taste, Value, and Power in the Third Wave Coffee Market". **MPIfG Discussion Paper**. No. 17/4 (2017).

Genel, Sema, Kerem Karaosmanoğlu. "A New Islamic Individualism in Turkey: Headscarved Women in the City". **Turkish Studies**. vol. 7. no. 3 (September 2006): 473-488.

Georgeon, François. "Osmanlı İmparatorluğu'nun Son Döneminde İstanbul Kahvehaneleri". **Doğu'da Kahve ve Kahvehaneler.** ed. Hélène Desmet Grégoire, François Georgeon. trans. Meltem Atik, Esra Özdoğan. İstanbul: Yapı Kredi Yayınları, 1999.

Gilmore, James H., Joseph Pine. **Deneyim Ekonomisi**. trans. Levent Cinemre. İstanbul: Optimist, 2011.

Göçmen, İpek. "Muhafazakârlık, Neoliberalizm ve Sosyal Politika: Türkiye'de Din Temelli Sosyal Yardım Organizasyonları". **Doğu-Batı**. no.58 (2011): 115-143.

Göle, Nilüfer. **Melez Desenler: İslam ve Modernlik Üzerine**. 5th ed. İstanbul: Metis Yayınları, 2017.

_____. "Modernist Kamusal Alan ve İslami Ahlak". **İslamın Yeni Kamusal Yüzleri**. ed. Nilüfer Göle. İstanbul: Metis Yayınları (2013): 19-40.

_____. "Secularism and Islamism in Turkey: The Making of Elites and Counter-elites". **Middle East Journal**. vol. 51. no.1 (1997): 46-58. http://www.jstor.org/stable/4329022 [23.04.2019].

Gürsoy, Deniz. **Sohbetin Bahanesi Kahve.** İstanbul: Oğlak Yayıncılık ve Reklamcılık Ltd. Şti., 2005.

Habermas, Jürgen. **The Structural Transformation of the Public Sphere: An Inquiry into a Category of Bourgeois Society**. trans. Thomas Burger with the asssistance of Frederic Lawrance. Massachuttes: The MIT Press, 1989.

Hattox, Ralph S. **Coffee and Coffeehouses: The Origins of a Social Beverage in the Medieval Near East**. 3rd ed. Seattle: University of Washington Press, 1996.

Heise, Ulla. **Kahve ve Kahvehane**. trans. Mustafa Tüzel. İstanbul: Dost Kitabevi, 2001.

Huqqa [@huqqa]. "Sahurda da adres". **Instagram video**, May 22, 2019. https://www.instagram.com/p/BxvZgCHl5TV/

Huqqa [@huqqa]. Accessed June 24, 2019. https://www.instagram.com/huqqa/.

Huqqa [@huqqa]. "Her gününüzün bayram tadında geçmesi dileğiyle…Herkese mutluluk dolu bir bayram dileriz", **Instagram video**, June 3, 2019. https://www.instagram.com/p/ByQWsT0BP5h/.

Huqqa [@huqqa]. "Sadece damaklarınızın değil, aynı zamanda gözlerinizin de mest olacağı bir iftar için Huqqa'ya bekliyoruz". **Instagram photo**. May 28, 2019. https://www.instagram.com/p/ByAOsPxHT2i/.

İrem, Nazım. "Bir Değişim Siyaseti Olarak Türkiye'de Cumhuriyetçi Muhafazakârlık". **Modern Türkiye'de Siyasi Düşünce: Muhafazakârlık.** İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2003: 105-117.

Işın, Ekrem. "Bir İçecekten Daha Fazla: Kahve ve Kahvehanelerin Toplumsal Tarihi". **Tanede Saklı Keyif, Kahve**. ed. Selahattin Özpalabıyıklılar. İstanbul: Yapı Kredi Yayınları, 2001: 10-43.

_____. **Everyday Life in İstanbul.** trans. Virginia Taylor Saçlıoğlu. 4th ed. İstanbul: Yapı Kredi Publications, 2018.

Ismail, Salwa. "Being Muslim: Islam, Islamism and Identity Politics". **Government and Opposition.** vol. 39. no.4 (September 2004): 614 – 631.

_____. **Rethinking Islamist Politics: Culture, the State and Islamism**. New York: I.B. Tauris & Co (2003).

Kalnins, Arthurs, Laure Stroock. "Pouring Israel into a Starbucks Cup". **Cornell Hospitality Quarterly**. vol. 52. no. 2 (2011): 135-143.

Kantarcı, Önder. "İslami Kadın Modernliğinin Tüketim Toplumunda Temsili: Ala Dergisi Üzerine Bir İnceleme". Master Thesis. Marmara University Institute of Social Sciences, 2015.

Kaptan, Yeşim. "Üçü Bir Arada: Melez Bir Mekanın Kuruluşu ve Starbucks Üzerine Gözlemler". **Kültür ve İletişim.** vol.16. no.2 (2013): 73-96.

Karadeniz, Sıtkı. "Kemalist Modernleşme Sürecinde Türk Muhafazakârlığı ve Günümüze Yansımalar". **Tezkire**. no. 27-28 (2002): 88-100.

Keyman, Fuat. "On the relation between Global Modernity and Nationalism: The Crisis of Hegemony and the Rise of (Islamic) Identity in Turkey". **New Perspectives on Turkey**. no. 13 (1995): 93-120.

Kılıçbay, Barış, Mutlu Binark. "Consumer Culture, Islam and the Politics of Lifestyle: Fashion for Veiling in Contemporary Turkey". **European Journal of Communication.** vol. 17. no. 4 (December 2002): 495–511.

Kırlı, Cengiz. "Coffeehouses: Leisure and Sociability in Ottoman İstanbul". **Leisure Cultures in Urban Europe, 1700-1870**. ed. Peter Nigel Borsay, Jan Hein Furnee. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2016: 161-181.

_____. "İstanbul Bir Büyük Kahvehane". **İstanbul Dergisi.** no.47 (2003): 75-78.

_____. "Kahvehaneler ve Hafiyeler: 19. Yüzyıl Ortalarında Osmanlı'da Sosyal Kontrol". **Toplum ve Bilim.** no.83 (2000): 58-79.

Korkman, Zeynep K. "Fortunes for Sale: Cultural Politics and Commodification of Culture in Millennial Turkey." **European Journal of Cultural Studies.** vol. 18. no. 3 (June 2015): 319–38. doi:10.1177/1367549414526727.

Kömeçoğlu, Uğur. "Homo Ludens ve Homo Sapiens Arasında Kamusallık ve Toplumsallık: Osmanlı Kahvehaneleri". **Osmanlı Kahvehaneleri: Mekan, Sosyalleşme, İktidar.** ed. Ahmet Yaşar. İstanbul: Kitap Yayınevi, 2009: 45-80.

_____. "Örtünme Pratiği ve Toplumsal Cinsiyete İlişkin Mekânsal Bir Etnografi". **Doğu Batı**. vol. 23 (2003): 37-74.

Kurtar Anlı, Ceyda, Nuri Yavan. "Deneyim Yaratmada Mekanın Rolü: Starbucks ve Kahve Dünyası'nın Deneyim Ekonomisi ve Üçüncü Yer Bakımından Analizi". **Gaziantep University Journal of Social Sciences**. vol.18. no.1 (2019): 100-132.

Kurtuldu, Günay. " "Starbucks" İş Modeli ve Globalleşme Sürecine Kıyasla Bir İş Modeli Olarak "Kahve Dünyası"nın Gelişimi ve Globalleşmesi". **Kırklareli Üniversitesi İktidari ve İdari Bilimler Fakültesi Dergisi**. vol.5. no.2 (2016): 33-55.

Küçükcan, Talip. “State, Islam and Religious Liberty in Modern Turkey: Reconfiguration of Religion in the Public Sphere”. (September 19, 2003). https://ssrn.com/abstract=2498563 [27.04.2019].

Kuzucu, Kemalettin. “Kahvehaneden Kıraathaneye Geçiş ve İlk Kıraathaneler”. **Türk Kahvesi Kitabı.** ed. Emine Gürsoy Naskalı. İstanbul: Kitabevi Yayınları, 2011: 161-208

Lefebvre, Henri. **The Production of Space**, trans. Donald Nicholson-Smith. Oxford, OX, UK: Blackwell, 1991.

Mannheim, Karl. **Essays on Sociology and Social Psychology.** London: Routledge and Kegan Paul Nietzsche, 1969.

Manzo, John. “Machines, People, and Social Interaction in “Third Wave” Coffeehouses”. **Journal of Arts and Humanities**. vol.3. no.8 (2014): 1-12.

Mendillioğlu, Ali. “Muhafazakâr Kadının Sosyalleşme Mekânı: At Pazarı”. (December 26, 2011). http://www.adilmedya.com/muhafazakâr-kadinin-sosyallesme-mekaniat-pazari [18.05.2019].

Meşe, İlknur. “İslami Bir Moda Dergisi Örneğinde Moda ve Tesettür: Ne Türden Bir Birliktelik?”. **Fe Dergi**. vol.7. no.1 (2015): 146-158.

_____. “Tüketim, Din ve Kadın Bağlamında İslami Moda Dergileri”. **Eskişehir Osmangazi Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi**. vol.17. no.1 (June, 2016): 95-110.

MİHRİMAH Kahve [@mihrimah.kahve]. “Bizden detaylar…Mihrimah’ın eşsiz atmosferinde, eski İstanbul’un yansımalarını bulacaksınız dostlar”. **Instagram photo,** April 9, 2019. https://www.instagram.com/p/BwB4LR4B8eR/.

MİHRİMAH Kahve [@mihrimah.kahve]. “Gönül ne kahve ister, ne kahvehane, gönül muhabbet ister kahve bahane”. **Instagram photo**, May 28, 2019. https://www.instagram.com/p/ByAjaC1hqOK/.

MİHRİMAH Kahve [@mihrimah.kahve]. “Her bir sanat eseri insanını kendi ufku ve dünyası içinde dağıtır ve yetiştirir. Mihrimah Kahve’nin dört bir yanında geleneksel eserlerimizi sergiliyoruz”. **Instagram photo**, November 15, 2018. https://www.instagram.com/p/BqM6U49hGXT/.

MİHRİMAH Kahve [@mihrimah.kahve]. “Mihrimah Kahve’de her Pazartesi 19.00-22.00 arası ney dinletisine bekleriz efendim”. **Instagram video**. April 17, 2017. https://www.instagram.com/p/BS_g26uDdi8/.

MİHRİMAH Kahve [@mihrimah.kahve]. “Mihrimah Kahve’nin bol köpüklü, lezzetli kahveleri muhabbet ile pişer, yanına güzel bir kitapla harika gider...”. **Instagram photo**, February 7, 2019. https://www.instagram.com/p/Btk8t4nhAyO/.

MİHRİMAH Kahve [@mihrimah.kahve]. “Osmanlı’da şerbet her evde her zaman ansızın gelen misafire sunulması gereken en önemli ikram idi”. **Instagram photo**, August 13, 2018. https://www.instagram.com/p/Bmar6jPg_sS/.

MİHRİMAH Kahve [@mihrimah.kahve]. “Söz uçar, muhabbet kalır”. Instagram **photo,** May 20, 2019. https://www.instagram.com/p/BxsPmfrF5KB/.

MİHRİMAH Kahve [@mihrimah.kahve]. Accessed June 24, 2019. https://www.instagram.com/mihrimah.kahve/.

Mikhail, Alan. “The Heart’s Desire: Gender, Urban Space and the Ottoman Coffeehouse”. **Ottoman Tulips, Ottoman Coffee: Leisure and Lifestyle in the Eighteenth Century.** ed. Dana Sajdi. London: I.B. Tauris, 2007: 133-170.

Mozaffari, Mehdi. “What is Islamism? History and Definition of a Concept”. **Totalitarian Movements and Political Religions**. vol. 8. no. 1 (March 2007):17-33.

Muller, Jerry Z. **Conservatism: An Anthology of Social and Political Thought from David Hume to the Present.** Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1997.

Navaro-Yashin, Yael. “The Market for Identities: Secularism, Islamism, Commodities”. **Fragments of Culture: The Everyday of Modern Turkey, ed. Deniz Kandiyoti, Ayşe Saktanber**. New York: I.B. Tauris & Co, 2002: 221-253.

Navarro, Zander. “In Search of a Cultural Interpretation of Power: The Contribution of Pierre Bourdieu.” **IDS Bulletin.** vol. 37. no.6 (2006): 11-22

Nevmekân [@nev_mekan]. “Anatolian Quartet bu Cumartesi akşamı Nevmekân’da”. **Instagram photo,** April 6, 2016. https://www.instagram.com/p/BD2lKNMxeC6/.

Nevmekân [@nev_mekan]. “Cumartesi akşamı Sedat Anar Nevmekân’da”. **Instagram photo**, April 15, 2016. https://www.instagram.com/p/BEN5_zeReF8/.

Nevmekân [@nev_mekan]. “Japon Kültür Haftası kapsamında Origami ve Sumi-E sergimiz 7 Mayıs'a kadar devam edecektir”. **Instagram photo**, May 1, 2016. https://www.instagram.com/p/BE3AE5oxeKy/.

Nevmekân [@nev_mekan]. “Prof. Dr. İskender Pala ile taze kitap kokusu”. **Instagram**. February 4, 2019. Accessed June 15, 2019. https://www.instagram.com/p/Btdmb3_hpJ9/.

Nevmekân [@nev_mekan]. Accessed June 24, 2019. https://www.instagram.com/nev_mekan/.

Nisbet, Robert. **Conservatism Dream and Reality**. New York: Routledge, 2017.

Oldenburg, Ray. **The great good place: cafés, coffee shops, bookstores, bars, hair salons, and other hangouts at the heart of a community**. Philadelphia: Da Capo Press, 1999.

Öğün, Süleyman Seyfi. “Türk Muhafazakârlığının Kültürel Politik Kökleri”. **Modern Türkiye’de Siyasi Düşünce: Muhafazakârlık.** İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2003: 539-589.

Özbolat, Abdullah. "Tüketim Bağlamında Dindarlığın Dönüşümü". **Birikim Dergisi**. (2014) http://www.birikimdergisi.com/guncel-yazilar/1127/tuketim-baglaminda-dindarligin-donusumu#.XN_zQmQzafQ.

Özeren, M. Murtaza. "Coffeehouses in Ottoman Society". https://www.dailysabah.com/history/2018/07/20/coffeehouses-in-ottoman-society [25.02.2019]

Özgen, Özlen, Zaliha İnci Karabacak. "Tüketim Mekanlarının Dönüşümünde Görsel İletişimin Rolü: Küresel Kahve Dükkanları". **İletişim Kuram ve Araştırma Dergisi**. vol.37 (Fall 2013): 120-149.

Özipek, Bekir Berat. **Akıl, Toplum, Siyaset**. 2nd ed. İstanbul: Kadim Yayınları, 2005.

_____. "Muhafazakârlık, Devrim ve Türkiye". **Modern Türkiye'de Siyasi Düşünce: Muhafazakârlık**. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2003: 66-84.

Peçevi, İbrahim. **Peçevi Tarihi.** comp. Bekir Sıtkı Baykal. vol. 2. Ankara: Kültür Bakanlığı Yayınları, 1981.

Roseberry, William. "The Rise of Yuppie Coffees and the Reimagination of Class in the United States"**. American Anthropologist.** vol. 98. no. 4 (1996): 762-775.

Sabancılar Eren, Sıla, Selahaddin Bakan. "2000'lerde Türkiye'de Burjuvazi Sınıfının Siyasal Dönüşümü". **Birey ve Toplum**. vol.7. no.13 (Spring 2017): 127-149.

Safa, Peyami. **Doğu-Batı Sentezi.** İstanbul: Yağmur Yayınları, 1963.

Sandıkçı, Özlem, Güliz Ger. "Constructing and Representing the Islamic Consumer in Turkey". **Fashion Theory The Journal of Dress Body & Culture**. vol. 11. no. 2-3 (June 2007): 189-210.

_____. "In-Between Modernities and Postmodernities: Investigating Turkish Consumptionscape". **Advances in Consumer Research**. vol. 29 (2002): 465-470.

Saraçgil, Ayşe. "Kahvenin İstanbul'a Girişi 16. ve 17. Yüzyıllar". **Doğu'da Kahve ve Kahvehaneler.** ed. Hélène Desmet Grégoire, François Georgeon. trans. Meltem Atik, Esra Özdoğan. İstanbul: Yapı Kredi Yayınları, 1999.

Schivelbusch, Wolfgang. **Tastes of Paradise: A Social History of Spices, Stimulants, and Intoxicants.** New York: Pantheon Books, 1992.

Sevinç, Bayram. "Simgesel Mekan Tüketimi ve Yeni Kamusal Alanlarda Toplumsallık: Fatih At Pazarı Örneği". **International Journal of Social Science Studies**. vol.6. no.4 (April 2013): 1003-1028.

Sezik, Murat. "Muhafazakâr Siyaset İdeolojisi ve Türkiye'de Muhafazakârlık". **I. Türkiye Lisansüstü Çalışmaları Kongresi**. June 29- July 1, 2012. Konya: Selçuk Üniversitesi, 2012: 113-125.

Sökmen, Cem. **Aydınların İletişim Ortamı Olarak Eski İstanbul Kahvehaneleri.** 3rd ed. İstanbul: Ötüken Neşriyat A.Ş., 2016.

Subaşı, Necdet. **Gündelik Hayat ve Dinsellik**. İstanbul: İz Yayınları, 2004.

Schultz, Howard, Dori Jones Yang. **Starbucks: Gönlünü İşe Vermek**. trans. Ömer Faruk Birpınar. İstanbul: Babıali Kültür Yayıncılığı, 2007.

Tanyılmaz, Kurtar. "Türkiye Burjuvazisinde Derin Çatlak: Burjuvazinin İç Çatışmasının Sınıfsal Temelleri". **Devrimci Marksizm**. vol.12 (2011): 66-95.

Tarcan, Pınar. "Seansı 1000 TL'ye Falcıya Giden Var". http://www.gazetevatan.com/seansi-1000-tl-ye-falciya-giden-var-736190-pazar-vatan/ [16.05.2019].

Thompson, Craig J., Zeynep Arsel. "The Starbucks Brandscape and Consumers' (Anticorporate) Experiences of Glocalization". **Journal of Consumer Research**. vol. 31. no. 3 (December 2004): 631-642.

Toros, Taha. **Kahvenin Öyküsü.** İstanbul: İletişim Yayıncılık, 1998.

Türk, Eylem. "'İçkisiz' Zincir Geliyor". http://www.milliyet.com.tr/-ickisiz-zincir-geliyor/ekonomi/detay/1714177/default.htm [06.04.2019].

Uzunçarşılı, İsmail Hakkı. **Osmanlı Devletinin Saray Teşkilatı,** 2nd ed. Ankara: Türk Tarih Kurumu Yayınları, 1984.

Vergin, Nur. **Din, Toplum ve Siyasal Sistem.** İstanbul: Bağlam Yayınları, 2000.

Weiss, John. **Conservatism in Europe 1770-1945**. London: Thomas & Hudson, 1977.

Welsh, Jennifer M. **Edmund Burke and International Relations – The commonwealth of Europe and the Crusade against the French Revolution**. New York: St Martin Press, 1995.

Yaman, Talat Mümtaz. "Türkiye'de Kahve ve Kahvehaneler". **Karacadağ**. no: 53 (1942): 667-744. https://core.ac.uk/download/pdf/80960467.pdf [24.02.2019].

Yavuz, M. Hakan. "Political Islam and the Welfare Party". **Comparative Politics.** vol. 30. no. 1 (1997): 63-82.

Yıldız, Cemil. Kaya, Gültekin. Önür, M. Kurtbay. "Fallı Soyguna Dikkat", https://www.turkiyegazetesi.com.tr/Genel/a328483.aspx, [16.05.2019].

Yılmaz, Murat. ““Muhafazakâr Demokrat” Bir Politikanın Temel Özellikleri Neler Olabilir?”. **Muhafazakâr Düşünce Dergisi.** no.1 (2004): 143-148.

““At’nağme-Atlar ve Hatlar” Sergisi Üsküdar Nevmekânda Ziyarete Açıldı”. https://www.uskudar.bel.tr/tr/main/news/atnagme-atlar-ve-hatlar-sergisi-uskudar-nevme/439 [29.05.2019].

“Chocolat”. https://www.imdb.com/title/tt0241303/ [05.06.2019].

“Tarihçe”. http://www.starbucks.com.tr/about-us/our-heritage/ [06.06.2019].

“Coffee”. https://www.britannica.com/topic/coffee. [10.01.2019].

“Company Information”. https://www.starbucks.com/about-us/company-information [07.06.2019].

“Dr. Esra Albayrak’ın Katılımlarıyla “28 Şubatta Aslında Ne Oldu?” Semineri Nevmekân Bağlarbaşında Gerçekleştirildi”. http://www.uskudar.bel.tr/tr/main/foto/dr-esra-albayrakin-katilimlariyla-28-subatta/1314 [29.05.2019].

“Eski Otobüs Garajı Şimdi Sanatın Mekanı”. https://www.sabah.com.tr/pazar/2017/11/26/eski-otobus-garaji-simdi-sanatin-mekani [29.05.2019].

“Fatwa”. https://www.britannica.com/topic/fatwa. [12.02.2019].

“Franchising Hakkında”. http://bestcoffeeshop.com.tr/franchising-hakkinda [07.06.2019].

“Hakkımızda”. https://huqqa.com/sayfalar/hakkimizda [07.06.2019].

“Hakkımızda”. http://www.lavazzakahve.com/hakkimizda.htm [07.06.2019].

“Hakkımızda”. https://www.kahvedunyasi.com/kesfet/hakkimizda [07.06.2019].

“Hikayemiz”. https://www.gloriajeans.com.tr/ [07.06.2019].

“Hilya Sharif”. http://seerah.learnislam.org.uk/hilya-sharif/ [10.06.2019].

“Hookah”. https://www.dictionary.com/browse/hookah [20.05.2019].

“Janissary”. https://www.britannica.com/topic/Janissary-corps. [25.02.2019].

“Kafelerde Fal Çılgınlığı”. http://www.hurriyet.com.tr/kelebek/kafelerde-fal-cilginligi-336240 [16.05.2019].

“Kendisi de Bilmez ama İçkisiz Huqqa Fikri Murat Ülker’den”. https://www.aksam.com.tr/ekonomi/kendisi-de-bilmez-ama-ickisiz-huqqa-fikri-murat-ulkerden/haber-209620 [06.04.2019].

“Muhafazakâr Kesimin Sosyalleştikleri Mekanlar”, http://www.yasemin.com/yasam/haber/2686684-muhafazakâr-kesimin-sosyallestikleri-mekanlar [25.05.2019].

"Nevmekân Başbakan Ahmet Davutoğlu'nu Ağırladı". https://www.uskudar.bel.tr/tr/main/news/Nevmekân-basbakan-ahmet-davutoglunu-agirladi/418 [29.05.2019].

"Payitaht Abdülhamid". https://www.imdb.com/title/tt6536562/ [16.06.2019].

"Şubelerimiz". http://bestcoffeeshop.com.tr/subelerimiz [07.06.2019].

"Tekke Ve Zaviyelerle Türbelerin Seddine Ve Türbedarliklar İle Bir Takim Unvanlarin Men Ve İlgasina Dair Kanun". Law No. 677. Resmi Gazete, 243, December, 1925.

"Üsküdarlıların 'Nev'mekanı' Açıldı". https://www.uskudar.bel.tr/tr/main/news/uskudarlilarin-Nevmekâni-acildi/415 [29.05.2019].

APPENDIX

Appendix 1

Çikolata & Kahve Interview Questions

Start

1. How did the idea of starting this cafe come forward? Who started the cafe?
2. When was it started?
3. Why did you name the cafe as Çikolata & Kahve?
4. Why was Çengelköy chosen as the location?

Features of the Cafe

5. What are the things that contribute to the atmosphere of this cafe?
    a. How do you decide on the music to be played in the cafe?
    b. How did you decorate the cafe? What was important in its decoration?
    c. Are there any private spaces in the cafe except for those commonly used by the customers? If so, what are their functions?
    d. Why is fortune telling through coffee forbidden in your cafe?
6. How did you determine the menu? What criteria did you follow?
7. How do you determine the pricing on the menu?
8. Do you change anything on the menu from time to time? If so, why?
9. What is the reason why you do not have a written menu?

Customer Profile

10. How would you define the customer profile in the cafe?
    a. Do you target a certain customer profile?
    b. What is the reason why conservative people prefer to visit this cafe?
    c. What are the consumption tendencies of conservative customers visiting your cafe? What do they pay attention to?
    d. Do conservatives have different preferences or wishes?
11. What kind of differences do you bear compared to chain coffeehouses like Starbucks?
12. What do you serve to your customers different than chain cafes?
13. How do you define your cafe when compared to cafes in a metropolitan like İstanbul?
    a. Does your cafe bear any difference to other cafes preferred by conservative customers?
14. What kind of feedback do your customers give regarding the cafe?

Social Media and Events

15. Do you allow your customers to hold events in the cafe?
16. What kind of an impact does social media have on the recognition of the cafe?

Appendix 2

Nevmekân Interview Questions

Start

1. How did the idea of starting this cafe come forward? Who started the cafe?
2. When was it started?
3. Why was Üsküdar chosen as the location?

Features of the Cafe

4. What are the things that contribute to the atmosphere of this cafe?
    a. How do you decide on the music to be played in the cafe?
    b. How did you decorate the cafe? What was important in its decoration?
    c. Are there any private spaces in the cafe except for those commonly used by the customers? If so, what is the function of these private spaces?
    d. How did you determine the menu? What criteria did you follow?
5. How do you determine the pricing on the menu?
6. Do you change anything on the menu from time to time?
    a. If so, why?

Customer Profile

7. How would you define the customer profile in the cafe?
    a. Do you target a certain customer profile?
8. What is the reason why conservative people prefer to visit this cafe?
    a. What are the consumption tendencies of conservative customers visiting your cafe? What do they pay attention to?
    b. Do conservatives have different preferences or wishes?
9. What kind of differences do you bear compared to chain coffeehouses like Starbucks?
    a. What do you serve to your customers different than such cafes?
10. How do you define your cafe when compared to cafes in a metropolitan like Istanbul?
    a. Does your cafe bear any difference to other cafes preferred by conservative customers?
11. What kind of feedback do your customers give regarding the cafe?
12. You define Nevmekân as “wisdom project”. Can you elaborate on that?

Social Media and Events

13. Do you allow your customers to hold events in your cafe?
    a. If yes, what are the criteria that you have?
14. What kind of an impact does social media have on the recognition of the cafe?

Appendix 3

Mihrimah Kahve Interview Questions

Start

1. How did the idea of starting this cafe come forward? Who started the cafe?
2. When was it started?
3. Why was Üsküdar chosen as the location?

Features of the Cafe

4. What are the things that contribute to the atmosphere of this cafe?
    a. How do you decide on the music to be played in the cafe?
    b. How did you decorate the cafe? What was important in its decoration?
    c. Are there any private spaces in the cafe except for those commonly used by the customers? If so, what is the function of these private spaces?
    d. Is fortune telling through coffee forbidden in your cafe?
5. How did you determine the menu? What criteria did you follow?
6. How do you determine the pricing on the menu?
7. Do you change anything on the menu from time to time?
    a. If so, why?

Customer Profile

8. How would you define the customer profile in the cafe?
    a. Do you target a certain customer profile?
9. What is the reason why conservative people prefer to visit this cafe?
    a. What are the consumption tendencies of conservative customers visiting your cafe? What do they pay attention to?
    b. Do conservatives have different preferences or wishes?
10. What kind of differences do you bear compared to chain coffeehouses like Starbucks?
    a. What do you serve to your customers different than such cafes?
11. How do you define your cafe when compared to cafes in a metropolitan like İstanbul?
    a. Does your cafe bear any difference to other cafes preferred by conservative customers?
12. What kind of feedback do your customers give regarding the cafe?

Social Media and Events

13. Do you allow your customers to hold events in your cafe?
    a. If yes, what are the criteria that you have?
14. What kind of an impact does social media have on the recognition of the cafe?

Appendix 4

Huqqa Interview Questions

Start

1. How did the idea of starting this cafe come forward? How did Huqqa come into being?
2. Why was Kuruçeşme chosen as the location?

Features of the Cafe

3. What are the things that contribute to the atmosphere of this cafe?
    a. How do you decide on the music to be played in the cafe?
    b. How did you decorate the cafe? What was important in its decoration?
    c. Are there any private spaces in the cafe except for those commonly used by the customers? If so, what is the function of these private spaces?
    d. What is the significance of hookah for this cafe? Why is hookah in the foreground in the menu?
4. How did you determine the menu? What criteria did you follow?
5. How do you determine the pricing on the menu?
6. Do you change anything on the menu from time to time? If so, why?
7. Why do you prefer to present the menu electronically?

Customer Profile

8. How would you define the customer profile in the cafe?
    a. Do you target a certain customer profile?
9. What is the reason why conservative people prefer to visit this cafe?
    a. What are the consumption tendencies of conservative customers visiting your cafe? What do they pay attention to?
    b. Do conservatives have different preferences or wishes?
10. What kind of differences do you bear compared to chain coffeehouses like Starbucks?
    a. What do you serve to your customers different than such cafes?
11. How do you define your cafe when compared to cafes in a metropolitan like Istanbul?
    a. Does your cafe bear any difference to other cafes preferred by conservative customers?
12. How do your customers give feedback regarding the cafe?

Social Media and Events

13. Do you allow your customers to hold events in your cafe?
    a. If yes, what are the criteria that you have?
14. What kinds of an impact does social media have on the recognition of the cafe?

CURRICULUM VITAE

Şule ÇANAK

Date of Birth: 01.01.1991

Place of Birth: Kadirli / Osmaniye

E-mail: sulecanak80@gmail.com

EDUCATION

2015- present : Yıldız Technical University, İstanbul
Faculty of Arts and Science
Master of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences
GPA: 3.79 /4.00

2008–2012: Boğaziçi University, İstanbul
Faculty of Education
Bachelor of Arts, Foreign Language Education Department
GPA: 3.33 / 4.00

EXPERIENCE

2018- present: Ziya Ünsel Secondary School, İstanbul
English Teacher

2014-2018: Önsen Secondary School, Kahramanmaraş
English Teacher

2012-2014: Fatih Sultan Mehmet Foundation University
English Lecturer

PAPERS PRESENTED

"Consuming Coffee: An Investigation on the Conservative Middle Class Cafes in İstanbul". ICMUSS 2019, International Congress on Multidisciplinary Social Sciences. Ankara, Turkey. May 7-10, 2019.